BIBLIOTHECA INDOLOGICA ET BUDDHOLOGICA 11

ABHIDHARMAKOŚABHĀṢYA
OF
VASUBANDHU

CHAPTER Ⅸ: ĀTMAVĀDAPRATIṢEDHA

edited by Jong Cheol LEE (李鍾徹)

with critical notes
by the late Prof. Yasunori EJIMA(江島惠教)

TOKYO : THE SANKIBO PRESS,2005

BIBLIOTHECA INDOLOGICA BUDDHOLOGICA
edited by SAITO Akira (editor in chief)

11

Published in August 2005 by the SANKIBO PRESS,Tokyo
©2005 The Academy of Korean Studies

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced by any means without prior written permission from the publisher.

Distributed by the SANKIBO PRESS

5-28-5 Hongo, Bunkyo-ku Tokyo 113-0033 Japan

ABHIDHARMAKOŚABHĀṢYA
OF
VASUBANDHU

CHAPTER Ⅸ: ĀTMAVĀDAPRATIṢEDHA

edited by Jong Cheol LEE (李鍾徹)

with critical notes
by the late Prof. Yasunori EJIMA(江島惠教)

August 2005, Tokyo

CONTENTS

FOREWORD	by Akira Saito	iii
PREFACE		v
ABBREVIATIONS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY		vii
INTRODUCTION		xiv
TRANSLITERATION OF THE SANSKRIT MANUSCRIPT		1
SANSKRIT TEXT AND TIBETAN TEXT		33

FOREWORD

It was in 1989 that Prof. Y. Ejima published a newly edited text of the first chapter known as "Dhātunirdeśa," or "Exposition on the Elements." His edition was based on the photographic reproduction of the same manuscript as identified and photographed by Rāhula Sāṃkṛtyāyana at Ngor Monastery in 1936. Prof. P. Pradhan was the first to publish the entire text of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*(AKBh), which appeared in 1967. Since that time, though not a few corrections had already been made by Prof. A. Hirakawa et al. in the Corrigenda to their monumental publication, *Index to the AKBh* (3 parts), published from 1973 to 1977, Ejima's above edition remains almost the only achievement to have considerably improved the textual situation regarding the AKBh. His meticulous work succeeded not only in making a number of corrections to Pradhan's edition but also in collecting and adding in footnotes quite a few parallel passages from other related Abhidharma literature.

Prior to the above edition, Ejima also published in 1987 an article entitled "Textcritical Remarks on the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*." As the title suggests, this article contains a number of both textual corrections to Pradhan's edition and relevant passages collected from other Abhidharma texts. Based on this article, Ejima planned and announced his intention to publish in the series *Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica* a newly edited text of this chapter. It was, however, most unfortunate that this edition of one of the most important chapters in the AKBh never saw the light of day because of Prof. Ejima's sudden death on 22 May 1999. Thereafter, no other serious attempt has been made in this regard for several years. Meanwhile, in 2003 I first heard from Dr. Lee Jong Cheol, one of Ejima's able students, that in memory of his *guru* at the University of Tokyo he intended to publish his newly edited text of the same chapter in the above series. Since then, while preparing a transliterated text of this chapter of the manuscript and editing the Tibetan text based on four editions (PNDC) of the bsTan 'gyur, he has concentrated his energies on completing his new edition.

The present edition covers the last and additional Kośasthāna known as "Pudgalaviniścaya," as it is called by Yaśomitra. Although it is certainly a special appendix to the preceding eight chapters, this last chapter is devoted to the highly controversial question of the Buddhist denial of the existence of a soul or person. Therefore, this edition will further encourage future inquiry into Vasubandhu's critical discussion of *pudgala* as typically advocated by the Vātsīputrīya school in the context of action, transmigration, memory, and so on. It is to be hoped that this valuable work will soon be followed by the publication of a critical edition of other chapters. This is certainly something that would have been hoped for by Prof. Yasunori Ejima.

11 July 2005 Akira Saito

PREFACE

The present work contains a transliteration of the manuscript of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*(AKBh), preserved at Tokyo University, and a new edition of the Sanskrit text, juxtaposed with a collated text of the Tibetan versions. In the introduction, I provided some basic informations for the understanding of the text: the Sanskrit title of the Ninth Chapter, its formation process and its brief synopsis.

In 1987 the late Prof. Yasunori Ejima (江島惠教), foremost authority on Sanskrit Buddhist Text at Tokyo University, published "Textcritical Remarks of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*," a philological article and preliminary work for the revised version of the Ninth Chapter of the AKBh in Sanskrit. He originally planned to print the revised edition of the First Chapter of the AKBh in Sanskrit, to be followed by the publication of its Ninth Chapter. The first chapter was produced as scheduled, but, regretfully, due to his sudden death, the ninth chapter remained unpublished so far.

The present edition of the Ninth Chapter of the AKBh is intended to make available the unpublished work of Prof. Ejima. The framework of this revised version is unique partly owing to his original plan. I inserted his "Textcritical Remarks....." into the footnotes in the Sanskrit text together with my recension. His abbreviations and bibliography are for the most part preserved intact except some updated addenda. As for the footnotes in the Sanskrit text, Prof. Ejima's critical notes are marked as (Ejima:) and mine as (Lee:). Included are the transliteration of the Sanskrit manuscript and a Tibetan text corresponding to the Sanskrit text. Of course, all faults and mistakes contained therein are mine alone.

Through this work, I sincerely hope to hand down his posthumous work to the academic world. With this as a point of departure, it is to be wished that my colleagues as well as students of Prof. Ejima would succeed his unfinished projects in the future.

While pursuing my scholarly career under the guidance of Prof. Ejima, I

was deeply moved by his personality and scholarship. He always enjoyed heart-to-heart discussions with his students and placed emphasis on *mimi-gakumon* (knowledge picked up by listening to others). Through his open mindedness he constantly demonstrated the wisdom in learning widely, his unprejudiced attitude toward learning embodied in the sentiment "make the text speak," and his zeal for studies: all remain vividly in my heart and mind. Taking this opportunity, I pray for the repose of his soul.

Without the much needed help from the Department of Indian Philosophy and Buddhist Studies at Tokyo University who kindly granted me permission to use the photographs of the manuscript, I could not have brought this work to its present form. I am especially grateful to the Young Buddhist Association of the University of Tokyo for allowing me to use Prof. Ejima's article and to Prof. Akira Saito of Tokyo University who kindly wrote the foreword for this monograph. Appreciation is also due for Mr. Jeon Young Hoon, one of my graduate students, who assisted me in proofreading the Sanskrit text and the Tibetan versions in the present edition.

Finally but not the least, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my wife, Park Hyun Ja, who always revitalizes me like an oasis in a bleak desert as I toiled through the tiresome work of revision.

July 2005, Seoul, Republic of Korea

Jong Cheol Lee
Professor of Buddhist Studies,
Dep. of Philosophy, Graduate School of Korean Studies
The Academy of Korean Studies

ABBREVIATIONS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. **Ms**: The photographic reproductions preserved in the Department of Indian Philosophy and Buddhist Studies, Faculty of Letters, Tokyo University.

2. The edition based on :

Pra(=Skt): *Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam of Vasubandhu* ed. by P. Pradhan, revised second edition with introduction and indices etc. by A. Haldar, Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series Vol. VIII, Patna: K. P. Jayaswal Research Institute, 1975, p.461-479.
This second edition was printed anew and full of misprinting. It is never better than the first edition now out of print.

3. Tib(=T): the Tibetan versions of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*

P: The Peking edition in general, or No. 5591 : *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi bśad pa*, translated by Jinamitra and dPal brtsegs, Ṅu 93b7-109a7.
The folio and line numbers are given according to this edition.
C: The Cone edition preserved at the University of Tokyo in Microfilms(USA, IASWR), Khu 83b3-97b3.
D: The sDe dge edition (*The Tibetan Tripiṭaka,* Vol. 41, Taipei, 1991), or Tohoku No.4090, Khu 82a1-95a6.
N: The Narthang edition preserved at the University of Ryūkoku, Ṅu 94a3-109b3

4. Chn: the Chinese versions of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*

Taisho: The Taishō Shinshū Daizōkyō (the Tripiṭaka in Chinese).
Koryo: The Koryo Dae-jang-kyong, the photo-reprint edition of the Haein

xylographs published by Dongguk University, 1976, Vol. 27.

Zhēn(=Chn1, Z): *Ē-pí-dá-mó-jù-shè-shì-lùn*(阿毘達磨俱舍釋論, Taisho No. 1559), translated by Zhēn-dì(眞諦, 499-569 A.D.), Taisho 29, 304a17-310c17.

Xuán(=Chn2, X): *Ē-pí-dá-mó-jù-shè-lùn*(阿毘達磨俱舍論, Taisho No.1558) translated by Xuán-zàng(玄奘, 602-664 A.D.) in 651-654 A.D., Taisho 29, 152b23-159b14.

5. The commentaries

Pǔ-guāng: *Jù-shè-lùn-jì*(俱舍論記, Taisho No.1821) of Pǔ-guāng(普光, -664 A.D.-), Taisho 41, 438c15-452b4.

Fǎ-bǎo: *Jù-shè-lùn-shū*(俱舍論疏, Taisho No.1822) of Fǎ-bǎo(法寶, -703 A.D.-), Taisho 41, 803b14-812c1.

Yuán-huī: *Jù-shè-lùn-sòng-shū*(俱舍論頌疏, Taisho No.1823) of Yuán-huī(圓暉, -654 A.D.-), Taisho 41, 978a9-981c14.

Pūr: *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi ḥgrel bśad mtshan ñid kyi rjes su ḥbraṅ ba ṣes bya ba (Abhidharmakośa-ṭīkā Lakṣaṇānusāriṇī nāma)* (P. No.5594) of Pūrṇavardhana(7th to 8th century), Ñu 365a3-390b6.

Yaś(=SA): *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* by Yaśomitra(8th century) edited by U. Wogihara, Tokyo 1932-1936, repr. Tokyo 1971, p.697-723.

Tibetan: The Tibetan version of *Sphuṭārthā*: *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi ḥdrel bśad*(P. No.5593), Chu 378b6-408a3.

There are preserved in the Chinese and Tibetan Tripiṭakas many other commentaries. Among them the *Ē-pí-dá-mó Shùn-zhèng-lǐ-lùn*(阿毘達磨順正理論, *Nyāyānusāriṇī*, Taisho No.1562) and the *Ē-pí-dá-mó-zàng Xiǎn-zōng-lùn*(阿毘達磨藏顯宗論, Taisho No.1563) of Saṃghabhadra, the *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi bstan bcos kyi tshig leḥur byas paḥi rnam par bśad pa*(P. No.5592) of ḥDul bzaṅ(Vinītabhadra?) and the *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi bśad paḥi rgya cher ḥgrel pa don gyi de kho na ñid ces bya ba*(*Tattvārthā*)(P. No.5875) of Sthiramati do not comment upon the 9th chapter. The *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi ḥgrel pa gnad kyi sgron ma ṣes bya ba*(*Marmapradīpa*)(P. No.5596) of Dignāga only selects twelve important pharases from the *Bhāṣya*. They are in

this paper put out of considerations, except the another characteristic commentary titled *Upāyikā* of Śamathadeva(see below).

6. Other sources(only abbreviated)

Zá: *Zá-ē-hán-jīng*(雜阿含經, *Saṃyuktāgama*)(Taisho No.99)

Zēng: *Zēng-yì-ē-hán-jīng*(增一阿含經, *Ekottarāgama*)(Taisho No.125)

Zhōng: Zhōng-ē-*hán-jīng*(中阿含經, *Madhyamakāgama*)(Taisho No.26)

SN: *The Saṃyutta-nikāya* ed. by L. Feer, London: the Pali Text Society, 1884-1898.

AN: *The Anguttara-nikāya* ed. by R. Morris, London: the Pali Text Society, 1885-1900.

MN: *The Majjhima-nikāya* ed. by V. Trenckner et al., London: the Pali Text Society, 1888-1899.

BHSG: *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary*, by F. Edgerton, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953

Sāṃmatīyaśāstra: *Sān-mí-dǐ-bù-lùn*(三彌底部論, Taisho No.1649) translated by No Name during 350-431 A.D. It is referred to sometimes in my remarks especially in relation to quotations from the sūtras, as the Vātsīputrīyas, main opponents of Vasubandhu, is regarded to be very akin to the Sāṃmatīya or same with them. But it is not my task here to compare the *Bhāṣya* with it as a whole.

Pāṇini: *Pāṇinis Grammatik*, herausgegeben, übersetzt, erläutert und mit verschiedenen Indices versehen von O. Böhtlingk, zweite Auflage, Leipzig, 1887.

VS: *The Vaiśeṣikasūtra. The Vaiśeṣika Darśana* with the commentaries of Śaṅkara Miśra and Jayanārāyaṇa Tarka Pañchānana, ed. by Jayanārāyaṇa Tarka Pañchānana, Bibliotheca Indica N.S. fasc. 4, 5, 6, 8, 10, Calcutta, 1860-1861; repr. Osnabrück: Biblio Verlag, 1981.

PBh: *The Praśastapādabhāṣyam* by Praśastadevācharya with a commentary called *Vyomavat* by Vyomaśivācharya, ed. by G. Kavirāj, Chowkhambā Sanskrit Series No. 61, Benares 1931.

NS: *The Nyāyasūtra Nyāyadarśanam* with Vātsyāyana's *Bhāṣya*, Uddyotakara's

Vārttika, Vācaspati Miśra's *Tātparyaṭīkā* and Viśvanātha's *Vṛtti*, ed. by Tāranātha Nyāya-tarkatīrtha and Amarendramohan Tarkatīrtha, The Calcutta Sanskrit Series No. XVIII, Calcutta, 1936.

NBh: The *Nyāyabhāṣya*, see above.

7. Text editions and modern translations

Teramoto, E. and Yamaguchi, S.: "Tibetto bun Kusharon Hagahon yaku" (Japanese translation of the Tibetan version of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*, collated with two Chinese versions), *Bukkyō Kenkyū* Vol.2, 1913, No.1, pp. 1-51, No.2, pp. 303-336.

Stcherbatsky, Th.: *The soul theory of the Buddhists*(*Bulletin de l'Akademie des Sciences de Russie* 1919, p.823f.; in a separate book), Varanasi: Bhāratīya Vidyā Prakāśana, 1970. An English translation from the Tibetan.

La Vallée Poussin, L. de: *L'Abhidharmakośa de Vasubandhu*, septième et huitième chapitres, neuvième chapitre ou Réfutation de la Doctrine du Pudgala, Paris: Paul Geuthner, 1925; repr. Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises, 1971, pp. 227-302.

Gokhale, V. V.: "The text of the Abhidharmakośakārikā of Vasubandhu", *Journal of the Bombay Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society*, N.S. Vol.22, 1946, pp. 73-102.

Gokhale regarded thirteen verses as the very body of the Ninth Chapter of the *Kośa*, but they are in reality quotations or the saṃgraha-ślokas interpolated in the *Bhāṣya* by Vasubandhu himself.

Sakurabe, H.: "Hagahon no kenkyū" (a study on the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Ōtani Daigaku Kenkyū Nempō* No.12, 1959, pp.21-112. A Japanese translation from the Tibetan, and its analyses.

Hunabashi, I.: "Shōyū zō Kusharon Meiryōgishaku Hagahon" (A Japanes translation of the Ninth Chapter of *Sphuṭārthā* by Yaśomitra), *Ōtani Daigaku Kenkyū Nempō* No.15, 1963, pp. 1-61.

Ejima, Y.: "Textcritical Remarks of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*", *Bukkyō Bunka* No.20, 1987. pp.1-40.

Duerlinger, J.: "Vasubandhu's Refutation of the Theory of Selfhood", *Journal of*

Indian Philosophy, Vol.17, 1988, pp.129-87.

Oetke, K.: *"Ich" und Das Ich, Analytische Untersuchungen zur buddhistisch-brahmanischen Ātmankontroverse*, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden GmbH, 1988.

Pruden, Leo. M.: *Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam by Louis de La Vallée Poussin*, vol. 4, Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 1990, pp. 1313-80.

Murakami, Sh.: "Zinkaku shutai ron (1)", 1993, "Zinkaku shutai ron(2)", 1993, (On soul: A Japanese tranlation and annotations of Ātmavādapratiṣedha/ Pudgalaviniścaya, the Last Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*) in *Shinzitsu kō*, Sendai: Tohoku University Press, 1996, pp.177-240.

Duerlinger, J.: *Indian Buddhist Theories of Persons—Vasubandhu's "Refutation of the theory of a Self"*, London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003. English translation from Sanskrit Text and its philosophical analyses.

8. Other studies

Inoguchi, T.: "V.V. Gokhale shi no kingyō ni tsuite" (On V.V. Gokhale's edition of the Kośa-kārikā), *Bukkyō Kenkyū* No.6, 1951, pp. 67-69.

do.: "Kusharon Hagahon ni tsuite" (On the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Shūkyō Kenkyū* No.142, 1954, pp. 308-310.

Fukuhara, R.: "Gokhale bon Abhidharmakośakārikā ni tsuite" (On V.V. Gokhale's edition of the Kośa-kārikā), *Bukkyō Kenkyū* No.7, 1952, pp. 96-98.

do.: "Bonbun Abhidharmakośakārikā ni okeru mondai" (On the kārikā text of the Ninth Chapter), *Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū* Vol.2, No. 1, 1953, pp. 111-112.

do.: "Abhidharmakośakārikā to kanyaku Kusha-ju" (Chinese versions of the Kośa-kārikā), *Ryūkoku Daigaku Ronshū* Nos. 389/390, 1969, pp. 113-131.

Kawamura, K.: "Kusharon ni okeru mugasetsu ni tsuite" (On the nairātmyavāda in the Abhidharmakośa), *Shūkyō Kenkyū* No. 170, 1961, pp. 344-345.

Sakurabe, H.: "Kusharon ni okeru garon—Hagahon no shosetsu—" (On the nairātmyavāda in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Jiga to Muga*, ed. by H. Nakamura, Kyoto: Heirakuji-shoten, 1963,

pp. 455-478.

Michibayashi, N.: "Abidaruma Kusharon Hagahon no kenkyū" (A study on the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Komazawa Daigaku Daigakuin Bukkyōkenkyūkai Nempō* No.12, 1978, pp. 141-149.

Katō, J.: "Kusharon-ju nōto" (Notes on the Kośa-kārikā), *Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenryū* Vol.26, No.2, 1978, pp. 601-606.

do.: "Kaidō-shi no Haga betsuron setsu" (On the composition of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* analysed by the Japanese scholar Kaidō(1751-1810 A.D.) and its meanings), *Buzan Kyōgaku Taikai Kiyō* No.3, 1975, pp. 139-152.

Iida, H. : "Hagahon no ge ni tsuite" (On the Kārikās in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū* Vol.29, No.1, 1980, p.128-129.

Mitomo, K.: "Kusharon Hagahon no betsusen-ron mondai ni tsuite" (On the composition of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū* Vol.20, No.1, 1971, pp. 156-157.

Naito, A.: "Kusharon Hagahon no Jakusha ni tsuite" (On adversaries in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Ryūkoku Daigaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyūshitsu Nempō* No. 2, 1986, pp.29-31.

Hakamaya, N.: "Muga-setsu to Shutsō-meidai－Hagahon no Itsikōsatsu" (Anātmavāda and pratijñā: an analysis of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), in *Ga no Shisō*, Tokyo:Shunzyusha, 1991, pp.155-167.

Takeda, H.: "Tokushibu no pudgala setsu－Kusharon Hagahon no shosetsu wo tsūshin toshite" (On pudgala of Vātsīpurīya in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Ryūkoku Daigaku Ronsyū* No.451, 1998, pp. 1-36.

do.: "Kusharon Hagahon no kenkyū (1)" (A study of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Bukkyō Bunka Kenkyūzyo Kiyō* No.37, 1998, pp. 18-40.

do.: "Kusharon Hagahon no kenkyū (2)" (A study of the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Bukkyō Bunka Kenkyūzyo Kiyō* No.38, 1999, pp. 69-120.

do.: "Seshin no Zitsuga-setsu Hihan－Kusharon Hagahon no shosetsu wo

tsūshin toshite" (Vasubandhu's criticism of the Ātman Doctrine in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Ryūkoku Daigaku Ronsyū* No.456, 2000, pp. 52-76.

do.: "Kako wo sōkisuru shikumi－Kusharon Hagahon no shosetsu wo tsūshin toshite" (The method of remembering the past in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū* No.56, 2002, pp. 57-78.

Concerning the quotations from the sūtras:

Honjō, Y.: "Śamathadeva no tsutaeru Agon shiryō — Hagahon-chū" (Śamathadeva's identifications of the sūtras quoted in the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Bukkyō Kenkyū* No.13, 1983, pp. 55-70.

do.: *Kusharon shoe Agon zenpyō*: a Table of Āgama-citations in the *Abhidharmakośa* and the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā*, part I, Kyoto, 1984.

Fujita, K.(ed.): *Kusharon shoin no Agongyō ichiran* (Āgamas cited in the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya), Hokkaido: Department of Indian Philosophy, Faculty of Letters, Hokkaido University, 1984.

They both utilise the Śamathadeva's commentary: *Chos mṅon paḥi mdsod kyi ḥgrel bśad ñe bar mkho ba ṣes bya ba*(*Abhidharmakośa-ṭīkā Upāyikā nāma*)(P. No.5595) translated by Jayaśrī and Śes rab ḥod zer.

Pāsādika, Bhikkhu: *Kanonische Zitate im Abhidharmakośabhāṣya des Vasubandhu.*(Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der buddhistischen Texte aus den Turfan-Funden: Beiheft 1), Göttingen, 1989.

INTRODUCTION

§1 The Sanskrit Title of the Ninth Chapter of AKBh

Two passages in the preceding eight chapters of the AKBh provide hints about the ninth chapter. Based on these phrases, the original Sanskrit title of the ninth chapter of the AKBh may be restored.

(1) kasyeti ṣaṣṭhīṃ pudgalavādapratiṣedhe(Pra: pudgalavāde)[1] vicāraṣyāmaḥ (*Bhāṣya* ad *Kārikā* 4 73ab). (Pra, 243: 22 23)

(2) tatpūrvakāt santānaviśeṣād ity ātmavādapratiṣedhe saṃpravedayiṣyāmaḥ (*Bhāṣya* ad *Kārikā* 5 27bc). (Pra, 300: 23)

Yaśomitra adds a commentary of "Pudgalavādapratiṣedha-prakaraṇe" to "pudgalavādapratiṣedhe" (SA, 405: 15), which makes it obvious that Yaśomitra called the ninth chapter "prakaraṇa." He adds the following annotation in relation to "Ātmavādapratiṣedhe" of the second passage: "Ātmavādapratiṣedha iti śāstrāvasāne Vātsīputrīya-mata-pratiṣedhe" (SA, 476: 17).

Textual evidence mentioned above reveals that Vasubandhu himself called

---

1 Pra: pudgalavāde. Zhēn(242a): "破說我" (=ātmavāda-pratiṣedha); Xuán(86c): "破我論" (ātma-pratiṣedha-prakarana); T(P.236b6): "gaṅ zag tu smra ba dgag pa" (=pudgalavāda-pratiṣedha).

Read *"pudgalavāda-pratiṣedhe."*

Cf. Yaś(405, 15) : pudgalavāde Pudgala-pratiṣedha-prakaraṇe. Yaś(Tibetan, P. 62b2-3): gaṅ gi ṣes bya baḥi drug pa ni gaṅ zag tu smra ba dgag paḥi rab tu byed par (=pudgalavādapratiṣedha-prakaraṇe) bdag med na dran pa ḥdi gaṅ gi yin/ ciḥi phyir na ḥdi drug pa yin pa(=kimarthaiṣā ṣaṣṭhī) ṣes bya baḥi phyogs ḥdir bsam par bya ste /. Read *"pudgalavādapratiṣedha-prakaraṇe"* according to the Tibetan version.

the ninth chapter of his AKBh either "Pudgalavādapratiṣedha" or "Ātmavāda-pratiṣedha," and Yaśomitra considered Chapter 9 as an independent *prakaraṇa*, i.e., "a little treatise."

Thus, the ninth chapter may be viewed as an independent treatise, separate from the main text of the AKBh, and the exact title of the ninth chapter may be restored as *Ātmavādapratiṣedha* or *Pudgalavādapratiṣedha* based on the authoritative reading of Vasubandhu. However, if one analyzes the expressions and phrases of the entire text of the AKBh, one realizes that "pudgalavāda" was used only on one occasion, as shown above, while "ātmavāda" was used on eight different occasions, including the second passage cited above (see Pra, 125:5, 140:14, 140:15, 140:16 (twice), 300:23, 306:5, 307:16). Furthermore, Zhēn-dì (眞諦/Paramārtha, 499-569 A.D.) and Xuán-zàng (玄奘, 602-664 A.D.) translated the first passage cited above as "ātman" instead of "pudgala." Obviously, one may suggest that "pudgalavādapratiṣedha" of the first passage is most probably a copyist's error for "ātmavādapratiṣedha" based on the evidence of Vasubandhu's own usages and expressions. The Sanskrit title of the ninth chapter may, therefore, be assumed to be *Ātmavādapratiṣedha*.

§2 The Formation process of the Ninth Chapter of AKBh

After Stcherbatsky claimed the ninth chapter of the AKBh as an appendix to the main text of the AKBh, the academic world appears to have followed his view on the characteristic of this chapter.[2] According to Stcherbatsky, Chapter 9 sums up the main text of the AKBh, and it deals with many issues from the theory of "Anātmavāda" in particular (p. 1, p. 2). He also believed that its significance lay in its role as an intermediary link between *Abhidharmakośa* and *Vijñaptimātravāda* from the standpoint of the process of evolution of the thought of Vasubandhu (Stcherbatsky, p. 6).

---

2 Stcherbatsky, Theodore: *The Soul Theory of the Buddhists* (BASR, 1919, repr. Varanasi, 1970), especially see p. 1, p. 2, and p. 6.

The study of Sakurabe, Hajime on the ninth chapter may be cited as important in addition to Stcherbatsky. His research was built on the basic insight provided by Stcherbatsky.[3] Sakurabe's work provides a succinct discussion of the various commentaries on the AKBh, and develops the point raised by Kaidō (快道林常, 1751-1810), a Japanese scholar. Kaidō's point is that the ninth chapter of the AKBh that represented *Hagaron* (破我論, ātma-pratiṣedha-prakarana) was a different text than the AKBh and incorporated into the body of this text at a later stage. Based on his examination of the structure of the AKBh, Sakurabe further agreed with the argument of Kaidō in that the text of the AKBh from Chapters 1 to 8 constitutes an integral and cohesive structure but that Chapter 9 possesses a narrative technique and independent structural characteristics. Sakurabe himself summarized the main thrust of his argument as follows: First, Chapter 9 is an appendix, added to the main text of the AKBh, and second, the ninth chapter should be considered "a related sequel to the eighth chapter" (aṣṭama-kośasthāna-saṃbaddha) in SA(722:28) rather than "the ninth chapter" (navamaṃ kośasthānam) (Sakurabe, pp. 38 40).

However, these two conclusions reached by Sakurabe appear to be inherently contradictory. If he views Chapter 9 as an independent "appendix," it is not quite logical to view it also as "a related sequel." It would be more appropriate to consider it as a separate chapter, i.e., Chapter 9. Indeed, commentaries other than *Sphuṭārthā* and *Lakṣānānusāriṇī*, and Chinese and Tibetan translations of the AKBh refer to the chapter in question as an independent ninth chapter. It means that "saṃbaddha" in "samāptas cāṣṭama-kośasthāna-saṃbaddha eva pudgalaviniścayaḥ" that figures in *Sphuṭārthā* should be interpreted as "an added to" (e.g., appendix) rather than "a related sequel."

This issue is also related to the character of the four gathas (*Kārikā* 8-40; 8-41; 8-42; 8-43) that appear in the last part of the eighth chapter. If Chapter 9 is viewed as "an appendix," the character of these four gathas, in which three gathas of saṃgrahaśloka (*Kārikā* 8-41; 8-42; 8-43) are included, would

---

3 Sakurabe, Hajime (櫻部建): "Hagahon no kenkyū" (A Study on the Ninth Chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*), *Ōtani daigaku kenkyū nempō* No. 12, 1959, pp. 21-112.

naturally be concluding verses of the entire eight chapters. Katō, Junshō provides an insight on this issue by shedding light on the formation process of the entire AKBh.[4]

Katō has meticulously examined the Chinese and Tibetan transmission in relation to the creation of the AKBh. He agrees that Vasubandhu first wrote the *Abhidharmakośakārikā* (AK), to which the *Bhāṣya* was added. Katō then engages in textual analysis of the AKBh in order to examine the reliability of such a process of transmission (pp. 32 36) and comes to the conclusion that the transmission is grounded in historical reality. This obviates the possibility of Vasubandhu writing the AK and the *Bhāṣya* simultaneously. When Katō's theory is taken as a conceptual foundation of analysis, the four gathas appearing in the last part of the eighth chapter assume significance as the concluding verses of the entire text of AK. Furthermore, one may assume that Chapter 9 was added to the eighth chapter of the AKBh when the *Bhāṣya* was added to the AK.

When the Gokhale edition of the AK is examined, one finds that all of the gathas of the main text are written in the classical *śloka* meter.[5] But the three gathas appearing in the initial part of the AK and the four gathas in the last part of the AK, except the last one that is in the *śloka* meter, adopt altogether different meters.[6] Not only meter but textual context also reveal that the three verses appearing in the initial part of the AK are prefatory verses, including *maṅgalaśloka*, and the last four verses of the AK are concluding verses.[7] It also

---

4 See Katō, Junshō (加藤純章): *Kyōryōbu no kenkyū* (A Study of Sautrāntika), Tokyo: Syunzyusya, 1989, especially Chapter 1, "Questions Related to Abhidharmakośabhāṣya and Nyāyānusāra."

5 See Gokhale, V.V., "The Text of the Abhidharmakośakārikā of Vasubandhu", JBBRAS (New Series) 22, 1946, pp. 73-102.

6 See Ejima, Yasunori: *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya of Vasubandhu —Chapter I: Dhātunirdeśa-* (*Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica* 1, Tokyo: The Sankibo Press, 1989), especially p. 1, n. 2; p. 2, n. 13; p. 3, n. 4, n. 7. Ejima points out that AK 1-1and AK 1-2 are in *indravajrā* meter, AK 1-3 in *praharṣiṇī* meter, and *śloka* meter was used after AK 1-4. It is also remarkable that AK 8-40 at the end of chapter 8, uses *indravajrā* meter, AK 8-41 and AK 8-42 *vaṃśastham* meter, and the last verse of AK 8-43 adopts the *śloka* meter.

7 In AK 1-1, "śāstraṃ pravakṣyāmy abhidharmakośam" is mentioned, and

seems highly possible that the four verses in the last part of the eighth chapter were written as concluding verses when the entire text of the AK was composed. The Chinese and Tibetan translations which contain only the AK and not its *Bhāṣya* supports such a line of argument. Sakurabe's paper mentioned above also provides many evidence to support the view that Chapter 9 was added to Chapter 8 as the *Bhāṣya* was composed for the AK.

In sum, three points must be stressed: First, there are clues to suggest that Chapter 9 would appear in the preceding eight chapters. This point has already been discussed. ; Second, two passages in Chapter 9 suggest that the preceding eight chapters form their premise.;[8] Third, if we follow our conclusion, Chapter 9 starts with the phrase "kiṃ khalv ato 'nyatra mokṣo nāsti." It is important to note that "ato 'nyatra" mentioned here is premised on the main text of the AKBh.[9]

We may, therefore, draw the following conclusion. Vasubandhu first wrote his eight chapters of the AK, and then wrote the ninth chapter as an appendix to the main text after he finished writing the *Bhāṣya* on *Kārikā*. This is the formation process of *Ātmavādapratiṣedha* as outlined in this monograph.

"Kāśmīravaibhāṣikanītisiddhaḥ prāyo mayā 'yaṃ kathito 'bhidharmaḥ" can be found in AK 8-40. Through AK 8-40, Vasubandhu demonstrates that the AK is a kind of compendium by basing his claim on the theory of *Kāśmīra-vaibhāṣika*. Furthermore, we realize the extreme difficulty of gleaning the unique thought of Vasubandhu without a *Bhāṣya* or commentary when we examine the character of the text of the AKBh. In contrast, Chapter 9 is a unique treatise that sheds light on Vasubandhu's own thought.

8 One may cite, for instance, Pra (476, 18): "yathā kṛtvā tathoktam"; Pra (477, 6): "yathā tathoktam". Yaśomitra takes "tad-vikāra-vikāritvād āśrayāś cakṣur-ādaya" (AK 1-45ab) as an authority with regard to the above two usages (SA 718:18; 719:14).

9 In the phrase "ato 'nyatra" (other than this), "this" refers to "the teaching of Buddha" (muneḥ śāsana) that is mentioned in the three verses in the last part of the eighth chapter. The above-mentioned book of Stcherbatsky (p. 10) also follows a similar line of interpretation. Cf. SA (697, 1-4): kiṃ khalv ato 'nyatra mokṣo nāsti iti. na pramādyaṃ mumukṣubhir iti vacanāt ayaṃ eva mokṣopāyaḥ. nāsty ato 'nyo mokṣopāyaḥ. tad atra moktukāmaiḥ pramādo na kartavya ity arthād uktaṃ ācāryeṇa.

§3 The Synopsis of the Ninth Chapter : Ātmavādapratiṣedha

1. General remarks

%1 The relationship between *ātmagrāha* and *mokṣa*

%2 The reality of *ātman* as to perception or inference

2. Objections to the *Ātmavāda* of *Vātsīputrīya*

%3 *pudgala*/*ātman* as *prajñaptisat*, but not as *dravyasat*

%4 The examination of the argument of *Vātsīputrīyāḥ*, "skandhān upādāya pudgalaprajñaptiḥ"

%5 The relationship between *skandha* and *pudgala*, and *dāhya* and *dāhaka*

%6-9 Different characteristics of *dāhya* and *dāhaka*

%10 Concomitant difference between *skandha* and *pudgala*

%11 The unsuccessful argument of *Vātsīputrīyāḥ*, "skandhān upādāya pudgalaprajñaptiḥ"

%12-16 The examination of *pudgala* as to the object of six consciousnesses

%17-18 The *sūtra* concerning *pudgala* in regard to *prajñaptisat*

%19 The distinction between *nikāya* and *buddhavacana*

%20 *pudgala*/*ātman* as *prajñaptisat*

%21-30 Questions related to *sūtra*s (meaning of *'sarvajña'*, *'avyākṛta'*, *'saṃsāra'*, etc.)

%31 *ātman*, not needed for *smṛti*

3. Objections to the *Ātmavāda* of *Tīrthika*

%32-34 (objection to *Vaiyākaraṇa*:) *ātman*, not needed as an agent of consciousness

%35 (objection to *Vaiśeṣika*:) The connection between consciousness and *ātman*

4. Questions related to the theory of *anātman*

%36 *ātman*, not needed as an object of *ahaṃkāra*.

%37 *ātman*, not needed as an agent of action nor as a subject of its result.

%38-39 *saṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣa*

5. Concluding Verses

%40 *saṃgrahaśloka*

TRANSLITERATION
OF
THE SANSKRIT MANUSCRIPT

§1 Conventions

Symbols used:

( )	restored akṣara(s)
[ ]	damaged akṣara(s)
< >	omitted (part of) akṣara(s)
{ }	superfluous akṣara(s)
{{ }}	erased akṣara(s)
〈 〉	insertion in the margin
+	one lost akṣara
··	one illegible akṣara
·	illegible part of an akṣara
*	virāma
'	avagraha
;	a sign to fulfill a blank, especially at the end of line or before a punch hole
○	punch hole
◎	decorative mark in the colophon

Abbreviations:

r	recto
v	verso

§2 Orthographic Characteristics

Regarding concrete informations on the manuscript itself, consult Yasunori Ejima, ed., *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya of Vasubandhu—Chap. I : Dhātunirdeśa—*. Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica 1 (Tokyo: Sankibo Press, 1989), pp. vi-viii.

1. avagraha
1.1. loss of avagraha

2. visarga
2.1. loss of visarge [frequent]

3. anusvāra
3.1. loss of anusvāra [frequent]
3.2. anusvāra replaces all class nasals(ṅ, ñ, ṇ, n, m). [frequent]
3.3. anusvāra insertion.
-ṃm(vowel)- BHSG §2.64.
3.4. nasals replaces anusvāra.
e.g. saṃtāna >santāna; kiṃ tarhi >kin tarhi; evaṃ na >evan na;
idaṃ ca >idañ ca

4. virāma
4.1. loss of virāma [frequent]

5. duplication of consonants
5.1. after r.
-rvv-(e.g. sarvva/sarva: frequent); -rmm-(e.g. dharmma); -rddh-(e.g. nirddhārita); -rtt-(e.g.kartā>karttā; vartate>varttate)
5.2. miscellaneous.
sattva>satva; dattvā>datvā

6. no difference between 'b' and 'v'

(21B1, VI)(1v.1)namo buddhāya //

{%Skt 9-1}

- kiṃ khalv ato (')nyatra mokṣo nāsti /
- nāsti /
- kiṃ kāraṇaṃ /
- vitathātmadṛṣṭiniviṣṭatvāt* / na hi te skandhasantāna evātmaprajñaptiṃ vyavasya<n>ti /
- kin tarhi </>
- dravyāntara(1v.2)m evātmānaṃ parikalpayanti / ātmagrāhaprabh{ā}vāś ca sarvvakleśā iti /

{%Skt 9-2}

- kathaṃ punar idaṃ gamyate / skandhasantāna evedam ātmābhidhānam varttate nānyasminn abhidheya iti </>
- pratya(1v.3)kṣānumānābhāvāt(*) /

ye hi dharmmāḥ santi / teṣāṃ pratyakṣam upa○labdhir bhavaty asaty antarāye / tadyathā ṣaṇṇām viṣayā{nā}ṇāṃ manasaś ca / anumānaṃ ca / ta{tha}dyathā pañcā(1v.4)nām indriyāṇāṃ /

tatredam anumānaṃ / sati {sa}kāraṇe kāraṇā○ntarasyābhāve kāryasyābhāvo dṛṣṭo bhāve ca punar bhāvas tadyathāṃkurasya / saty eva cābhāsaprāpte (1v.5)viṣaye manaskāre ca kāraṇe viṣayagrahaṇasyābhāvo dṛ○ṣṭaḥ punaś ca bhāvo (')ndhabadhirādīnām <an>andhābadhirādīnāṃ ca / atas tatrāpi karaṇāntarasyābhāvo bhā(1v.6)vaś ca niścīyate / yac ca tatkāraṇāntaran tad indriyam ity etad anumānaṃ /

na caivam ātmano (')stīti {/} nāsty ātmā /

{%Skt 9-3}

- yat tarhi v(ā)tsīputrīyāḥ pudgalaṃ santam icchanti / vicāryan tā≪va≫d e(1v.7)tat(*) / kin te dravyata icchanty āhosvit* prajñaptitaḥ /
- kiṃ cedaṃ dravyata iti kim vā prajñaptitaḥ /
- rūpādivat(*) bhāvāntaraṃ cet(*) dravyataḥ / kṣīrādivat samudāyaś cet(*) (21A1, Ⅶ)(2r.1)prajñapti<ta>ḥ /
- kiṃ cātaḥ /
- yadi tāvat dravyataḥ / sa{ṃ} bhinnasvabhāvatvāt {/} skandhebhyo (')nyo vaktavya it{i}retaraskandhavat(*) / kāraṇaṃ cāsya vaktavyaṃ / asaṃskṛto vā / atas tīrthi(2r.2)kadṛṣṭiprasaṃgo niṣprayojanatvaṃ ca /

atha prajñaptitaḥ / vayam apy evaṃ brūmaḥ /

{%Skt 9-4}

- naiva hi sa dravyato (')sti nāpi prajñaptitaḥ /
- kin tarhy </>
- ādhyātmikān[1] upāttān varttamānān skandhā(2r.3)n upādāya pudgalaḥ prajñapyate /
- tad idam andhavacanam anunmī○litārthan na budhyāmahe /

kim idam u{pa}pādāyeti / yady ayam arthaḥ skandhānāṃ lakṣyate[2] / teṣv eva (2r.4)pudgalaprajñaptiḥ prāpnoti / yathā rūpādīn{āṃ} ālaṃbya teṣv e○va kṣīraprajñaptiḥ / athāyam arthaḥ {/} skandhān* pratītyeti </> skandhānāṃ pudgalaprajñaptikāraṇatvāt(*) (2r.5)sa eva doṣaḥ /

- na sa evaṃ prajñapyate /
- kathan tarhi /
- yathendhanam u○pādāyāgniḥ /

{%Skt 9-5}

- kathaṃ cendhanam upādāyāgniḥ prajñapyate /
- na hi vinendhanenāgniḥ prajñapyate (2r.6)na cānya indhanād agniḥ śakyate

---

1 Pra reads: "*kin tarhi / ādhyātmikān*". Read as in Pra.

2 Pra reads: "*skandhānāṃ lakṣyate*". Ejima reads: "*skandhān āṃlambyate*". Read "*skandhān ālambyeti*" as in Ejima.

prajñapayituṃ[3] / nāpy ananyaḥ / yadi hy anyaḥ syād anuṣṇam indhanaṃ syāt / athānanyaḥ syād dāhyam eva dāhakaṃ syāt(*) /

evan na ca vinā skandhai(2r.7)ḥ pudgalaḥ prajñapyate / na cānyaḥ skandhebhyaḥ śakyate pratijñātuṃ śāśvata<pra>saṃgāt* / nāpy ananya ucchedaprasaṃgād iti /

{%Skt 9-6}

- aṃga tāvad brūhi kim indhanaṃ ko (')gnir iti tato jñāsyā-
(21B1, Ⅶ)(2v.1)maḥ katham indhanam upādāyāgniḥ prajñapyata iti /
- kim atra vaktavyaṃ / dāhyam indhanaṃ dāhako (')gniḥ /
- etad evātra vaktavyaṃ / kin dāhyaṃ ko vā dāhaka iti /
- loke hi tāva{{pra}}d apradī(2v.2)ptaṃ kāṣṭhādikam indhanam ucyate dāhyaṃ ca / pradīptam agnir dāhakaś ca </> yac ca bhāsvaraṃ coṣṇaṃ ca bhṛśaṃ ca tena {/} hi tad idhyate dahyate ca santativikārā{ṃ}pādānāt(*) / tac cobhayam aṣṭadra(2v.3)vyakan tac cendhanaṃ pratītyāgnir utpadyate yathā kṣīraṃ pratītya dadhi ○ madhu pratītya śuktam / tasmād indhanam upādāyety u{pā}cyate /
- anyaś ca sa tasmād bhinnakālatvāt(*) / yadi (2v.4)cevaṃ[4] pudgalaḥ skandhān(*) pratītyotpadyate / sa tebhyo (')nyaś c<ā>nitya○ś ca prāpnoti / atha punas tatraiva kāṣṭhādau pradīpte yad oṣṇyan[5] tad agnis tatsahajātāni trīṇi bhū(2v.5)tānīndhanam iṣyante / tayor api siddham anyatvaṃ lakṣaṇabhedāt* /○

{%Skt 9-7}

- upādāyārthas tu vaktavyaḥ / kathan tad indhanam upādāya so (')gniḥ prajñapyata iti / na hi tat tasya kā(2v.6)raṇaṃ nāpi tat(*)prajñapteḥ / agnir eva hi tatprajñapteḥ kāraṇam /

yady āśrayārtha{m} upādāyārthaḥ sahabhāvārtho vā / skandhā apy evaṃ pudgalasyāśraya<saha>bhūtāḥ prāpnuvantīti vi(2v.7)spaṣṭam anyatvaṃ pratijñāyate / tadabhāve va[6] pudgalābhāvaḥ prāpnoti / indhanābhāva

---

3 Read *pratijñātuṃ*.
4 Read *caivaṃ*.
5 Read *auṣṇyaṃ*.

ivāgnyabhāvaḥ /
{%Skt 9-8}

- yat tu tad uktaṃ yadīndhanād {ā}nyo ('}gniḥ syād anuṣṇam indhanaṃ syād iti / ki-
(21A1, Ⅷ)(3r.1)m idam uṣṇaṃ nāma /
yadi tāvad auṣṇyaṃ / anuṣṇam evendhanam anyabhūtasvabhāvatvāt(*) / atha yad auṣṇyavat(*) / anyad api tad uṣṇasvabhāvād agner uṣṇaṃ sidhyaty auṣṇyayogād </> iti {/} nā(3r.2)sty anyatve doṣaḥ /

{%Skt 9-9}

- atha punaḥ sarvam eva tat* pradīptaṃ kāṣṭhādikam indhanaṃ cāgniś ceṣyate / tadupādāyārthaś ca vaktavyaḥ /
skandhā eva ≪ca≫ pu{{pu}}dgalā ity ananyatvam anivāryaṃ prāpno(3r.3)ti / tasmān na sidhyaty etat(*) / yathendhanam upādāyāgniḥ prajña○pyate {/} evaṃ skandhān upādāya pudgalaḥ {/} iti[7] /

{%Skt 9-10}

- yadi cāyam anyaḥ skandhebhyo na vaktavyaḥ / pañcavidha<ṃ> jñe(3r.4)yam atītānāgataṃ pratyutpannam asaṃskṛtam avaktavyam iti na va○ktavyaṃ {/} prāpnoti / naiva hi tad atītādibhyaḥ pañcaman nāpañca≪maṃ≫ vaktavyaṃ /

{%Skt 9-11}

- yadā ca pudgalaḥ prajñapya(3r.5)te kin tāvat skandhān upalabhya prajñapyate / āhosvit pudgalaṃ </> ○
yadi tāvat* skandhāṃs teṣv eva pudgalaprajñaptiḥ prāpnoti / pudgalasya anupalambhāt(*)[8] / atha pudgalaṃ (3r.6)katham asya skandhān upādāya

---

6 Read *ca*.
7 Read *pudgala iti*.
8 Read *pudgalasyānupalambhāt*.

prajñaptir bhavati / pudgala eva hi tasyā upādānaṃ prāpnoti /

atha mataṃ satsu skandheṣu pudgala upalabhyate / tataḥ skandhān upādāyāsya prajñapti(3r.7)r ucyata iti / tad evaṃ rūpasyāpi cakṣurmanaskārālokeṣu satsūpalaṃbhāt(*) / tān upādāya prajñaptir vaktavyā / rūpavac ca pudgalasyānyatvaṃ spaṣṭaṃ /

{%Skt 9-12}

- idaṃ tāvad vaktavyaṃ /{/}
(21B1, Ⅷ)(3v.1)ṣaṇṇāṃ vijñānānāṃ katamena pudgalo vijñeyaḥ /
- ṣaḍbhir apīty ucyate /
- kathaṃ kṛtvā </>
- cakṣurvvijñeyāni ced rūpāṇi pratītya pudgalaṃ prati<vi>bhāvayati cakṣurvijñeyaḥ pudgalo va(3v.2)ktavyaḥ / no tu vaktavya(ḥ)[9] {/} rūpāṇi vā no vā / evaṃ yāvat manovijñeyān(*) ced dharmmān(*) pratītya pudgalaṃ prativibhāvayati / manovijñeyaḥ pudgalo vaktavyo no (3v.3)tu vaktavyo dharmmā vā no vā /
- evan taṃ[10] kṣīrādibhiḥ samāna○ḥ prāpnoti /

cakṣurvvijñeyāni ced rūpāṇi pratītya kṣīraṃ <prati>vibhāvayaty udakaṃ vā cakṣurvvijñe(3v.4)yaṃ kṣīram udakaṃ ceti[11] vaktavyaṃ / no tu vaktavyaṃ {/} rūpāṇi <vā> no vā / evaṃ ghrāṇajihvākāyavijñeyaṃ vaktavyaṃ no tu vaktavyaṃ {/} sprasṭavyāṇi[12] vā no ○ vā / mā bhūt kṣī(3v.5)rodakayoś catuṣṭvaprasaṅga iti / ato yathā rūpādīny eva ○ kṣīram udakaṃ vā prajñapyate {/} samastāny evaṃ skandhāḥ pu{{kbha}}dgala iti siddhaṃ /

{%Skt 9-13}

- yac cocyate cakṣurvvi(3v.6)jñeyāni rūpāṇi pratītya pudgalaṃ prativibhāvayatīti ko (')sya vākyasyārthaḥ </>

---

9 Read *vaktavyo*.
10 Read *tarhi*.
11 Read *veti*.
12 Read *spraṣṭavyāni*.

kiṃ tāvad rūpāṇi pudgalopalabdheḥ kāraṇaṃ bhava<n>tīti / āhosvid rūpāṇy upala(3v.7)bhamānaḥ pudgalam upalabhata iti /

yadi rūpāṇi pudgalopalabdheḥ kāraṇaṃ bhavanti {/} sa ca tebhyo (')nyo <na> vaktavyaḥ / evan tarhi rūpam apy ālokacakṣurm{ā}naskāro-
(22A, I)(4r.1)bhyo[13] (')nyo[14] na vaktavyaṃ / teṣāṃ tadupalabdhikāraṇatvāt(*) /

atha rūpāṇy upalabhamānaḥ pudgalam upalabhate /
kiṃ tayaivopala..palabhate[15] / āhosvid anyayā /

yadi ta(4r.2)yaiva rūpād abhinnasvabhāvaḥ pudgalaḥ prāpnoti / rūpa eva vā tat(*)prajñaptiḥ / idañ ca rūpam a{ṃ}yaṃ pudgalaḥ[16] katham idaṃ gamyate[17] / athaivan na paricchidyate / katham idaṃ (4r.3)pratijñāyate rūpam apy asti pudgalo (')py astīti / upalabdhi;○vaśena hi tasyāstitvaṃ pratijñāyeta /

evaṃ yāvad dharmebhyo vaktavyaṃ /

athānyāthā[18] bhinnakālo(4r.4)palambhād anyo rūpāt prāpnoti / nīlād iva pītaṃ kṣaṇād i○va ca kṣaṇāntaraṃ / evaṃ yāvad dharmmebhyo vaktavyaṃ /

atha rūpapudgalavat tadupalabdhyor apy anyānanya(4r.5)tvam avaktavyaṃ / tena tarhi saṃskṛte (')py[19] avaktavyaṃ {/} bhavatīti si○ddhāntabhedaḥ / yadi cāyam asti no tu vaktavyo rūpāṇi vā no vā / kin tarhi bhagavatoktaṃ rūpam a(4r.6)nātmā yāvad vijñānam anātmeti /

{%Skt 9-14}

- yena cāyaṃ cakṣurvijñānena pudgala upalabhyate / kiṃ tad rūpāṇi pratītyotpadyate / āhosvit* pudgalam ubhayam vā /

yadi rūpāṇi pra(4r.7)tītyotpadyate / notsahiṣyate pudgalaṃ vijñātuṃ śabdādivat(*) / yam eva hi viṣayaṃ {cakṣurvijñāne.u} pratītyotpadyate vijñānaṃ sa eva tasyālambanapratyayaḥ /

atha pu-

---

13 Read *-manaskārebhyo.*
14 Read *'nyan.*
15 Read *tayaivopala(bdhyo)palabhate.*
16 Read *pudgala iti.*
17 Read *paricchidyate.*
18 Read *athānyayā.*
19 Read *saṃskṛtam apy.*

(22B, I)(4v.1)dgalaṃ pratītyotpadyate ubhayaṃ vā / idam utsūtraṃ / sūtre hi nirddhāritaṃ / dvayaṃ pratītya vijñānasyotpādo bhavatīti / tathā cakṣur bhikṣo hetū rūpāṇi pratyayaś cakṣurvvi(4v.2)jñānasyotpādāya / tat kasya hetoḥ / yat kiṃcit(*) bhikṣo cakṣurvijñānaṃ sa..n tac cakṣuḥ pratītya rūpāṇi ceti / anityaś ca pudgala evaṃ prāpnoti / ye hetavo ye pratya(4v.3)yā vijñānasyotpādāya te (')py anityā iti ≪sūtre≫ vacanāt(*) /

atha ○ pudgalo na tasyā<la>mbanaṃ na tarhi tena vijñeyaḥ /

{%Skt 9-15}

- yadi ca pudgalaḥ ṣaḍvijñānavijñeyaḥ pratijñāya(4v.4)te /
sa śrotravijñānavijñeyatvād rūpād anyaḥ {/} prāpnoti ○ śabdavat(*) /
cakṣurvijñānavijñeyatvāc chabdād anyaḥ {/} prāpnoti {/} rūpavat(*) /
evam anyebhyo (')pi yo(4v.5)jyam /

idañ ca sūtrapadam bādhitaṃ bhavati / yānīmāni br(ā)hmaṇa ○ pañcendriyāṇi nānāgocarāṇi nānāviṣayāṇi / sva(ka)ṃ sva(ka)ṃ gocaraviṣayaṃ pratyanubhavanti / (4v.6)nānyad anyasya gocaraviṣayaṃ praty{ayaṃm}anubhavati / tadyathā cakṣurindriyaṃ śrotrendriyaṃ ghrāṇendriyaṃ jihvendriyaṃ kāyendriyam / mana eṣāṃ pañcānām indriyāṇāṃ go(4v.7)caraviṣayaṃ pratyanubhavati manaś caiṣāṃ pratisaraṇam iti / n{e} vā pudgalo viṣayaḥ / na ced viṣaya(ḥ) / na tarhi vijñeyaḥ /
- yady evaṃ manaindriyasyāpy avyabhicāraḥ prā-
(22A, II)(5r.1)pnoti / ṣaḍ imānīndriyāṇi nānāgocarāṇi nānāviṣayāṇi sva(ka)ṃ sva(ka)ṃ gocaraviṣayam ākāṃkṣantīty uktaṃ {/} ṣaṭ*prāṇakopame /
- na tatrendriyam evendriyaṃ kṛtvo(5r.2)ktaṃ / pañcānāṃ darśanādyā{nāṃ}kāṃkṣaṇāsaṃbhavāt(*) tadvijñānānāṃ ca / atas tadādhipatyādhyākṛtam[20] atra manovijñānendriyaṃ[21] kṛtvoktaṃ /[22] yac ca tat kevalaṃ manaādhipa(5r.3)tyādhyākṛtaṃ[23] manovijñānaṃ naiva tadanyeṣāṃ viṣayam ākāṃ○kṣaty a{{ho}}to nāsty eṣa doṣaḥ //

---

20 Read *-ādhyāhṛtam.*
21 Read *manovijñānam indriyaṃ.*
22 Read *atas tadādhipatyādhyāhṛtam atra manovijñānam indriyaṃ kṛtvoktaṃ /.*
23 Read *-ādhyāhṛtam.*

{%Skt 9-16}

- uktaṃ ca bhagavatā sarvābhijñe<yaparijñe>yaṃ vo bhikṣavo dharmmaparyāyaṃ de(5r.4)śayiṣyāmīty <u>ktvā cakṣur abhijñe<yaparijñe>yaṃ rūpāṇi cakṣurvvijñānaṃ ○ cakṣuḥsaṃsparśo yad api taccakṣuḥsaṃsparśapratyayam adhyātmam utpadyate {/} veditaṃ sukhaṃ duḥkhaṃ vā {/} a(5r.5)duḥkhāsukham vā yāvat manaḥsaṃsparśapratyayaṃ / ayam ucyate {/} sa○rvābhijñeyaparijñeyo dharmmaparyāyaḥ {/} iti / ata etāvad evābhijñeyaṃ {{prati}} ⟨pari⟩ jñeyaṃ ce(5r.6)ty avadhāryate / na pudgalaḥ / tasmā{t*}{{pu}}d vijñeyo (')py asau na bhavati / prajñāvijñānayoḥ samānaviṣayatvāt* /

{%Skt 9-17}

- cakṣuṣā ca pudgalaṃ paśyāma iti paśyantaḥ paudga(5r.7)likā anātmanā ātmānaṃ paśyāma iti dṛṣṭisthānam āpannā bhavanti /

sūtre ca bhagavatā nītam etat* / skandheṣv eva pudgalākhyeti / mānuṣyakasūtraṃ </> cakṣuḥ pratītya (22B, Ⅱ)(5v.1)rūpāṇi cotpadyate cakṣurvvijñānaṃ trayāṇāṃ sannipātaḥ spa<r>śaḥ sparśasahajātā vedanā saṃjñā cetanā itīme catvāro (')rūpiṇaḥ skandhāś cakṣurindriyaṃ ca rūpam etāvan manu(5v.2)ṣyatvam ucyate / atreyaṃ sa<ṃ>jñā{na} satvaṃ[24] {/} naro manuṣyo mānava{{ḥ}}ś ca poṣaḥ puruṣaḥ pudgalo jīvo jantur iti / atreyaṃ pratijñā ahaṃ cakṣuṣā rūpāṇi paśyāmīti / atrā(5v.3)yam vyavahāra ity api sa āyuṣmān evaṃnāmā evaṃjātya evaṃ○gotra evamāhāra evaṃsukhaduḥkhapratisaṃvedī {/} evaṃdīrghāyur evaṃcirasthitika ev{ā}māyu(5v.4)ḥparyanta iti / iti hi bhikṣavaḥ saṃjñāmātrakam evai<ta>d vyava○hāramātrakam evaitat*[25] / sarvva ime dharmmāḥ {/} anityāḥ saṃskṛtāś cetitāḥ pratītyasamutpannā (5v.5)iti /

nītārtham ca sūtraṃ pratisaraṇam uktaṃ bhagavatā / tasmān na ○ punaḥ

---

24 Read *saṃjñā sattvo.*

25 Read *saṃjñāmātrakam evaitat pratijñāmātrakam evaitad vyavahāramātrakam evaitat.*

parīkṣyate /

tathā coktaṃ sarvvam astīti brāhmaṇa yāvad eva dvādaśāyatanānīti / yadi cā(5v.6)yaṃ pudgalo nāyatanaṃ na so (')stīti siddhaṃ / athāyatanaṃ na tarhy avaktavyaḥ / teṣām api caivaṃ paśyato yāvatā bhikṣo cakṣur yāvatā rūpāṇi vistareṇa etāvatā bhikṣo (5v.7)tathāgataḥ sarvvañ ca prajñapayati[26] {/} sarvvaprajñaptiṃ c(e)ti /

bimbisārasūtre coktaṃ / ātmā ātmeti bhikṣavo bālo (')śrutavān* pṛthagjanaḥ prajñaptim anupatito na tv atrā-
(22A, III)(6r.1)tmā vā {/} ātmīyaṃ vā duḥkham idam u<t>padyamānam utpadyate iti vistaraḥ //

{%Skt 9-18}

- śailayāpy arhantyā māram ārabhyoktaṃ /

manyase kin nu satveti māra dṛṣṭigataṃ hi te /
śūnyaḥ saṃ(6r.2)skārapuñjo (')yan na hi satvo (')tra vidyate //
yathaiva hy aṃgasaṃbhārāt saṃjñā ratha iti smṛtā /
evaṃ skandhān upādāya saṃvṛtyā satva ucyata[27] <//> iti /

kṣudrake (')pi cāgame dari(6r.3)drabrāhmaṇam[28] adhikṛtyoktaṃ /

śṛṇu tvaṃ{s} bādare[29] dharmmaṃ sarvvagranthi○pramocanaṃ /
yathā saṃkliśyate cittaṃ yathā cittaṃ viśudhyati /</>
ātmaiva hy ātmano nāsti viparī;(6r.4)tena kalpyate /
nāstīha satva ātmā vā dharmmās tv ete sa○hetukāḥ /</>
dvādaśaiva bhavāṃgāni skandhāyatanadhātavaḥ /
viciṃtya sarvāṇy etāni pudgalo (6r.5)nopalabhyate /</>
śūnyam adhyātmakaṃ paśya śūnyaṃ paśya bahi○rggataṃ /
na labhyate so (')pi kaścid yo bhāvayati śūnyatām <//> iti /{/}

tathoktaṃ /{/} pañcādīnavā ā(6r.6)tmopalambhe / ātm{ā}dṛṣṭir bhavati satvadṛṣṭiḥ / nirviśeṣo bhavati tīrthikaiḥ {//} sārddhaṃ unmārggapratipanno

---

26 Read *prajñāpayati*.
27 Read *ucyate*.
28 Read *bādaribrāhmaṇam*.
29 Pra reads: tvaṃ svādare. Ejima reads: tvaṃm bādare. Read "tvaṃ{s} bādare".

bhavati / śūnyatāyām asya citta(ṃ) na praskandati na pra{ṃ}(6r.7)sīdati na saṃtiṣṭhate na vimucyate / āryadharmmā asya na vyavadāyanta iti /

{%Skt 9-19}

- na vai ta evaṃ granthaṃ pramāṇaṃ kurvvanti / kiṃ kāraṇaṃ /
- nāsmākaṃm ayaṃ nikāye paṭhyata i-
(22B, III)(6v.1)ti /
- kiṃ punas teṣā[ṃ] nikāya eva pramāṇam āhosvid buddhavacanaṃ / yadi nikāya eva pramāṇaṃ na tarhi teṣāṃ buddhaḥ śāstā / na ca te śākyaputrīyā bhavanti / atha buddhava(6v.2)canaṃ pramāṇaṃ / ayaṃ granthaḥ kasmān na pramāṇaṃ / na hi kilaitat* buddhavacanam iti </> kiṃ kāraṇaṃ /
- nāsmākaṃ {ayaṃ} nikāye paṭhyata iti /
- ayam anyāyo varttate </>
- ko (')trānyā(6v.3)yaḥ /
- yo hi granthaḥ / sarvveṣu nikāyāntareṣv āmnāyate /○ na ca sūtraṃ dharmmatāṃ vā bādhate / so (')smābhir apāṭhān na buddhavacanam iti {/} vacanaṃ kevalaṃ sāha(6v.4)samātraṃ /

{%Skt 9-20}

- kiñ cedam api teṣāṃ sūtran nāsti sarvvadharmmā a○nātmāna iti /
syāt* mataṃ / naiva hi pudgalo dharmma ucyate nāpy anyo dharmmād iti / evaṃ tarhi na (6v.5)manovijñeyaḥ sidhyati / dvayaṃ pratītya vijñānasyotpāda○ḥ {/} ity avadhāraṇāt* /
iha caiva{ṃ} <kathaṃ> vikalpyate / anātmany ātmeti saṃjñāviparyās{ā}ś cittaviparyā(6v.6)so dṛṣṭiviparyāsa iti /
- anātmany ātmeti viparyāso na tv ātmani /
- kiñ ca punaḥ[30] {/} <a>nātmā </>[31]
- skandhāyatanadhātavaḥ /
- yat tāvad uktaṃ prāk* no tu vaktavyaṃ {/} rūpāṇi vā no (6v.7)veti tat tāvad

30 Read *punar*.
31 Read *kiṃ ca punar anātmā /*.

aśocaṃ[32] / uktaṃ ca sūtrāntare ye kecit* bhikṣavaḥ śramaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā ātmeti samanupaśyantaḥ samanupaśyanti {/} sarve ta imān iva[33] pañcopā-
(22A, Ⅳ)(7r.1)dānask<andh>ān iti / tasmāt sarvva evānātmany ātmagrāhaḥ /{/} tathoktaṃ / ye kecid anekavidhaṃ pūrvanivāsaṃ samanusmarantaḥ samanusmārṣuḥ samanusmaranti samanusmariṣyanti (7r.2)vā punaḥ sarve ta imān eva paṃcopādānaskandhān iti /
- yady evam idaṃ kasmād āha rūpavān aham abhūvam atīte (')dhvanīti /
- evam anekavidhaṃ ye samanusmarantīti pra(7r.3)darśayati / yadi tu rūpavantaṃ pudgalaṃ paśye<t> / satkāyadṛṣṭi○prasaṃgaḥ syāt* / apāṭha eva tv atra śaraṇaṃ syāt* / tasmāt* prajñaptisat pudgalo rāśidhārā<di>vat* /

{%Skt 9-21}

- ya(7r.4)dy eva{ṃ}n tarhi na buddhaḥ sarvvajñaḥ prāpnoti / na hi kiṃcic citta○m asti caittā vā yat sarvaṃ jānīyāt* kṣaṇikatvāt(*) / pudgalas tu jānīyāt* /
- evan tarhi cittavi;(7r.5)nāśe pudgalasyāvināśābhyupagamāt* {/} nityatvam asyābhyu○petaṃ bhavati / naiva ca vayaṃ sarvatra jñānasaṃmukhībhāvād buddhaṃ sarvvajñam ācakṣmahe </> kin tarhi </> (7r.6)sāmarthyāt* / yā hy asau buddhākhyā santatis tasyā idam asti sāmarthyaṃ yad ābhogamātreṇāvipar{i}ī{{..}}taṃ[34] jñānam utpadyate yatreṣṭaṃ // āha cātra /

santānena samarthatvā(7r.7)d yathāgniḥ sarvabhuṅ mataḥ /
tathā sarvavid eṣṭavyo na sakṛt sarva{sya}vedanāt* //

- katham idaṃ gamyate /
- atītādivacanāt* /

ye cābhyatītāḥ saṃbuddhā ye ca buddhā anāgatā-
(22B, Ⅳ)(7v.1)ḥ /

yaś caitarhi[35] saṃbuddho bahūnāṃ śokanāśana[36] <//> iti /
skandhā eva ca traiyadhvikā iṣyante na pudgalā yuṣmābhiḥ /

---

32 Read *apoḍhaṃ*.
33 Read *eva*.
34 Read *-viparītaṃ*.
35 Read *ca etarhi*.
36 Read *śokanāśanaḥ*.

{%Skt 9-22}

- yadi skandhā eva pudgalaḥ kasmād idam āha / bhāraṃ ca vo bhi(7v.2)kṣavo deśayiṣyāmi bhārādānaṃ ca bhāranikṣepaṇaṃ ca bhārahāraṃ ceti /
- kasmād idaṃ na vaktavyaṃ syāt* /
- na hi bhāra eva bhārahāro yuktaḥ /
- kiṃ kāraṇaṃ /
- na hy evaṃ dṛśya(7v.3)ta iti /
- avaktavyo (')pi na yuktaḥ /
- kiṃ kāraṇaṃ </>
- na hy evaṃ dṛśya○te / bhārādānasyāpi skandhāsaṃgrah{ā}prasaṃgāc ca //

ity artham eva bhāra{ṃ}hāraṃ nirdideśa bhaga(7v.4)vān* / yo (')sāv āyuṣmān evannāmā yāvad evaṃcirasthi○tika evamāyuḥparyantaḥ sa eva yathā vijñāyeta / mānyathā vijñāyi nityo vā avaktavyo[37] (7v.5)veti / skandhā eva ca skandhānām upaghātāya samvarttante {/} pū○rvakā uttareṣām iti bhārañ ca bhārahārañ ca kṛtvoktāḥ / upaghātārtho hi bhāra iti /

{%Skt 9-23}

- a(7v.6)sty eva pudgalo yasmād uktaṃ nāsti satva upapāduka iti mithyādṛṣṭiḥ /
- kaś caivam āha nāsti satva upapāduka iti / satvas tu yathāsti tathā[38] vibhakto bhagava(7v.7)teti brūmo[39] {mānuṣyakasūtre} / tasmād yaḥ paratropapādukasatvākhyaskandhasaṃtānāpavādaṃ karoti {/} tasyaiṣā mithyādṛṣṭir nāsti satva upapāduka iti /

(22A, V)(8r.1)skandhānām upapāduka{ka}tvāt* /

athaiṣā mithyādṛṣṭiḥ pudgalāpavādikā satī kiṃprahātavyā bhavet* / na hy eṣā darśanabhāvanāprahātavyā yujyate / pudgalasya (8r.2)satveṣv[40]

---

37 Read *vāvaktavyo*.
38 Read *tathāsti yathā*.
39 Read *brūmaḥ*.
40 Read satyeṣv.

<an>antarbhāvāt(*) /

ekaḥ pudgalo loka utpadyamāna utpadyate iti vacanāt(*) na skandhā iti cet(*) / na </> samudāye (')py ekopacārād ekatilaikataṇḍulavat* / (8r.3)ekarāśyekavacanavac ca /

{%Skt 9-24}

- saṃskṛta iti vā pudgalo vakta○vya utpattimattvābhyupagamāt(*) /
- na sa evam utpadyate yathā skandhā apūrvvaprādurbhāvāt* /
- kin tarhi </> (8r.4)
- skandhāntaropādānāt(*) / yathā yājñiko jāto vaiyāka○raṇo jāta ity ucyate vidyopādānāt* / bhikṣur jātaḥ parivrājako jāta iti liṃgopā(8r.5)dānāt* / vṛddho jāto vyādhito jāta ity avasthāntaro;○pādānād iti /
- na </> pratikṣepāt* /

sūtra eva hi pratikṣiptaṃ bhagavatā paramārthaśūnyatāyāṃ / (8r.6)iti hi bhikṣavo (')sti karmmāsti vipākaḥ kārakas tu nopalabhyate / ya imāṃś ca skandhān nikṣipati {/} anyāṃś ca skandhān* pratisandadhāty anyatra carmmasaṃketād[41] i(8r.7)ti </> ph(ā)lgu<na>sūtre[42] coktaṃ /{/} upādatta iti phagnuṃ[43] na vadāmīti /

tasmān nāsti skandhānāṃ kaścid upādātā / nāpi nikṣiptā /

kañ ca tāvad bhavān pākṣikaṃ[44] yāvad vyā-(22B, V)(8v.1)dhi<ta>m adhimucyate dṛṣṭā<n>taṃ karoti /

pudgalaṃ yadi so (')siddhaḥ /

atha cittacaittān(*) / teṣāṃ pratikṣaṇam apūrvvotpattir eva /

atha śarīraṃ / tasyāpi tathā śarīravidyāliṃ(8v.2)gavac ca skandhapudgalayor anyatvam āpadyate / jīrṇṇa śarīrāntaram eva vyādhitaṃ ca </> pratiṣiddho hi sāṃkhyīyaḥ pariṇāmavādaḥ /

tasmād adṛṣṭāntā ete /

---

41 Read *dharmma-*.
42 Read *phālgunasūtre*.
43 Read *phālguna*.
44 Read *yājñikaṃ*.

{%Skt 9-25}

- yadi ca skan;(8v.3)dhānām apūrvotpādo na pudgalasyeṣyate / so (')nyaś ca; ○ tebhyo nityaś ca sphuṭaṃ dīpito bhavati / pañca skandhā ekaḥ pudgala iti brūvatā {/} katham anya(8v.4)tvan nocyate /
- kathaṃ tāvat* bhūtāni catvāri rūpaṃ tv ekaṃ; ○ na ca bhūtebhyo (')nyad rūpaṃ /
- pākṣika eṣa doṣaḥ /
- katamesmin[45] pakṣe /
- bhūtamātrikapakṣe / (8v.5)tathāpi tu yathā bhūtamātraṃ rūpam evaṃ skandhamātraṃ pudgala ○ ity abhyupetaṃ bhavati /

{%Skt 9-26}

- yadi skandhamātraṃ pudgalaḥ kasmāt* bhagavatā sa jīvas tac charīram a;(8v.6)nyo veti na vyākṛtaṃ /
- praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā / sa hi jīvadravyam ekam anta<r>vyāpārapuruṣam adhikṛtya pṛṣṭavān(*) / sa ca kasmiṃś cin nāstīti katham asyānya(8v.7)tvam ananyatvaṃ vā vyākriyatām(*) / kaurmasyeca[46] romṇaḥ kha{{ta}}ratā mṛdutā vā /

eṣa ca granthaḥ pūrvvakair eva nirmmocitaḥ / sthaviro hi nāgasenaḥ kaliṃgena[47] rā-
(22A, VI)(9r.1)jñopasaṃkramyoktaḥ /

pṛccheyam ahaṃ bhadantam </> bahuvāllakāś[48] ca śramaṇā bhavanti / yadi yad eva pṛccheyaṃ tad eva vyākuryā iti / pṛcchety uktaḥ pṛṣṭavān* / kin tu[49] sa jīvas tac charīram anyo (9r.2)jīvo (')nyac charīram iti / avyākṛtam etad ity avo{ṃ}cat* sthaviraḥ / sa āha / nanu bhadantaḥ pūrvvam eva pratijñāṃ kārito nānyad vyākarttavyam iti / kim idam anyad evokta(9r.3)m avyākṛtam etad iti / sthavira āha / aham api mahārā○jaṃ pṛccheyaṃ / bahuvollakāś ca

45 Read *katamasmin*.
46 Read *kaurmasyeva*.
47 Read *milindena*.
48 Read *bahuvollakāś*.
49 Read *nu*.

rājāno bhavanti / yadi yad eva pṛccheyaṃ tad eva{ṃ} vyākuryā iti </> (9r.4)pṛcchety uktaḥ pṛṣṭavān(*) / yas te (')ntaḥpure āmravṛkṣas ○ tasya kim amlāni phalāni {/} āhosvit madhurāṇīti / naiva mamāntaḥpure kaścid ām{b}ravṛkṣo (')stī;(9r.5)ty āha / nanu mayā pūrvvam eva mahārājaḥ pratijñāṃ k(ā)ri;○to nānyad vyākarttavyam iti / kim idaṃm anyad evoktam āmra eva nāstīti / sa āha / katham asato vṛkṣa(9r.6)sya phalānām amlatām madhuratāṃ vā vyākaromīti / evam eva mahārāja sa eva jīvo nāsti kuto (')sya śarīrād anyatām ananyatāṃ vā vyākaromīti/

{%Skt 9-27}

- kasmāt* bhagavatā (')pi nokta(ṃ) (9r.7)nāsty eveti /
- praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā / sa hi yasyāpi skandhasantānasya jīva ity ākhyā tasyāpy abhāvaṃ pratīyād iti mithyādṛṣṭiṃ pātitaḥ syāt* /
pratīt<y>asamutpādasyājñānā-
(22B, VI)(9v.1)t* / sa ca taddeśanāyā a{{ā}}kṣamaḥ /

itaś caitad evaṃ niścīyate / yat* bhagavatoktaṃm asty ātmety ānanda vatsasagotrāya parivrājakāya praśnaṃ pṛṣṭo vyākuryān nanv akalpaṃ syād va(9v.2)canāya / sarvvadharmmā anātmāna iti / nāsty ātmaity[50] ānanda vatsa{{ṣa}}sagotrāya parivrājakāya praśnaṃ pṛṣṭo vyākuryāṃ nanu vatsasagotraḥ parivrājakaḥ pūrvvam eva saṃmūḍho bhū(9v.3)yasyā mātrayā saṃmoham āpadyeta / abhūt me ātmā sa me eta○rhi nāstīti / asty ātmety ānanda śāśvatāya pareti[51] / nāsty ātmety ānandocchedāya paraitīti vi(9v.4)staraḥ /

āha cātra /

dṛṣṭid{r}aṃṣṭrāvabhedañ ca bhraṃśañ cāpekṣya ka○rmmaṇāṃ /
deśayanti jinā dharmmaṃ vyāghrīpotāpahāravat* /</>
ātmāstitvaṃ hy upagato bhinn{e}ḥ syād dṛ(9v.5)ṣṭid{r}aṃṣṭrayā /
bhraṃśaṃ kuśalapotasya kuryād aprāpya saṃvṛtim[52] <//> i○ti /{/}

punar āha /

---

50 Read *ātmety*.
51 Read *paraiti*.
52 Read *saṃvṛtiṃ*.

asatvād bhagavān <jīvaṃ> tattvānyatvena nāvadat* /
nāstīty api {va}ca nāvocan mā bhūt* pr(ā)jña(9v.6)ptiko (')py
asan* /</>
yatra hi skandhasantāne śubhāśubhaphalāstitā /
jīvākhyā tatra sā na syāt* jīvanāstitvadeśanāt* //
prajñaptimātraṃ skandheṣu jīva ity api nāvadat* /
(9v.7)abhavyaḥ śūnyatāṃ boddhuṃ tadānīn tādṛśo janaḥ //
tathā hy ātmāsti nāstīti pṛṣṭo vāstyena[53] nāvadat* /
āśayāpekṣayā praṣṭuḥ sati tv astīti nāha kiṃ //

{%Skt 9-28}

- śāśvatalokā-

(22A, Ⅶ)(10r.1)dīnām apy avyākaraṇaṃ praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā / yadi hi tāvad ātmā loka iṣṭaḥ syāt tasyābhāvād ayuktaṃ caturddhā vyākaraṇaṃ / atha sarva eva saṃsāro lokas tasyāpy ayuktaṃ </>

śā(10r.2)śvate loke na kasya cit* parinirvāṇaṃ prāpnuyāt* / aśāśvate sarveṣām ucchedaḥ prāpnuyāt* / ubhayathātve niyamata e{{ṣo}}keṣāṃ parinirvāṇaṃ prāpnuyāt* {/} ekeṣān na (10r.3) / anubhayathātve naiva parinirvāṇan nāparinirvāṇ{ā}ṃ prā;○pnuyāt* /

ato mārgādhīnatvāt* parinirvāṇasya caturddhāpi niyamo na vyākriyate / ni<r>granthaśrā(10r.4)vakavaṭabhavat*[54] /

ata evāntavān loka iti catuṣkāvyāka○raṇam / tulyārtho hy eṣa catuṣkaḥ / tathā hi uktitaḥ[55] {/} parivrājaka eva[56] catuṣkaṃ pṛṣṭvā punaḥ pṛṣṭa(10r.5)vān* / kin nu sarvo loko (')nena mārgeṇa niryāty āhosvi○d ekadeśo lokasyeti // sthavira ānanda āha / yam eva tva{m}m uktika {tat} prathamato bhagava(10r.6)nta{ṃ}m praśna(ṃ) pṛṣṭavāṃs tam evaitarhi pṛcchasy anena paryāyeṇeti {sarvaṃ} </>

bhavati tathāgataḥ {/} param maranād ity api catuṣkaḥ {/} praṣṭur

---

53 Read *vātsyena*.
54 Read *nirgranthaśrāvakacaṭakavat*.
55 Read *uktikaḥ*.
56 Read *etaṃ*.

āśayāpekṣayā na vyākṛtaḥ / sa hi muktvā(10r.7)tmānaṃ[57] tathāgataṃ kṛtvā pṛṣṭavān* /

{%Skt 9-29}

- paudgalikas tu paryanuyojyaḥ kiṃ kāraṇaṃ bhagavān jīvantaṃ pudgalam astīti vyākaroti paraṃ maraṇān na vyākarotīti /
- śāśvata-
(22B, Ⅶ)(10v.1)doṣaprasaṃga....[58] /
- idan tarhi kasmād vyākaroti / bhaviṣyasi tvaṃ maittraiyānāgate[59] (')dhvani tathāgato (')rhan samyak*saṃbuddha iti / kasmāc ca śrāvakam abhyatītaṃ kālagatam upapa(10v.2)ttau vyākaroty amuko (')mutropapanna iti / evam api hi śāśvatatvaprasaṅgaḥ /

yadi ca bhagavān* pūrvaṃ pudgalaṃ dṛṣṭvā parinirvṛtam punaḥ <na> paśyaty ajñānān na vyakarotīti sarvva(10v.3)jñatvaṃ śāstur utpāditaṃ[60] bhavati / na vā so (')stīty abhyupagantavyaṃ /○

atha paśyaty anucyamāno (')py asāv asti {/} śāśvataś ceti siddhaṃ bhavati /

athaitad api na vaktavyam paśya(10v.4)ti vā na veti / evan tarhi idam api śanaiḥ śanair avaktavyaṃ kri○yatāṃ sarvajño vā {na} {{vā}} bhagavān na veti /
- asty eva pudgalo yasmāt satyataḥ sthitito nāsti {/} me ā(10v.5)tmeti dṛṣṭisthānam uktaṃ /
- astīty api dṛṣṭisthānam uktaṃ / tasmād a○jñāpakam etat(*) /

ubhayam api tv etad antagrāhadṛṣṭiḥ[61] śāśvatocchedadṛṣṭisaṃgṛhītam ity (ā)bhidh{ā}(10v.6)rmmikāḥ / tathaiva ca yuktam / as<t>y ātmety ānanda śāśvatāya paraiti nāsty ātmety ānandocchedāya paraitīti {/} vātsyasūtre vacanāt* /

{%Skt 9-30}

---

57 Read *muktam ātmānaṃ*.
58 Read *śāśvatadoṣaprasaṅgaḥ*.
59 Read *maitreyānāgate*.
60 Read *utsāditaṃ*.
61 Read *antagrahaṇaṃ*.

- yadi tarhi pudgalo nāsti ka eṣa saṃs{ā}ra(10v.7)ti / na hi saṃsāre[62] eva saṃsaratīti yuktaṃ /{/} uktañ ca bhagavatā avidyānivaraṇānāṃ satvānāṃ saṃdhāvatāṃ saṃsaratām iti /
- atha pudgalaḥ kathaṃ saṃsarati /
- skandhāntaratyāgo-
(22A, Ⅷ)(11r.1)pādānāt* /
- uktottara eṣa pakṣaḥ / yathā tu kṣaṇiko (')gniḥ santatyā saṃsaratīty[63] ucyate tathā satvākhyaḥ skandhasamudāyas tṛṣṇopādānaḥ {/} saṃsaratīty ucyate </>
- yadi skandhamātram ida[ṃ] kasmā(11r.2)d āha bhagavān aham eva sa tena kālena tena samayena sunetro nāma śāstā (')bhūvam iti /
- kasmān na vaktavyaṃ syāt* /
- anyatvāt* skandhānāṃ /
- atha kim pudgalaḥ </> sa evāsau śāśvato (11r.3)hi[64] syāt* / tasmād aham eva sa ity ekasaṃtānatāṃ darśayati / ○ yathā sa evāgnir dahann āgata iti /

yadi cātmā bhavet tathāgatā eva suvyaktaṃ paśyeyuḥ / paśyatāṃ cātma(11r.4)grāho dṛḍhataraḥ syād ātmasnehaś ca / ātmani ca saty ātmīyaṃ; ○ bhavatīti sūtre vacanād ātmagrāho (')py eṣāṃ skandheṣv adhikaṃ pravartteta / saiṣā(ṃ) syāt sat*kāyadṛṣṭiḥ / (11r.5)ātmīyadṛṣṭau ca satyām ātmīyasnehaḥ / evam eṣāṃ dṛḍhatarātmātmīyasnehaparisāditabandhanānāṃ[65] mokṣo dūrata{{ā}}rībhavet(*) /

atha mataṃ / naivātmani pravarttate (11r.6)sneha iti / tat* ka idānīm eṣa yogo yad anātmany ātmādhimokṣāt(*) sneha utpadyate {/} ātmany eva tu notpadyate / tasmāt* <tasya> dṛṣṭyarbuda{{ā}}m etasmin(*) {{śā}}≪chā≫sane[66] utpannaṃ ya (11r.7)eṣa ekeṣāṃ pudgalagrāha ekeṣāṃ sarvanāstitāgrāhaḥ / ye (')pi ca dravyāntaram evā{{sau}}tmānam manyante tīrthakarās teṣām eṣa mokṣ(ā)bhāvadoṣo niṣkampaḥ /

{%Skt 9-31}

---

62 Read *saṃsāra.*
63 Read ***saṃcaratīty.***
64 Read *śāśvataḥ tarhi.*
65 Read *-**parigṛhīta**-.*
66 Read *etasmiñ chāsana.*

- yadi tarhi sarva-
(22B, Ⅷ)(11v.1)thāpi nāsty ātmā katham kṣaṇikeṣu citteṣu cirānubhūtasyārthasya smaraṇam bhavati / pratyabhijñānam vā </>
- smṛtiviṣayasaṃjñānvay<ā>c cittaviśeṣāt* /
- kīdṛśāc cittaviśeṣāt* /
- ya;(11v.2){{.o}}to (')nantaram smṛtir bhavati tadābhogasadṛśa-
sambandhisaṃjñādimato (')nupahataprabhāvād āśrayaviśeṣaśokavyākṣepādibhiḥ /
tādṛśo (')pi hy atadanvayaś cittaviśeṣo {{..}} na (11v.3)samarthaḥ {/} tām smṛtiṃ bhavayituṃ / tadanvayo (')pi cānyādṛśo na sa○marthas tām smṛtiṃ bhavayitum / ubhayathā tu samartha ity evaṃ smṛtir bhavaty anyasyāṃ[67]
<tat>sāmarthyādarśanāt* / (11v.4)
- katham idānīm anyena cetasā dṛṣṭam anyat smarati / evaṃ hi
de○vadattacetasā dṛṣṭaṃ yajñadatta{ṃ}cetaḥ smaret* /
- nāsambandhāt* /[68] na hi tayoḥ sambandho (')sti akāryakā(11v.5){ryakā}-
raṇabhāvād yathaikasāntānikayoḥ / na ca brūmo (')nyena ○ cetasā dṛṣṭam anyat smaratīti / api tu darśanacittāt smṛticittam anyad utpadyate {/} santatipariṇatyā (11v.6)yathoktam iti ka evaṃ sati doṣaḥ /
smaraṇād eva ca pratyabhijñānaṃ bhavati /
- asaty ātmani ka eṣa[69] smarati /
- smaratīti ko 'rthaḥ /
- smṛtyā viṣayaṃ gṛhnāti /
- kin tat*grahaṇam[70] anyat sma(11v.7)raṇāt* /
- smṛtin tarhi {kaḥ} karoti /
- uktaḥ sa {{..}} yas tāṃ karoti / smṛtihetucittaviśeṣaḥ[71] /
- yat tarhi caitraḥ smaratīty ucyate /
- tato hi caitrākhyāt santānāt tāṃ
bhavantīṃ dṛṣṭvocya-
(22A1, Ⅰ)(12r.1)te caitraḥ smaratīti /

---

67 Read *anyasya*.
68 Read *na / asambandhāt /*.
69 Read *evaṃ*.
70 Read *tadgrahaṇam*.
71 Read *smṛtihetuś cittaviśeṣaḥ*.

- asaty ātmani kasyeyaṃ smṛtiḥ /
- kimarthaiṣā ṣaṣṭhī </>
- svāmyarthā /
- yathā kasya kaḥ svāmī /
- yathā goś caitraḥ /
- katham asau tasyāḥ svāmī /
- tadadhīno hi tasyā vāhado(12r.2)hādiṣu viniyogaḥ /
- kva ca punaḥ smṛtir viniyoktavyā ya<ta> e{vaṃ }tasyāḥ svāmī mṛgyate /
- smarttavye (')rthe /
- kimartham viniyoktavyā </>
- smaraṇārthaṃ /
- aho sūktāni sukhaidhitānāṃ / saiva hi (12r.3)nāma tadarthaṃ viniyoktavyeti / kathaṃ ca viniyoktavyā / ut*○pādanata āhosvit saṃpreṣaṇataḥ /
- smṛtigatyayogād utpādanataḥ /
- hetur eva tarhi svāmī prā(12r.4)pnoti phalam eva ca svaṃ / yasmād dhetor ādhipatyaṃ phale phalena ○ ca tadvān(*) hetur iti / yo hy eva hetuḥ smṛtes tasyaivāsau /

yaś cāpi sa caitrābhidhānaḥ saṃskārasamū(12r.5)hasantāna ekato gṛhītvā gavākhyasvāmīty ucyate sa cāpi tasya de○śāntaravikārotpattau kāraṇabhāvaṃ cetasi kṛtvā na tu khalu kaścid ekaś caitro nāmāsti na cāpi gauḥ / (12r.6)tasmāt tatrāpi na hetubhāvaṃ vyatītyāsti svāmibhāvaḥ /

evaṃ ko vijānāti kasya vijñānam ity evamādiṣu vaktavyaṃ / tasya hetur indriyārthamanaskārā yathāyogam ity eṣa viśeṣaḥ (12r.7)/

{%Skt 9-32}

- yo (')py āha / bhāvasya bhavitrapekṣatvāt* {/} sarvo hi bhāvo bhavitāraṃ apekṣute[72] / yathā devadatto gacchatīty atra gatir bhāvo gantāraṃ devadattam apekṣate / tathā vijñānaṃ [bhā]vaḥ / tasmā-
(22B1, I)(12v.1)d yo vijānāti tena bhavitavyam iti / sa vaktavyaḥ / ko 'yaṃ devadatta iti /

---

72 Read *apekṣate*.

yady ātmā sa eva sādhyaḥ / atha vyavahārapuruṣaḥ so (')pi na kaścid ekaḥ saṃskārā hi ta evannāmānaḥ / tatra (12v.2)yathā devadatto gacchati tathā vijānāti </>

- kathaṃ ca devadatto gacchati /

- kṣaṇikā hi saṃskārā abhinnasantānā devadatta iti bālair ekasatvapiṇḍa-grāheṇādhimuktāḥ svasya santā(12v.3)nasya deśāntare[73] kāraṇaṃ bhavanta ucyante gacchati devadatta i○ti / sā ca deśāntarotpattir ggatir iti </> jvālāśabdasantānayor ggacchatāgamanābhidhānavat*[74] /

ta eva (12v.4)ca punar vijñānasya kāraṇaṃ bhavanta ucyante jānāti[75] devadatta ○ iti / āryair api teṣāṃ saṃjñayā tathocyante vyavahārārthaṃ /

{%Skt 9-33}

- yat tarhi vijñānaṃ vijānātīti sūtra uktaṃ (12v.5)kin tatra vijñānaṃ karoti /

- na kiñcit karoti / yathā tu kāryaṃ; ○ k(ā)raṇam anuvidhīyata ity ucyate / sādṛśyenātmalā<bhā>d akurvvad api kiṃcit(*) </> evaṃ vijñānam api vijānā(12v.6)tīty[76] ucyate / sādṛśyenātmalābhād akurvvad api kiṃcit(*) /

- kiṃ punar asya sādṛśyan[77] </>

- tādākāratā{ṃ}[78] / ata eva tad indriyād apy utpannaṃ viṣayaṃ vijānātīty ucyate nendriyaṃ /

atha vā ta(12v.7)thā (')trāpi vijñānasantānasya vijñāne kāraṇabhāvād vijñānaṃ vijānātīti vacanan nirdoṣaṃ kāraṇe karttṛśabdanirdeśāt* </> ghaṇṭā rautīti yadvat* /

api khalu yathā pra-

(22A1, II)(13r.1)dīpo gacchati / tathā vijñānaṃ vijānātīti /

- kathañ ca pradīpo gacchati /

- pradīpa ity arceṣāṃ[79] santāna upacaryate / sa deśāntareṣūtpadyamānas tan tad

---

73 Read *deśāntarotpattau.*
74 Read *gacchatigamanābhidhānavat.*
75 Read *vijānāti.*
76 Read *viṣayaṃ vijānātiity.*
77 Read *sādṛśyaṃ.*
78 Read *tadākāratā.*
79 Read *arciṣāṃ.*

deśaṃ[80] gacchatīty ucyate / evam vijñā(13r.2)nam api cittānāṃ santāna upacaryate / tad viṣayāntareṣūtpadyamānaṃ tam viṣayaṃ[81] vijānātīty ucyate /

yathā cābhijāyate[82] tiṣṭhati rūpam ity atra bhavitur bhāvād anarthāntaratvam evaṃ (13r.3)vijñānasyāpi syāt* /

{%Skt 9-34}

- yadi vijñānād* vijñānam utpadyate nā○tmanaḥ / kasmān na nityaṃ tādṛśam evotpadyate / na ca kramaniyamenāṃkurakāṇḍapatrādivat(*) /
- sthitya(13r.4)nyathātvasya saṃskṛtalakṣaṇatvāt* / eṣa hi <sarva>saṃskṛtasya svabhāvo; ○ yad avaśyaṃ prabandhasyānyathātvaṃ bhavati / anyathā hi nikāmadhyānasamāhitānāṃ sadṛśakāyaci(13r.5)ttotpattau prathamakṣaṇa-nirviśeṣatvāt* paścād api na syāt sva;○yaṃ vyutthānam /

kramo (')pi hi cittānāṃ niyata eva {/} yato notpattavyaṃ[83] tata eva tasyotpādāt(*) /

tulyākā(13r.6)ram api hi kiṃcidu<t>pād{ā}ne samarthaṃ bhavati gotra-viśeṣāt* </> tadyathā strīcittānantaraṃ yadi tat(*)kāyavidūṣaṇācittam utpannaṃ bhavati / tatpatiputrādicittam vā / punaś ca paścā(13r.7)t santatipariṇatyā strīcittam utpadyate / tat samarthaṃ bhavati tat*kāyavidūṣaṇā-cittotpādane tat(*)patiputrādicittotpādane vā / tat*gotratvāt*[84] /
anyathā na sama-
(22B1, Ⅱ)(13v.1)rthaṃ /

atha punaḥ paryāyeṇa strīcittād bahuvidhañ cittam utpannam <tato yad> bahutaram <paṭutaram> āsannataram vā tad evotpadyate / tat*bhāvanāyā balīyastvāt(*) / anyatra tat(*)kālikāt kāyabāhyapra(13v.2)tyayaviśeṣāt* /
- saiva balīyasī bhāvanā kasmān nityan na phalati /
- sthityanyathātvasya saṃskṛtalakṣaṇatvāt* / tasya cānyathātvasyānyabhāvanā-phalotpattāv ānuguṇyāt* / (13v.3)

etad dhi sarvvacittaprakāreṣu diṅmātraṃ / nirantarakāraṇa○jñāne tu

---

80 Read *taṃ taṃ deśaṃ.*
81 Read *taṃ taṃ viśayaṃ.*
82 Read *vā bhavati.*
83 Read *yad utpattavyaṃ.*
84 Read *tadgotratvāt.*

buddhānāṃ prabhutvaṃ // evaṃ hy āhuḥ /

sarvākārakāraṇam ekasya mayūracandrakasyāpi /

nā(13v.4)sarvvajñair jñeyaṃ sarvajñabalaṃ hi ta<j>jñānam[85] <//> iti /

prāg evārūpi○ṇāṃ cittabhedānāṃ /

{%Skt 9-35}

- ya eva tv ayam ekīyas tīrthika ātmaprabhavāṃ cittotpattiṃ manyate / tasyaivedaṃ (13v.5)sphuṭaṃ codyam āpadyate / kasmān na nityaṃ tādṛśam evotpadyate ○ / na ca kramaniyamenāṃkurakāṇḍapattrādivad[86] iti /

manaḥsaṃyogaviśeṣāpekṣatvād iti cet* / (13v.6)na / anyasaṃyogāsiddheḥ / saṃyoginos tu paricchinnatvād aprāptipūrvikā prāptiḥ {/} saṃyoga iti lakṣaṇavyākhyānāc cātmanaḥ paricchedaprasaṃgaḥ /

tato manaḥsaṃcārād ātma(13v.7)naḥ sañcāraprasaṃgo virāgasya[87] vā </> pradeśasaṃyoga iti cet* / na / tasyaiva tat*pradeśatvāyogāt(*) /

astu vā saṃyogas tathāpi nityam aviśiṣṭe manasi kathaṃ saṃyogaḥ; (22A1, Ⅲ)(14r.1)viśeṣaḥ[88] /

buddhiviśeṣāpekṣa iti cet* /{/} sa eva paricodyate / kathaṃ buddhiviśeṣa iti </>

saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣād ātma<ma>naḥsaṃyogād iti cet* / cittād evāstu saṃskā(14r.2)raviśeṣāpekṣ{atv}āt* / na hi kiṃcid ātmana upalabhya ⟨te⟩ sāmarthyam auṣa<dha>kāryasiddhāv ivi[89] kuhakavaidyaphuḥsvāhānām* /

saty ātmani tayo(ḥ) saṃyoga[90] iti cet* / vāṅmā;(14r.3)traṃ /

<ā>śrayaḥ sa iti cet(*) / yathā kaḥ kasyāśrayaḥ / na hi te ci○trabadarādivad ādhā<r>ye {/} nāpi {{ku}}sa kuḍyakuṇḍā{{ni}}divad ādhāro yuktaḥ pratighātiyutado(14r.4)ṣāt* /

- naiva sa evamāśrayaḥ </>

- kathan tarhi / yathā gandhādīnāṃ pṛ○thivīti cet* / atiparitoṣitāḥ smaḥ /

---

85 Read *tajjñānaṃ*.
86 Read *-patrādivad*.
87 Read *vināśasya*.
88 Read *saṃyogaviśeṣaḥ*.
89 Read *iva*.
90 Read *saṃbhava*.

idam eva hi naḥ pratyāyakaṃ {/} nāsty ātmeti / <y>athā; (14r.5)na gandhādibhyo (')nyā pṛthivīti </> ko hi sa gandhādibhyo (')nyā(ṃ) pṛ○thivīṃ nirddhārayati / vyapadeśas tu pṛthivyā gandhādaya iti viśeṣaṇārthaṃ / te hy eva tadākhyā (14r.6)gandhādayo yathā pratīyeran nānya iti / kāṣṭhapratimāyāḥ śarīravyapadeśavat* /

saty api ca saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣatve kasmān na yugapat sarvvajñānotpattiḥ /

- yo (14r.7)hi baliṣṭhas tenānyeṣāṃ pratibandhaḥ </>

- sa eva baliṣṭhaḥ kasmān nityan na phalati / yo (')sya nyāyaḥ so (')stu bhāvanāyāḥ / ātmā tu nirarthakaḥ kalpyate /

avaśyam ātmābhyupaga-

(22B1, III)(14v.1)ntavyaḥ / smṛtyādīnāṃ guṇapadārthatvāt(*) / tasya cā{rthād a}vaśyaṃ dravyāśritatvāt(*) / teṣāṃ cānyāśrayāyogād iti cet* / na / asiddheḥ / na hy eṣāṃ guṇapadārthatvaṃ siddhaṃ / sarvvam e(14v.2)va no vidyamānaṃ dravyaṃ / ṣaṭ* dravyāṇi śrāmaṇyaphalānīti vacanāt* / nāpy eṣāṃ dravyāśritatvaṃ siddhaṃ / parīkṣito hy āśrayārthaḥ / tasmād yat(*) kiñcid eva tat(*) /

{%Skt 9-36}

- ātma(14v.3)ny asati kimarthaḥ {/} karmmārambhaḥ /
- ahaṃ sukhī syām ahaṃ {su}duḥkhī ○ na syām ity evamarthaḥ /
- ko (')sāv ahaṃ nāma /
- yadviṣayo (')yam ahaṃkāraḥ /
- <kiṃviṣayo 'yam ahaṃkāraḥ />
- skandhaviṣayaḥ /
- kathaṃ jñāyate </> (14v.4)
- teṣu snehāt(*) / gaurādibuddhibhiḥ {/} sāmānādhikaraṇyāc ca ○ / gauro (')ham ahaṃ śyāmaḥ / sthūlo (')ham ahaṃ kṛśaḥ / jīrṇo (')ham ahaṃ yuveti / gaurādibuddhibhi(14v.5)ḥ samānādhikaraṇo (')yam ahaṃkāro dṛśyate / na cātmana; ○ ete prakārā dṛṣyante[91] / tasmād api skandheṣv ayam iti gamyate /

ātmana upakārake (')pi śarī(14v.6)ra ātmopacāro yathā ya evāyaṃ sa evāhaṃ

---

91 Read *iṣyante*.

sa evāyaṃ me bhṛtya iti /
- bhavaty upakārake (')pi {/} ātmopa{{ā}}cāro na tv ahaṃkāraḥ </> sati śarīrālambanatve paraśarīrā(14v.7)lambano (')pi kasmān na bhavati /
- asambandhāt(*) / yenaiva hi sahāsya sambandhaḥ kāyena cittena vā / tatraivāyam ahaṃkāra utpadyate {/} nānyatra / anādau saṃsāra e-(22A1, Ⅳ)(15r.1)vam abhyāsāt* /
- kaś ca saṃbandhaḥ </>
- kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ /
- yady ātmā nāsti kasyāyam ahaṃkāraḥ /
- idaṃ punas tad evāyātaṃ / kimarthaiṣā ṣaṣṭhīti / yāvad ya evāsya {ca} hetus tasyai(15r.2)vāyam iti </>
- kaś cānyo[92] hetuḥ /
- pūrvvāhaṃkāraparibhāvitaṃ svasantativiṣayaṃ savidyacittaṃ[93] /
- asaty ātmani ka eṣa sukhito duḥkhito vā /
- yasminn āśraye sukham utpa(15r.3)nnaṃ duḥkhaṃ vā </> yathā puṣpito vṛkṣaḥ phalitam vanaṃm iti /
- kaḥ ○ punar anayor āśrayaḥ </>
- ṣaḍāyatanaṃ / yathā kṛtvā tathoktaṃ /

{%Skt 9-37}

- asaty ātmani ka eṣāṃ karmmaṇāṃ karttā (15r.4) kaś ca phalānāṃ bhoktā bhavati /
- kartteti <bhokteti vā> ka e.. vāhyārthaḥ /[94] ○
- karotīti karttā / bhuṃkta iti bhoktā /
- paryāya ucyate nārthaḥ </>
- svatantraḥ {/} karteti kartṛlakṣaṇa(15r.5)m ācakṣ{y}ate {/} lākṣaṇikāḥ / asti punaḥ kva cid eva kārye ○ kasya cit* svātantryaṃ loke dṛṣṭaṃ <yathā> devadattasya snānāsanagamanādau[95] /

---

92 Read *cāsya.*
93 Read *sāvadyacittaṃ.*
94 Read *karteti bhokteti vā ka eṣa vākyārthaḥ /.*
95 Read *snānādanagamanādau.*

- kaḥ[96] punar bhavān devada;(15r.6)ttem[97] udāharati / yady ātmānaṃ sa eva sādhyaḥ / atha pañcaska<ndha>kaṃ sa eva karttā </>

trividhaṃ cedaṃ karmma kāyavāṅmanaskarmma / tatra kāyakarmmaṇi tāvat* kāyasya cittaparatantrā (15r.7)vṛttiḥ / cittasyāpi kāye svakāraṇaparatantr{y}ā vṛttis tasyāpy evam iti nāsti kasya cit* <api> svātantryaṃ / pratyayaparatantrā hi sarve bhāvāḥ pravarttante /

ātmano (')pi ca
(22B1, Ⅳ)(15v.1)nirapekṣasyākāraṇatvābhyupagamān na svātantryaṃ sidhyati / tasmān naivaṃlakṣaṇa upalabhyate kaś cit karttā </>

yat tu yasya pradhānaṃ kāraṇaṃ tat tasya karttety ucyate / na ca ātma(15v.2)naḥ kva cid api kāraṇatvaṃ dṛśyate / tasmāt sa eva{{ā}}m api na karttā yujyate / smṛtijo hi cchandaḥ cchandajo vitarkko vitarkāt prayatnaḥ prayatnād vāyus tataḥ karmmeti kim a(15v.3)trātmā kurute /

phalasyāpi ca ka upabhogo yam ayam ātmā ○ kurvvann upabhoktā kalpyate / upalabdhir iti cet(*) / nātmana upalabdhau sāmarthyaṃ vijñāne
prati(15v.4)ṣedhāt(*) /
- asaty ātmani kasmād asatvādhiṣṭhānaḥ pāpapuṇyo○pacayo na bhavati /
- vedanādyanāśrayatvāt* / tadāśrayaś ca ṣaḍāyatanan nātmā </> yathā tathoktaṃ /

{%Skt 9-38}

- katha(15v.5)m asaty ātmani vinaṣṭāt karmmaṇa āyatyāṃ phalotpattiḥ /
- ā○tmany api sati kathaṃ vinaṣṭāt* karmmaṇa āyatyāṃ phalotpattiḥ /
- tadāśritād dharmmādharmmāt(*) /
- yathā (15v.6)kaḥ kimāśrita ity uktottaraiṣā vācoyuktiḥ / tasmād anāśritād eva dharmmādharmmāt* bhavatu / naiva tu vayam vinaṣṭāt* karmmaṇa āyatyāṃ phalotpattiṃ brūmaḥ /
- ki{r}n[98] tarhi </> (15v.7)
- tatsantatipariṇāmaviśeṣād bījaphalavat* / yathā bījāt phalam utpadyata ity

---

96 Read *kaṃ*.
97 Read *devadattam*.
98 Read *katham*.

ucyate / na ca tad vinaṣṭād bījād utpadyate / nāpy anantaram eva /
- kin tarhi </>
- tatsantatipa-
(22A, V)(16r.1)riṇāmaviśeṣād aṃkurakāṇḍapatrādikramaniṣpannāt*
puṣpāvasānāt* /
- tat punaḥ puṣpān niṣpannaṃ kasmāt tasya bījasya phalam ity ucyate /
- tadāhitaṃ hi tat* <paraṃ>parayā pu(16r.2)ṣpe sāmarthyaṃ / yadi hi tatpūrvikān[99] nābhaviṣyat(*) / tat tādṛśasya phalasyotopattau <na> samartham abhaviṣyat(*) / evaṃ karmmaṇaḥ phalam utpadyata ity ucyate / na ca tadvinaṣṭāt karma(16r.3)ṇa utpadyate nāpy anantaram eva </>
- kin[100] tarhi /
- tatsantatipari○ṇāmaviśeṣāt* /
- kā punaḥ santatiḥ kaḥ pariṇāmaḥ ko viś{{ā}}eṣaḥ /
- yaḥ karmmapūrvva uttarotta(16r.4)racittaprasavaḥ sā santatis tasyā anya<thānya>thotpattiḥ pariṇā○maḥ </> sa punar yo (')nantaraṃ phalotpādanasamarthaḥ so (')n{t}yapariṇāmaviśiṣṭatvāt* pariṇamavi(16r.5)śeṣaḥ / tadyathā sopādānam maraṇacittam punarbhavasya /

tri○vidhakarmmapūrvakatve[101] (')pi yat* karmma guru vā bhava{{ti}}ty āsannam abhyastam vā tākṛtaṃ[102] sāmārthya(ṃ) dyātya(16r.6)te[103] na tv anyasya / āha ca[104] /{/}

yat* guru yac cāsannaṃ yac cābhyastaṃ <pūrva>kṛtaṃ ca yat*[105] /
pūrvvaṃ pūrvvaṃ pūrvvaṃ vipacyate karmmasaṃsāre //

tatra vipākahetvāhitaṃ tu vipākaphaladānasāmarthyaṃ (16r.7)vipākaṃ datvā vinivarttate /

sabhāgahetvāhitan tu ni{ḥ}ṣyandaphaladānasāmarthyaṃ kliṣṭānāṃ pratipakṣodayād vinivarttate / akliṣṭānāṃ cittasantānātyantavini-
(22B1, V)(16v.1)vṛtter yadā parinirvāti /

---

99 Read *tatpūrvakaṃ*.
100 Read ***katham***.
101 Read *vividhakarmapūrvakatve*.
102 Read *tatkṛtaṃ*.
103 Read ***dyotyate***.
104 Read ***yathoktaṃ***.
105 Read ***tasya***(?).

{%Skt 9-39}

- atha kasmād vipākād vipākāntaraṃ notpadyate / bījaphalād iva phalāntaraṃ /
- na tāvat* dṛṣṭāntena sarvaṃ samānaṃ bhavati / tatrāpi tu na phalād eva (16v.2)punaḥ phalāntaram utpadyate /
- kin tarhi /
- viklittiviśeṣajād vikāraviśeṣāt* / yo hi tatra bhūtaprakārāṃkuran ni<r>varttayati / sa tasya bījaṃ nānyaḥ / bhāvinyā tu saṃjña(16v.3)yā sādṛśyād vā pūrvvako 'pi santāno bījam ity ākhyāyate / ○

evam ihāpi tasmād vipākād yadi sadasaddharmmaśramaṇādipratyayaviśeṣaja ḥ[106] kuśalasāsravo (16v.4)(')kuśalo vā cittavikāra utpadyate / tasmāt punar vvipākā○ntaram utpadyate nānyatheti samānam etat(*) /

atha vā punar etad evaṃ vijñātavyaṃ </> yayo[107] lākṣā(16v.5)rasarañjitāt mātuluṃgapuṣpāt santatipariṇāmaviśeṣajaḥ ○ phale raktaḥ keśara upajāyate / na ca tasmāt* punar anyaḥ / evaṃ karmmajād vipākāt(*) na punar vi(16v.6)pākāntaram iti /

yathāsthūlam idam asmadbuddhigamyan darśitaṃ / nānāvidhaśaktibhinnais tu karmmabhir adhivāsitāḥ santataya etām avasthāṃ gatā īdṛśaṃ phalam abhini<r>vartta(16v.7)yantīti buddhānām eva viṣayaḥ / āha khalv api /{/}

karmma tadbhāvanān tasyā vṛttilābhaṃ tataḥ phalaṃ /
niyamena prajānāti buddhād anyo na sarvvathā //

{%Skt 9-40}

ity etāṃ suvihita-
(23B1, Ⅷ)(17r.1)hetumārgaśuddhāṃ
buddhānāṃ pravacanadharmmatān niśamya[108] /
andhānāṃ vividhakudṛṣṭiceṣṭitānāṃ
tīrthyānām matam apavidya[109] yānty anandhāḥ //

---

106 Read *-śravaṇādi-*.
107 Read *yathā*.
108 Read *niśāmya*.

imāṃ hi nirvāṇapuraikava(17r.2)rtinīṃ
tathāgatādityavaco (')ṃśubhāsvatīm /
nirātmatām āryasahasravāhitāṃ
na mandacakṣur vivṛtām apīṣyate[110] //

iti diṅmātram evedam upadiṣṭaṃ sumedhasām /
vraṇadeśo(17r.3)viṣasyeva svasāmarthyavisarppaṇa[111] <//>
iti //◎

// 《sa》 pudga○lakośam abhidharmmakośabhāṣyaṃ samāptam iti //◎
// kṛtir iyam ācāryavasubandhupādā(17r.4)nām iti //

ye dharmm{ā}hetuprabhavā he//◎//tun te○ṣān tathāgato hy avadat /
teṣāñ ca yo niro//◎//<dha> evamvādī{{va}} mahāśramaṇaḥ //

---

109 Read *apavidhya*.
110 Read *apīkṣate*.
111 Read *visarpaṇaḥ*.

SANSKRIT TEXT
AND
TIBETAN TEXT:

A New Edition of the Sanskrit Text
Juxtaposed with
A Collated Text of the Tibetan Versions

{%Skt 9-1}[Pra. 46102-46105]{%Chn}[Z. 304a21-25; X. 152b24-27]

- kiṃ khalv ato 'nyatra mokṣo nāsti /[1]
- nāsti /
- kiṃ kāraṇam /
- vitathātmadṛṣṭiniviṣṭatvāt / na hi te skandhasaṃtāna evātmaprajñaptiṃ vyavasyanti /[2]
- kiṃ tarhi /
- dravyāntaram evātmānaṃ parikalpayanti / ātmagrāhaprabhavāś ca sarvakleśā[3] iti /

---

1 (Ejima:) kiṃ khalv ato 'nyatra mokṣo nāsti/. T(93b7): yaṅ ci ḥdi las gṣan la thar pa yod dam ṣe na/(=...asti).

2 (Ejima:) na hi te...vyavasyanti/. The subject "te" is left out in T(93b7), but not in Zhēn(304a22: 彼人).

3 (Ejima:) sarvakleśā. "sarva-" omitted in T(93b8), Yaś(697, 14), Pūr(366a3) and seemingly also in Xuán(152b27).

{%Tib 9-1}[C.83b3-4, D.82a1-2, N.94a3-4, P.93b7-8]

//yaṅ ci ḥdi las gṣan la thar pa yod dam ṣe na/

med do//

ciḥi phyir ṣe na/

bdag tu[4] lta ba phyin ci log la ṣen pa ñid kyi phyir te/ phuṅ poḥi rgyud kho na la bdag tu ḥdogs par[5] ni ṅes par mi ḥdsin to//

ḥo na ci ṣe na/

rdsas gṣan kho na la bdag tu yoṅs su rtogs par byed la/ ñon moṅs pa rnams ni bdag tu ḥdsin pa las rab tu skye ba yin no//

---

4 CP.tu=du

5 CD.par=pa

{%Skt 9-2}[Pra. 46105-46113]{%Chn}[Z. 304a25-304b8; X. 152b27-152c9]

- katham punar idaṃ gamyate / skandhasaṃtāna evedam ātmābhidhānaṃ vartate nānyasminn abhidheya iti /

- pratyakṣānumānābhāvāt /

ye hi dharmāḥ santi / teṣāṃ pratyakṣam upalabdhir bhavaty asaty antarāye / tadyathā ṣaṇṇāṃ viṣayāṇāṃ manasaś ca / anumānaṃ ca / tadyathā pañcānām indriyāṇām /

tatredam anumānam / sati kāraṇe kāraṇāntarasyābhāve kāryasyābhāvo dṛṣṭo bhāve ca punar bhāvas tadyathāṅkurasya / saty eva cābhāsaprāpte viṣaye manaskāre ca kāraṇe viṣayagrahaṇasyābhāvo dṛṣṭaḥ punaś ca bhāvo 'ndhabadhirādīnām anandhābadhirādīnāṃ ca / atas tatrāpi kāraṇāntarasyābhāvo bhāvaś ca niścīyate / yac ca tatkāraṇāntaraṃ tad indriyam ity etad anumānam /

na caivam ātmano 'stīti nāsty ātmā /

{%Tib 9-2}[C.83b4-7, D.82a2-6, N.94a4-94b1, P.93b8-94a5]

bdag tu mṅon par brjod pa ḥdi ni phuṅ poḥi[6] rgyud kho na la ḥjug gi/ brjod par bya ba gṣan la ni ma yin no[7] ṣes bya ba ḥdi ji ltar khoṅ du chud ce na/

mṅon sum daṅ/ rjes su dpag pa med paḥi phyir te/

chos gaṅ dag yod pa de dag ni[8] bar chad byed pa med na mṅon sum du dmigs pa yin te/ dper na[9] yul drug daṅ yid lta buḥo// yaṅ na rjes su dpag pas dmigs pa yin te/ dper na dbaṅ po lṅa[10] lta buḥo//

de la ḥdi ni rjes su dpag pa yin te/ rgyu yod kyaṅ rgyu gṣan med na ḥbras bu med par mthoṅ la yod na ni yaṅ yod par mthoṅ ba ste/ dper na myu gu lta buḥo// yul snaṅ bar gyur pa daṅ[11] rgyu yid la byed pa yod kyaṅ yul ḥdsin pa med par mthoṅ la/ yaṅ yod par mthoṅ ba ste/ loṅ ba daṅ ḥon pa la sogs paḥi[12] daṅ/ ma loṅ ba daṅ ma ḥon pa la sogs paḥi[13] lta buḥo// deḥi phyir de la yaṅ rgyu gṣan med pa daṅ/ yod par ṅes la/[14] rgyu gṣan gaṅ yin pa de ni dbaṅ po yin no ṣes bya ba ḥdi ni rjes su dpag pa yin no//

bdag ni de ltar yod pa ma yin pas bdag med do//

---

6 NP.poḥi=po
7 NP.no=no//
8 NP.ni=na
9 N.inserts / after *na*
10 CD.omit *lṅa*
11 N.inserts / after *daṅ*
12 CD.paḥi=pa
13 CD.paḥi=pa
14 N.omits / after *la*

{%Skt 9-3}[Pra. 46114-46119]{%Chn}[Z. 304b8-16; X. 152c9-16]

- yat tarhi vātsīputrīyāḥ pudgalaṃ santam icchanti / vicāryaṃ tāvad etat / kiṃ te dravyata icchanty āhosvit prajñaptitaḥ /
- kiṃ cedaṃ[15] dravyata iti kiṃ vā prajñaptitaḥ /
- rūpādivat bhāvāntaraṃ cet dravyataḥ / kṣīrādivat samudāyaś cet prajñaptitaḥ /
- kiṃ cātaḥ /
- yadi tāvat dravyataḥ / sa bhinnasvabhāvatvāt[16] skandhebhyo 'nyo vaktavya itaretaraskandhavat / kāraṇaṃ cāsya vaktavyam / asaṃskṛto vā / atas tīrthikadṛṣṭiprasaṅgo niṣprayojanatvaṃ ca /

atha prajñaptitaḥ / vayam apy evaṃ brūmaḥ /

---

15 (Lee:) cedaṃ. Cf. Yaś(699, 9): kiṃ vedaṃ dravyata iti kiṃ vā prajñaptita iti....

16 (Ejima:) Pra: saṃbhinnasvabhāvatvāt. Ms: *sic.* T(94a7): de raṅ bṣin tha dad paḥi phyir. Yaś(699, 18): sa pudgalo bhinnasvabhāvatvāt.

Read "*sa bhinnasvabhāvatvāt*".

{%Tib 9-3}[C.83b7-84a3, D.82a6-82b2, N.94b1-4, P.94a5-94b1]

ḥo na gaṅ gnas maḥi bu rnams gaṅ zag yod par ḥdod pa ji lta bu/ ḥdi ni re ṣig dpyad par bya ba yin te/ ci de dag rdsas su ḥdod dam/ ḥon te btags par ḥdod/[17]

rdsas su ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ[18] ci ṣig/ btags par ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ ci ṣig yin//

gal te gzugs la sogs pa bṣin du dṅos po gṣan ṣig yin no ṣe na ni rdsas su yod pa yin no// gal te ḥo ma la sogs pa bṣin du spyi yin no ṣe na ni btags par[19] yod pa yin no//

de las cir[20] ḥgyur/

re ṣig gal te rdsas su yod na ni de raṅ bṣin tha dad paḥi phyir phuṅ po rnams las gṣan no ṣes brjod par bya ste/ phan tshun gyi phuṅ po bṣin no// ḥdiḥi rgyu yaṅ brjod dgos so// ḥon te ḥdus ma byas yin na ni deḥi phyir[21] mu stegs can gyi lta bar[22] thal bar ḥgyur la/ dgos pa med pa ñid du yaṅ ḥgyur ro//

ḥon te btags par yod do ṣe na ni kho bo cag kyaṅ de skad ces smraḥo[23]//

---

17 NP.omit / after *ḥdod*
18 CD.insert *ci yaṅ* after *yaṅ*
19 C.par=par par
20 C.cir=ci
21 NP.insert / after *phyir*
22 CD.yaṅ=bar yaṅ
23 CD.smraḥo=smras so

{%Skt 9-4}[Pra. 46120-46125]{%Chn}[Z. 304b16-24; X. 152c16-24]

- naiva hi sa dravyato 'sti[24] nāpi prajñaptitaḥ /
- kiṃ tarhi /
- ādhyātmikān upāttān vartamānān skandhān upādāya pudgalaḥ prajñapyate /
- tad idam andhavacanam anunmīlitārthaṃ na budhyāmahe /

kim idam upādāyeti / yady ayam arthaḥ skandhān ālambyeti[25] / teṣv eva pudgalaprajñaptiḥ prāpnoti / yathā rūpādīn ālambya teṣv eva kṣīraprajñaptiḥ / athāyam arthaḥ skandhān pratītyeti[26] / skandhānāṃ pudgalaprajñaptikāraṇatvāt sa eva doṣaḥ /

- na sa evaṃ prajñapyate /
- kathaṃ tarhi /[27]
- yathendhanam upādāyāgniḥ /

---

24 (Ejima:) Pra: naiva hi dravyato 'sti. Ms: naiva hi sa dravyato (')sti. T(94b1): de ni rdsas su yod pa kho na yaṅ ma yin la. Cf. Zhēn(304b16) and Xuán(152c16). Read *"naiva hi sa dravyato 'sti"* as in Ms.

25 (Ejima:) Pra: skandhānāṃ lakṣyate. Ms: skandhān āṃlambyate(*Lee: āṃlakṣyate?). T(94b2): phuṅ po rnams la dmigs nas ṣes bya ba. Zhēn(304b20): 謂緣諸陰. Xuán(152c19): 攬諸蘊. Yaś(699, 30): skandhān ālaṃbyeti. Pūr(368a6): phuṅ po rnams la dmigs nas ṣes bya ba ni. Read *"skandhān ālambyeti"*.

26 (Ejima:) Pra: pratīyeti. Read *"pratītyeti"* as in Ms.

27 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-4}[C.84a3-6, D.82b2-4, N94b4-7, P.94b1-4]

de ni rdsas su yod pa kho na yaṅ ma yin la btags par yod pa yaṅ ma yin no//

ḥo na ci ṣe na//

da ltar gyi naṅ gi zin paḥi phuṅ po rnams rgyur byas nas gaṅ zag tu ḥdogs so//

loṅ ba lta buḥi tshig don mi gsal ba ḥdi ni mi goḥo//

rgyur byas nas ṣes bya ba ḥdi ci/ gal te ḥdiḥi don phuṅ po rnams la dmigs nas ṣes bya ba ḥdi yin no[28] ṣe na ni/[29] de dag kho na la gaṅ zag tu ḥdogs par zad do//[30] dper na gzugs la sogs pa la dmigs nas/ de dag kho na la ḥo ma ḥdogs pa[31] bṣin no//

ḥon te ḥdiḥi don phuṅ po rnams la brten nas ṣes bya ba ḥdi yin no ṣe na ni phuṅ po rnams gaṅ zag gdags paḥi rgyu yin paḥi phyir skyon de ñid du ḥgyur ro//

de ni de ltar mi ḥdogs so//

ḥo na ji lta bu ṣe na/

ji ltar bud śiṅ rgyur byas nas me ḥdogs pa bṣin no//

---

28 NP.insert // after *no*

29 NP.omit / after *ni*

30 P.zad do//=zad te/; N.zad do//=zad de/

31 N.ḥdogs pa=ḥdog pa

{%Skt 9-5}[Pra. 46124-46204]{%Chn}[Z. 304b24-29; X. 152c24-29]

- katham cendhanam upādāyāgniḥ prajñapyate /
- na hi vinendhanenāgniḥ prajñapyate na cānya indhanād agniḥ śakyate pratijñātum[32] / nāpy ananyaḥ / yadi hy anyaḥ syād anuṣṇam indhanam syāt / athānanyaḥ syād dāhyam eva dāhakam syāt /

evam na ca vinā skandhaiḥ pudgalaḥ prajñapyate / na cānyaḥ skandhebhyaḥ śakyate pratijñātum śāśvataprasaṅgāt / nāpy ananya ucchedaprasaṅgād iti /

---

32 (Ejima:) Pra: prajñapayitum. Ms: *sic.* T(94b5): dam bcaḥ bar. Zhēn(304b25): 立. Read more adequately *"pratijñātum"* in order to make clear a logical connotation.

{%Tib 9-5}[C.84a6-84b1, D.82b4-7, N.94b7-95a3, P.94b4-6]

ji ltar na bud śiṅ rgyur byas nas me ḥdogs śe na/

bud śiṅ med par me mi ḥdogs mod kyi/ bud śiṅ las me gṣan yin par dam bcaḥ bar yaṅ mi nus la/ gṣan ma yin par dam bcaḥ bar yaṅ mi nus te/ gal te gṣan yin na ni bud śiṅ dro ba ñid ma yin par ḥgyur ro// ḥon te gṣan ma yin na ni bsreg bya ñid sreg byed yin par ḥgyur ro//

de ltar phuṅ po rnams med par[33] yaṅ gaṅ zag mi ḥdogs la/ phuṅ po rnams las gṣan yin par dam[34] bcaḥ bar yaṅ mi nus te/[35] rtag par thal bar ḥgyur ro// gṣan ma yin par yaṅ dam bcaḥ bar mi nus te/[36] chad par thal bar ḥgyur ro//

---

33 D.par=phar
34 D.dam=daṅ
35 CD.omit /
36 C.omits /

{%Skt 9-6}[Pra. 46205-46214]{%Chn}[Z. 304b29-304c13; X. 152c29-153a13]

- aṅga tāvad brūhi kim indhanaṃ ko 'gnir iti tato jñāsyāmaḥ katham indhanam upādāyāgniḥ prajñapyata iti /
- kim atra vaktavyam /[37] dāhyam indhanaṃ dāhako 'gniḥ /
- etad evātra vaktavyam / kiṃ dāhyaṃ ko vā dāhaka[38] iti /
- loke hi tāvad apradīptaṃ kāṣṭhādikam indhanam ucyate dāhyaṃ ca / pradīptam agnir dāhakaś ca / yac ca bhāsvaraṃ coṣṇaṃ ca bhṛśaṃ ca tena hi tad idhyate dahyate ca saṃtativikārāpādānāt / tac cobhayam aṣṭadravyakaṃ tac cendhanaṃ pratītyāgnir utpadyate yathā kṣīraṃ pratītya dadhi madhu pratītya śuktam / tasmād indhanam upādāyety ucyate /
- anyaś ca sa tasmād bhinnakālatvāt / yadi caivaṃ pudgalaḥ skandhān pratītyotpadyate / sa tebhyo 'nyaś cānityaś ca prāpnoti / atha punas tatraiva kāṣṭhādau pradīpte yad auṣṇyaṃ tad agnis tatsahajātāni trīṇi bhūtānīndhanam iṣyante / tayor api siddham anyatvaṃ lakṣaṇabhedāt /

---

37 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

38 (Ejima:) Pra: ko dāhaka. Read *"ko vā dāhaka"* as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-6}[C.84b1-5, D.82b7-83a4, N.95a3-7, P.94b6-95a4]

re ṣig kye[39] bud śiṅ ni ci/ me ni ci yin pa smros śig daṅ/ de las ji ltar na bud śiṅ rgyur byas nas me[40] ḥdogs par śes par byaḥo//

ḥdi la ci ṣig brjod par bya/ bsreg bya ni bud śiṅ yin la sreg byed ni me yin par zad mod/

ḥdir bsreg par bya ba ni ci/ sreg par byed pa ni ci yin pa de ñid brjod par byaḥo//

re ṣig ḥjig rten na[41] ni śiṅ la sogs pa ma[42] ḥbar ba la bud śiṅ ṣes kyaṅ bya la bsreg bya ṣes kyaṅ byaḥo// ḥbar ba la ni me ṣes kyaṅ bya la sreg byed ces kyaṅ bya ste/ ḥbar ba daṅ śin tu tsha ba gaṅ yin pa des de tshig pa daṅ sreg par byed de/ rgyud ḥgyur bar byed paḥi phyir ro// de gñi ga yaṅ rdsas brgyad pa yin no// bud śiṅ la brten nas me[43] ḥbyuṅ ba de yaṅ dper na[44] ḥo ma la brten nas ṣo[45] ḥbyuṅ ba daṅ/ mṅar po la brten nas[46] tsha ba[47] ḥbyuṅ ba lta bu yin te/ de lta bas na bud śiṅ rgyur byas nas ṣes bya ba la[48] de ni de daṅ dus tha dad paḥi phyir gṣan pa yaṅ yin no//

gal te de ltar phuṅ po rnams la brten nas gaṅ zag skye na ni de dag las gṣan pa daṅ[49] mi rtag par yaṅ ḥgyur ro// ḥon te[50] śiṅ la sogs pa[51] ḥbar b a[52] de ñid la dro ba ñid yod pa gaṅ yin pa de ni me yin la/ de[53] daṅ lhan cig skyes paḥi ḥbyuṅ ba gsum ni bud śiṅ yin par ḥdod na ni de gñis kyaṅ mtshan ñid tha dad paḥi phyir gṣan ñid yin par grub po//

---

39 D.kye=kyi
40 D.me=mi
41 NP.omit *na*
42 NP.ma=me
43 P.me=ma
44 NP.insert / after *na*
45 N.ṣo=ṣe
46 NP.insert // after *nas*
47 NP.tsha ba=tsha
48 NP.insert *de la* after *la*
49 NP.insert / after *daṅ*
50 N.inserts / after *te*
51 NP.pa=paḥi
52 P.ḥbar ba=bar
53 P.de=śiṅ

{%Skt 9-7}[Pra. 46215-46220]{%Chn}[Z. 304c13-18; X. 153a13-21]

- upādāyārthas tu vaktavyaḥ / kathaṃ tad indhanam upādāya so 'gniḥ prajñapyata iti / na hi tat tasya kāraṇaṃ nāpi tatprajñapteḥ[54] / agnir eva hi tatprajñapteḥ kāraṇam /

yady āśrayārtha upādāyārthaḥ sahabhāvārtho vā / skandhā apy evaṃ pudgalasyāśrayasahabhūtāḥ prāpnuvantīti vispaṣṭam anyatvaṃ pratijñāyate / tadabhāve ca pudgalābhāvaḥ prāpnoti / indhanābhāva[55] ivāgnyabhāvaḥ /

{%Skt 9-8}[Pra. 46220-46223]{%Chn}[Z. 304c18-23; X. 153a21-26]

- yat tu tad uktaṃ yadīndhanād anyo 'gniḥ syād anuṣṇam indhanaṃ syād iti / kim idam uṣṇaṃ nāma /

yadi tāvad[56] auṣṇyam / anuṣṇam evendhanam anyabhūtasvabhāvatvāt / atha yad auṣṇyavat / anyad api tad uṣṇasvabhāvād agner uṣṇaṃ sidhyaty auṣṇyayogāt /[57] iti nāsty anyatve[58] doṣaḥ /

---

54 (Ejima:) Pra: tat prajñapteḥ. Read *"tatprajñapteḥ"*.

55 (Lee:) Pra: indhanabhāva. Ms: indhanābhāva. Read *"indhanābhāva"*.

56 (Lee:) Pra: tāvād. Ms:tāvad. Read *"tāvad"*.

57 (Lee:) Pra: auṣṇyayogāditi / nāsty anyatve doṣaḥ /. Ms: *sic.* T(95a8): dro ba ñid daṅ ldan paḥi phyir ro// de lta bas na don tha dad pa ñid yin na ñes pa med do/. Read *"auṣṇyayogāt / iti nāsty anyatve doṣaḥ /"*.

58 (Ejima:) anyatve. T(95a8): don tha dad pa ñid yin na(=arthāntaratve?).

{%Tib 9-7}[C.84b5-7, D.83a4-6, N.95b1-3, P.95a4-6]

ji ltar na bud śiṅ de rgyur byas nas me de[59] ḥdogs par byed[60] pa rgyur byas paḥi don yaṅ brjod dgos te/ de ni deḥi rgyu yaṅ ma yin la de gdags[61] paḥi rgyu yaṅ ma yin gyi me ñid de gdags paḥi[62] rgyu yin no//

gal te rgyur byas paḥi don rten[63] gyi don nam lhan cig ḥbyuṅ baḥi don yin no ṣe na ni/ phuṅ po rnams kyaṅ de daṅ ḥdra bar gaṅ zag gi rten nam lhan cig ḥbyuṅ ba dag yin par ḥgyur bas[64] gṣan ñid du gsal bar dam ḥchaḥ ba yin no// de med na gaṅ zag med par yaṅ ḥgyur te/ bud śiṅ med na me med pa bṣin no//

{%Tib 9-8}[C.84b7-85a1, D.83a6-83b1, N.95b3-4, P.95a6-8]

gaṅ yaṅ bud śiṅ las me gṣan yin na ni[65] bud śiṅ dro ba ñid ma yin par ḥgyur ro ṣes smras pa de dro ba ṣes bya ba ḥdi ci/

re ṣig gal te dro ba ñid yin no ṣe na ni bud śiṅ[66] dro ba ñid[67] ma yin pa kho nar ḥgyur te/ ḥbyuṅ ba gṣan gyi raṅ bṣin yin paḥi phyir ro// ḥon te dro ba ñid daṅ ldan pa yin no ṣe na ni dro ba ñid kyi raṅ bṣin gyi me las gṣan pa de yaṅ dro ba yin par ḥgrub ste/ dro ba ñid daṅ ldan paḥi phyir ro// de lta bas na don tha dad pa ñid yin na ñes pa med do//

---

59 CD.omit *de* ;NP.insert / after *de*
60 P.byed=byad
61 C.gdags=dal dags?
62 NP.paḥi=pa
63 N.rten=rtan
64 NP.bas=bar
65 NP.omit *ni*
66 P.śiṅ=ciṅ
67 NP.omit *ñid*

{%Skt 9-9}[Pra. 46223-46301]{%Chn}[Z. 304c23-26; X. 153a26-153b2]

- atha punaḥ sarvam eva tat pradīptaṃ kāṣṭhādikam indhanaṃ cāgniś ceṣyate / tadupādāyārthaś ca vaktavyaḥ /

skandhā eva ca pudgalā ity ananyatvam anivāryaṃ prāpnoti / tasmān na sidhyaty etat / yathendhanam upādāyāgniḥ prajñapyate evaṃ skandhān[68] upādāya pudgala iti[69] /

{%Skt 9-10[Pra. 46301-46303]{%Chn}[Z. 304c26-29; X. 153b2-5]

- yadi cāyam anyaḥ skandhebhyo na vaktavyaḥ / "pañcavidhaṃ jñeyam atītānāgataṃ pratyutpannam[70] asaṃskṛtam avaktavyam" iti[71] na vaktavyaṃ prāpnoti / naiva[72] hi tad atītādibhyaḥ pañcamaṃ nāpañcamaṃ vaktavyam /

---

68 (Lee:) Pra: skadhān. Ms: skandhān. Read *"skandhān"*.

69 (Lee:) Pra: pudgalaḥ iti. Read *"pudgala iti"*.

70 (Lee:) Pra: pratyupannam. Ms: pratyutpannam. Read *"pratyutpannam"*.

71 (Ejima:) "pañcavidhaṃ jñeyam...".

Cf. *Chéng-shí-lún*(成實論, Taisho 32, 260c9), *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*(ed. by B. Nanjio, Kyoto, 1923, 371, 14: adhvatrayam anadhvaś ca avaktavyaś ca pañcamaḥ/ jñeyam etad dhi buddhānāṃ tārkikaiḥ saṃprakīrtyate//), etc.

72 (Ejima:) Pra: naiṃva. Read *"naiva"* as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-9}[C.85a1-3, D.83b1-2, N.95b4-6, P.95a8-95b2]

ḥon te śiṅ la sogs pa ḥbar ba de[73] thams cad bud śiṅ yaṅ yin la[74] me yaṅ yin par ḥdod na ni des na rgyur byas paḥi don yaṅ brjod par byaḥo//

phuṅ po rnams kho na yaṅ gaṅ zag yin pas gṣan pa ma yin pa[75] ñid mi ldo g[76] par ḥgyur ro// de lta bas na ji ltar bud śiṅ rgyur byas nas me ḥdogs pa de ltar phuṅ po rnams rgyur byas nas gaṅ zag ḥdogs so ṣes bya ba ḥdi mi ḥgrub po//

{%Tib 9-10}[C.85a3-4, D.83b2-4, N.95b6-7, P.95b2-4]

gal te yaṅ ḥdi phuṅ po rnams las gṣan du brjod par bya ba ma yin na/ śes bya[77] ni rnam pa lṅa ste/ ḥdas pa daṅ/ ma ḥoṅs pa daṅ/ da ltar byuṅ ba daṅ/ ḥdus ma byas daṅ/ brjod par bya ba ma yin paḥo[78] ṣes brjod par mi bya bar ḥgyur te/ de ni ḥdas pa la sogs pa las lṅa pa yaṅ ma yin la lṅa pa ma yin pa yaṅ ma yin par brjod par byaḥo//

---

73 CD.de=de dag
74 NP.omit *la*
75 P.pa=pa de
76 NP.ldog=zlog
77 NP.śes bya=ṣes bya ba
78 P.inserts // after *paḥo* ;N.inserts / after *paḥo*

{%Skt 9-11}[Pra. 46303-46309]{%Chn}[Z. 304c29-305a7; X. 153b5-12]

- yadā ca pudgalaḥ prajñapyate kiṃ tāvat[79] skandhān upalabhya prajñapyate / āhosvit pudgalam /

yadi tāvat skandhāṃs teṣv eva pudgalaprajñaptiḥ prāpnoti / pudgalasyānupalambhāt / atha pudgalaṃ katham asya skandhān upādāya prajñaptir bhavati / pudgala eva hi tasyā upādānaṃ prāpnoti /

atha mataṃ satsu skandheṣu pudgala upalabhyate / tataḥ skandhān upādāyāsya prajñaptir ucyata iti / tad evaṃ rūpasyāpi cakṣurmanaskārālokeṣu satsūpalambhāt / tān upādāya prajñaptir vaktavyā / rūpavac ca pudgalasyānyatvaṃ spaṣṭam /[80]

---

79 (Ejima:) Pra: ki tāvat. Ms: kin tāvat. Read *"kiṃ tāvat"*.

80 (Ejima:) rūpavac ca pudgalasyānyatvaṃ spaṣṭam /.
Ms: *sic*. Left out in T(95b7), Zhēn(305a7), Xuán(153b12).

{%Tib 9-11}[C.85a4-6, D.83b4-7, N.95b7-96a3, P.95b4-7]

gaṅ gi tshe gaṅ zag ḥdogs pa na ci re ṣig[81] phuṅ po rnams dmigs nas ḥdogs sam/ ḥon te gaṅ zag dmigs nas ḥdogs//

re ṣig gal te phuṅ po rnams na ni de dag kho na la gaṅ zag ḥdogs par ḥgyur te/ gaṅ zag mi dmigs paḥi phyir ro// ḥon te gaṅ zag na ni ḥdi ji ltar na phuṅ po rnams rgyur byas nas ḥdogs pa yin te/ gaṅ zag kho na deḥi rgyu yin par ḥgyur ro[82]//

ḥon te phuṅ po rnams yod na gaṅ zag dmigs te/ deḥi phyir phuṅ po rnams rgyur byas nas ḥdi ḥdogs so ṣes bya bar ḥdod do ṣe na ni/ de lta na gzugs kyaṅ mig[83] daṅ yid la byed pa daṅ snaṅ ba rnams yod na dmigs pas de dag rgyur byas nas btags pa yin par brjod par byaḥo//

---

81 NP.re ṣig=re śig

82 NP.yin par ḥgyur ro=yin paḥi phyir ro

83 CD.mig=dmigs

{%Skt 9-12}[Pra. 46310-46319]{%Chn}[Z. 305a7-18; X. 153b12-25]

- idaṃ tāvad vaktavyam / ṣaṇṇāṃ vijñānānāṃ katamena pudgalo vijñeyaḥ /
- ṣaḍbhir apīty ucyate /
- kathaṃ kṛtvā /
- cakṣurvijñeyāni ced rūpāṇi pratītya pudgalaṃ prativibhāvayati[84] cakṣurvijñeyaḥ pudgalo vaktavyaḥ /[85] no tu vaktavyo rūpāṇi vā no[86] vā / evaṃ yāvat manovijñeyān ced dharmān pratītya pudgalaṃ prativibhāvayati / manovijñeyaḥ pudgalo vaktavyo no tu vaktavyo dharmā vā no vā /

---

84 (Ejima:) Pra: pratibhāvayati. Ms: *sic.* Yaś(701, 8): prativibhāvayati. Read *"prativibhāvayati"*.

85 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

86 (Lee:) Pra: vāno. Read *"vā no"*.

{%Tib 9-12}[C.85a6-85b5, D.83b7-84a5, N.96a3-96b2, P.95b7-96a6]

re ṣig ḥdi yaṅ brjod par bya ste/ rnam par śes pa drug rnams las gaṅ zag rnam par śes pa gaṅ gis rnam par śes par bya ba yin/[87]

drug car gyis kyaṅ śes par bya ba yin no[88] ṣes byaḥo//

ji ltar byas pas śe na/

gal te mig gis rnam par śes par bya baḥi gzugs rnams la brten nas/ gaṅ zag dmigs par byed na ni[89] gaṅ zag mig gis rnam par śes par bya ba yin no[90] ṣes brjod par bya la/ gzugs rnams ṣes kyaṅ brjod par[91] mi bya/ gzugs rnams ma yin no ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi byaḥo// de bṣin du yid kyis rnam par śes par bya baḥi chos rnams kyi bar la brten nas/ gaṅ zag dmigs par byed na ni/ gaṅ zag yid kyis[92] rnam par śes par bya ba yin no ṣes brjod par bya la/ chos rnams ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya la/[93] chos rnams ma yin no ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi byaḥo//

---

87 P.omits /
88 NP.insert / after *no*
89 NP.insert / after *ni*
90 NP.insert // after *no*
91 NP.brjod par=brjod
92 N.kyis=kyi
93 NP.brjod par mi bya la/=brjod par mi byaḥo//

– evaṃ tarhi kṣīrādibhiḥ samānaḥ prāpnoti /

cakṣurvijñeyāni ced rūpāṇi pratītya kṣīraṃ prativibhāvayaty[94] udakaṃ vā cakṣurvijñeyaṃ kṣīram udakaṃ veti[95] vaktavyam /[96] no tu vaktavyaṃ rūpāṇi vā no vā / evaṃ ghrāṇajihvākāyavijñeyaṃ vaktavyaṃ no tu vaktavyaṃ spraṣṭavyāni vā no vā / mā bhūt[97] kṣīrodakayoś catuṣṭvaprasaṅga iti / ato yathā rūpādīny eva kṣīram udakaṃ vā prajñapyate samastāny evaṃ skandhāḥ pudgala iti siddham /

---

94 (Ejima:) Pra: vibhāvayaty. Ms: *sic.* Read "prativibhāvayaty".

95 (Ejima:) Pra: ceti. Ms: *sic.* Read *"veti"* in accordance to the preceding "vā".

96 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

97 (Lee:) Pra: mābhūt. Read *"mā bhūt"*.

de lta na ni ḥo na ḥo ma la sogs pa daṅ ḥdra bar ḥgyur te/

gal te mig gis rnam par śes par bya baḥi gzugs rnams la brten nas ḥo maḥam/ chu dmigs par byed na ni ḥo maḥam chu mig gis[98] rnam par śes par bya ba yin no ṣes brjod par bya la gzugs rnams ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya/ gzugs rnams ma yin no[99] ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi byaḥo// de bṣin du gal te sna daṅ[100] lce daṅ lus kyis[101] rnam par śes par bya ba ma[102] yin par brjod par bya la/ reg bya rnams ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya/ reg bya rnams ma yin no ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya ste/ ḥo ma daṅ[103] chu gñis bṣi ñid du thal bar ḥgyur du ḥoṅ bas[104] so// deḥi phyir ji ltar gzugs la sogs paḥi spyi kho na la/ ḥo maḥam/ chu ṣes ḥdogs pa de bṣin du phuṅ po rnams la gaṅ zag ḥdogs so ṣes bya bar grub po//

---

98 CD.gis=gi

99 NP.yin no=yin

100 NP.insert / after *daṅ*

101 NP.kyis=kyi

102 CDNP.=*sic.* It is the better reading to omit *ma.*

103 C.daṅ=dan

104 CDNP.=*sic.* It is the better reading to insert *'mi'* before *ḥoṅ bas.*

{%Skt 9-13}[Pra. 46320-46407]{%Chn}[Z. 305a18-305b6; X. 153b25-153c14]

- yac cocyate cakṣurvijñeyāni rūpāṇi pratītya pudgalaṃ prativibhāvayatīti ko 'sya vākyasyārthaḥ /

kiṃ tāvad rūpāṇi pudgalopalabdheḥ kāraṇaṃ bhavantīti[105] / āhosvid rūpāṇy upalabhamānaḥ pudgalam upalabhata iti /

yadi rūpāṇi pudgalopalabdheḥ kāraṇaṃ bhavanti sa ca tebhyo 'nyo na vaktavyaḥ / evaṃ tarhi rūpam apy ālokacakṣurmanaskārebhyo 'nyan na vaktavyam / teṣāṃ tadupalabdhikāraṇatvāt /

atha rūpāṇy upalabhamānaḥ pudgalam upalabhate / kiṃ tayaivopalabdhyopalabhate / āhosvid anyayā /

yadi tayaiva / rūpād abhinnasvabhāvaḥ pudgalaḥ prāpnoti / rūpa eva vā tatprajñaptiḥ / idaṃ ca rūpam ayaṃ pudgala iti katham idaṃ paricchidyate /[106] athaivaṃ na paricchidyate / katham idaṃ pratijñāyate rūpam apy asti pudgalo 'py astīti / upalabdhivaśena hi tasyāstitvaṃ pratijñāyeta[107] /

evaṃ yāvad dharmebhyo vaktavyam /

---

105 (Ejima:) Pra: bhavatīti. Ms: *sic*. Read *"bhavantīti"*.

106 (Ejima:) Pra: idaṃ ca rūpam ayaṃ pudgalaḥ katham idaṃ gamyate/.

Ms: idañ ca rūpam aṃyaṃ pudgalaḥ katham idaṃ gamyate/. T(96b2): ḥdi ni gzugs so/ ḥdi ni gaṅ zag go ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ ji ltar yoṅs su gcod/(=idaṃ ca rūpam ayaṃ ca pudgala iti katham idaṃ paricchidyate). Zhēn(305a26): 此人非色, 此色非人, 此二云何可分別. Xuán(153c5) 或不應有如是分別, 如是類是色, 如是類是此. Yaś(702, 1): idaṃ ca rūpam iti vistaraḥ/ upalabdher ekatve rūpapudgalayoḥ paricchedo na prāpnotīti/. Pūr(370b5): the same in Yaś.

Read *"idaṃ ca rūpam ayaṃ pudgala iti katham idaṃ paricchidyate/"*.

107 (Ejima:) Pra: pratijñāyate. Ms: pratijñāyeta. T(96b3): dam ḥcaḥ bar zad do. Read *"pratijñāyeta"* as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-13}[C.85b5-86a4, D.84a5-84b4, N.96b2-97a3, P.96a6-96b7]

gaṅ yaṅ mig gis rnam par śes par bya baḥi[108] gzugs rnams la brten nas gaṅ zag dmigs par byed ces smras paḥi tshig deḥi don ci ṣig yin/

ci re ṣig gzugs rnams gaṅ zag dmigs paḥi rgyu ṣig yin nam/ ḥon te gzugs rnams dmigs na gaṅ zag dmigs so ṣes bya ba yin no//

gal te gzugs rnams gaṅ zag dmigs paḥi rgyu yin la[109] de yaṅ de dag las gṣan du brjod par mi byaḥo ṣe na ni/ de lta na ni ḥo na gzugs kyaṅ snaṅ ba daṅ mig daṅ yid la byed pa dag las gṣan du brjod par mi bya ste/ de dag ni de dmigs paḥi rgyu yin paḥi phyir ro//

ḥon te gzugs rnams dmigs na gaṅ zag dmigs so ṣe na ni ci dmigs pa de kho nas dmigs sam/ ḥon te gṣan gyis/[110]

gal te de[111] kho nas so ṣe na ni gaṅ zag gzugs las raṅ bṣin tha mi dad paḥam gzugs kho na la de ḥdogs par ḥgyur na/ ḥdi ni gzugs so/ ḥdi ni gaṅ zag go ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ ji ltar yoṅs su gcod/ ḥon te de ltar yoṅs su mi gcod na ni gzugs kyaṅ yod do// gaṅ zag kyaṅ yod do[112] ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ ji ltar dam ḥchaḥ ste/ dmigs paḥi dbaṅ gis de yod par dam ḥchaḥ bar zad do//

de bṣin du chos kyi bar dag la yaṅ brjod par byaḥo//

---

108 NP.rnam par śes par bya baḥi=rnam par śes paḥi
109 NP.insert / after *la*
110 C.omits /
111 C.omits *de*
112 N.inserts / after *yod do*

athānyayā[113] bhinnakālopalambhād anyo rūpāt prāpnoti / nīlād iva pītaṃ kṣaṇād iva ca kṣaṇāntaram / evaṃ yāvad dharmebhyo vaktavyam /

atha rūpapudgalavat tadupalabdhyor apy anyānanyatvam avaktavyam / tena tarhi saṃskṛtam apy[114] avaktavyaṃ bhavatīti siddhāntabhedaḥ / yadi cāyam asti no tu vaktavyo rūpāṇi vā no vā / kiṃ tarhi bhagavatoktaṃ "rūpam anātmā yāvad vijñānam anātme"ti /[115]

---

113 (Ejima:) athānyayā. Ms: athānyāthā. T(96b3): ḥon te gṣan gyis so ṣe na ni.

114 (Lee:) Pra: saṃskṛte 'py. Ms: saṃskṛte (')py. T(96b5): ḥo na ni des na ḥdus byas(D.ḥdus byas=ḥdus ma byas) kyaṅ brjod par bya ba ma yin par ḫgyur bas(D.ḫgyur bas=gyur pas)/. Yaś(702, 30): saṃskṛtam apy. Read *"saṃskṛtam apy"*.

115 (Ejima:) "rūpam anātmā..."ti/.

Cf. Zá 8(Taisho 2, 1c23), Zá 23(Taisho 2, 5a20), Zá 24(Taisho 2, 5b13), Zá 262(Taisho 2, 66b14), Zēng 19, 3(Taisho 2, 594c4), Zēng 24, 4(Taisho 2, 618a11), SN 22, 11(III, 20, 15).

ḥon te gṣan gyis so ṣe na ni/ dus tha dad par[116] dmigs paḥi phyir gzugs las gṣan yin par ḥgyur te/ sṁon po las ser po lta bu daṅ/ skad cig ma las skad cig ma gṣan bṣin no// de bṣin du chos kyi bar dag la yaṅ brjod par byaḥo//

ḥon te gzugs daṅ gaṅ zag bṣin du de dag dmigs pa dag kyaṅ gṣan daṅ gṣan ma yin pa ñid du brjod par mi byaḥo[117] ṣe na/ ḥo na ni des na ḥdus byas[118] kyaṅ brjod par bya ba ma yin par ḥgyur bas[119]/ grub paḥi mthaḥ ñams pa yin no// gal te yaṅ ḥdi yod la gzugs rnams ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya/[120] gzugs rnams ma yin no ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya na/ ḥo na ciḥi phyir bcom ldan ḥdas kyis[121] gzugs bdag ma yin pa nas/[122] rnam par śes pa bdag ma yin ṣes bya baḥi bar gsuṁs/

---

116 CD.tha dad par=tha dad
117 P.inserts / after *byaḥo* ;N.inserts // after *byaḥo*
118 CD.ḥdus byas=ḥdus ma byas
119 CD.ḥgyur bas=gyur pas
120 NP.kyaṅ brjod par mi bya/=brjod par mi byaḥo//
121 N.insert / after *kyis*
122 NP.omit /

{%Skt 9-14}[Pra. 46408-46417]{%Chn}[Z. 305b7-17; X. 153c14-27]

- yena cāyaṃ cakṣurvijñānena pudgala upalabhyate / kiṃ tad rūpāṇi pratītyotpadyate / āhosvit pudgalam ubhayaṃ vā /

yadi rūpāṇi pratītyotpadyate / notsahiṣyate pudgalaṃ vijñātuṃ śabdādivat / yam eva hi viṣayaṃ[123] pratītyotpadyate vijñānaṃ sa eva tasyālambanapratyayaḥ /

atha pudgalaṃ pratītyotpadyate ubhayaṃ vā / idam utsūtram / sūtre hi nirdhāritam / "dvayaṃ pratītya vijñānasyotpādo bhavatī"ti /[124] tathā "cakṣur bhikṣo hetū rūpāṇi pratyayaś cakṣurvijñānasyotpādāya / tat kasya hetoḥ / yat kiṃcit bhikṣo cakṣurvijñānaṃ sarvaṃ tac cakṣuḥ pratītya rūpāṇi ce"ti /[125] anityaś ca pudgala evaṃ prāpnoti / "ye hetavo[126] ye pratyayā vijñānasyotpādāya te 'py anityā" iti[127] sūtre vacanāt /

atha pudgalo na tasyālambanaṃ na tarhi tena vijñeyaḥ /

---

123 (Ejima:) Pra: viṣayaṃ cakṣurvijñāneṣu. Ms: viṣayaṃ cakṣurvijñāne[ṣ]u. Omitted in T(96b8), Zhēn(305b8), Xuán(153c17).
(Lee:) Pra: viṣayaṃ cakṣurvijñāneṣu. Read *"viṣayaṃ"*.

124 (Ejima:) "dvayaṃ pratītya..."ti/.
Cf. Zá 214(Taisho 2, 54a23), SN 35, 93(IV, 67, 27).

125 (Ejima:) "cakṣur bhikṣo hetū rūpāṇi..."ti/.
Cf. Zá 238(Taisho 2, 57c18), SN 35, 139-141(IV, 129-130).

126 (Ejima:) Pra: ye hi hetavo. Ms: ye hetavo.
(Lee:) Omit *"hi"* according to Ms.

127 (Ejima:) "ye hetavo..."iti.
Cf. Zá 11(Taisho 2, 2a25), SN 22, 18(III, 23, 22).

{%Tib 9-14}[C.86a5-86b1, D.84b5-85a1, N.97a3-7, P.96b7-97a4]

mig gi rnam par śes pa gaṅ gis gaṅ zag ḥdi dmigs pa de ci gzugs la brten nas skye ḥam/ ḥon te gaṅ zag gam/ gñi ga la brten nas skye/

gal te gzugs rnams la brten nas skye na ni sgra la sogs pa bṣin du gaṅ zag rnam[128] par śes par mi nus te/ yul gaṅ kho na[129] la brten nas rnam par śes pa skye ba de ñid deḥi dmigs paḥi rkyen yin no//

ḥon te gaṅ zag gam/ gñi ga la brten nas skyeḥo ṣe na/ ḥdi ni mdo las thal ba yin te/ mdo las ni/ gñis la brten nas rnam par śes pa skye ba yin no ṣes ṅes par bzuṅ[130] ṅo// de bṣin du dge sloṅ mig gi[131] rnam par śes pa skyed pa la/ rgyu ni mig yin no// rkyen ni gzugs rnams yin no// de[132] ciḥi phyir ṣe na/ mig gi rnam par śes pa gaṅ[133] ci yaṅ ruṅ ba[134] de thams cad ni mig daṅ gzugs rnams la[135] brten nas skyeḥo ṣes gsuṅs so// de lta na ni gaṅ zag mi rtag par ḥgyur te[136]/ mdo las/ mig gi rnam par śes pa skyed pa la rgyu gaṅ dag yin pa daṅ/ rkyen gaṅ yin pa de dag kyaṅ mi rtag pa yin no ṣes gsuṅs paḥi phyir ro//

ḥon te deḥi dmigs pa gaṅ zag ma yin na[137] ḥo na ni des rnam par śes par bya ba ma yin par ḥgyur ro//

---

128 CD.rnam=dam
129 D.na=na na
130 D.bzuṅ=gzuṅ
131 C.gi=ge
132 NP.omit *de*
133 C.gaṅ=gar
134 NP.omit *ba*
135 NP.la=las
136 N.te=ta
137 C.na=no

{%Skt 9-15}[Pra. 46418-46503]{%Chn}[Z. 305b17-305c3; X. 153c27-154a14]

- yadi ca pudgalaḥ ṣaḍvijñānavijñeyaḥ pratijñāyate / sa śrotravijñānavijñeyatvād rūpād anyaḥ prāpnoti śabdavat / cakṣurvijñānavijñeyatvāc[138] chabdād anyaḥ prāpnoti rūpavat / evam anyebhyo 'pi yojyam /

idaṃ ca sūtrapadaṃ bādhitaṃ[139] bhavati / "yānīmāni brāhmaṇa pañcendriyāṇi nānāgocarāṇi nānāviṣayāṇi / svakaṃ svakaṃ[140] gocaraviṣayaṃ pratyanubhavanti / nānyad anyasya gocaraviṣayaṃ pratyanubhavati / tadyathā cakṣurindriyaṃ śrotrendriyaṃ ghrāṇendriyaṃ jihvendriyaṃ kāyendriyam / man a[141] eṣāṃ pañcānām indriyāṇāṃ gocaraviṣayaṃ pratyanubhavati manaś[142] caiṣāṃ pratisaraṇam" iti /[143] na vā pudgalo viṣayaḥ / na ced viṣayaḥ / na tarhi vijñeyaḥ /

---

138 (Ejima:) Pra: caturvijñāna-. Ms: cakṣurvvijñāna-. Read *"cakṣurvijñāna-"*

139 (Ejima:) Pra: vādhitaṃ. Read *"bādhitaṃ"*.

140 (Ejima:) Pra: svaṃ svaṃ. Ms: *sic*. Read *"svakaṃ svakaṃ"*.

141 (Ejima:) mana. T(97a7): yid kyi dbaṅ po(=manaindriyam).

142 (Ejima:) manaś T(97a8): yid kyi dbaṅ po(=manaindriyam).

143 (Ejima:) "yānīmāni..." iti/.

Cf. SN 48, 42(V, 218, 4), Zhōng 211(Taisho 1, 791b11).

{%Tib 9-15}[C.86b1-7, D.85a1-85b1, N.97a7-97b6, P.97a4-97b4]

gal te yaṅ gaṅ zag[144] rnam par śes pa drug gis rnam par śes par bya ba yin par dam ḥchaḥ na ni de rna baḥi rnam par śes pas rnam par śes par bya ba yin paḥi phyir gzugs las[145] gṣan yin par ḥgyur te[146] sgra bṣin no// mig gi[147] rnam par śes pas rnam par śes par bya ba yin paḥi phyir sgra las gṣan yin par ḥgyur te gzugs bṣin no// de bṣin du gṣan dag la yaṅ sbyar bar byaḥo//

bram ze dbaṅ po lṅa po ḥdi dag ni spyod yul tha dad pa can yin ṣiṅ yul tha dad pa can yin te/ raṅ raṅ gi spyod yul daṅ yul so sor ñams su myoṅ ba yi n[148] gyi gṣan gyis[149] gṣan gyi spyod yul daṅ yul ñams su myoṅ ba ni rna yin pa dag ste/ ḥdi lta ste/[150] mig gi dbaṅ po daṅ/ rna baḥi dbaṅ po daṅ/ snaḥi dbaṅ[151] po daṅ/ lceḥi dbaṅ[152] po daṅ/ lus kyi dbaṅ po lṅaḥo// [153] yid kyi dba ṅ[154] po ni dbaṅ[155] po lṅa po ḥdi dag gi spyod yul daṅ yul ñams[156] su myoṅ ba yin ṣiṅ/ yid kyi dbaṅ po[157] ni ḥdi dag gi rten yin no ṣes gsuṅs paḥi mdoḥi tshig ḥdi daṅ yaṅ ḥgal bar ḥgyur ro// [158]yaṅ na gaṅ zag yul rna yin par ḥgyur ro// gal te yul rna yin no ṣe na/ ḥo na ni rnam par śes par bya ba rna yin par ḥgyur ro//

---

144 NP.omit *zag*
145 C.las=pas
146 CD.insert / after *te*
147 NP.gi=gis
148 NP.yin=yin yul
149 CD.omit *gṣan gyis*
150 NP.omit /
151 C.dbaṅ=dbad
152 C.dbaṅ=dbad
153 NP.dbaṅ po lṅaḥo//=dbaṅ po daṅ/. It is the better reading to read *'dbaṅ poḥo'* instead of *dbaṅ po lṅaḥo.*
154 C.dbaṅ=dbad
155 C.dbaṅ=dbad
156 NP.ñams=rnams
157 C.dbaṅ=dbad
158 C.//=/

- yady evaṃ manaindriyasyāpy avyabhicāraḥ prāpnoti / "ṣaḍ imānīndriyāṇi nānāgocarāṇi nānāviṣayāṇi[159] svakaṃ svakaṃ[160] gocaraviṣayam ākāṅkṣantī"ty uktaṃ ṣaṭprāṇakopame /[161]

- na tatrendriyam evendriyaṃ kṛtvoktam / pañcānāṃ darśanādyākāṅkṣaṇāsaṃ-bhavāt tadvijñānānāṃ ca / atas tadādhipatyādhyāhṛtam atra manovijñānam indriyaṃ kṛtvoktam /[162] yac ca tat kevalaṃ manaādhipatyādhyāhṛtaṃ[163] manovijñānaṃ naiva[164] tadanyeṣāṃ viṣayam ākāṅkṣaty ato nāsty eṣa doṣaḥ //

---

159 (Ejima:) nānāviṣayāṇi.

Omitted in T, P(97b1), but not in T, D(85a6), Zhēn(305b26) and Xuán(154a8).

160 (Ejima:) Pra: svaṃ svaṃ Ms: *sic.*

Read *"svakaṃ svakaṃ"* as in Yaś(703, 26) and SN(sakaṃ sakaṃ).

161 (Ejima:) "ṣaḍ imānīndriyāṇi..."ity uktaṃ ṣaṭprāṇakopame/.

Cf. Zá 1171(Taisho 2, 313a24), Zēng 38, 8(Taisho 2, 723c17), SN 35, 206(V, 200, 11).

162 (Ejima:) Pra: atas tadādhipatyādhyākṛtam atra manovijñānendriyaṃ kṛtvoktam /. Ms: *sic.* T(97b2): de dag gi dbaṅ gis draṅs paḥi yid kyi rnam par śes pa ni dbaṅ po yin par gsuṅs so/.

Read *"atas tadādhipatyādhyāhṛtam atra manovijñānam indriyaṃ kṛtvoktam/"*.

Zhēn(305c1) and Xuán(154a11) support this reading. Cf. Yaś(704, 4), Pūr(373a1).

163 (Ejima:) Pra: adhyākṛtaṃ. Ms: *sic.*

Read *"adhyāhṛtaṃ"*, for the same reason as above.

164 (Ejima:) Pra: naivaṃ. Read *"naiva"* as in Ms.

gal te de lta na yid kyi dbaṅ po yaṅ ḥkhrul pa[165] med par[166] ḥgyur te/ srog chags drug pa lta bu las[167]/ dbaṅ po drug po ḥdi dag ni spyod yul tha dad pa can yin ṣiṅ yul tha dad pa can yin[168] te/ raṅ raṅ gi spyod yul daṅ yul ḥdod pa dag yin[169] no ṣes gsuṅs so//

der ni[170] dbaṅ po kho na la dbaṅ po yin[171] par ma gsuṅs kyi[172] lṅa po daṅ de dag gi rnam par śes pa rnams ni mthoṅ ba la sogs par ḥdod mi srid paḥi phyir de dag gi dbaṅ gis draṅs paḥi yid kyi rnam par śes pa ni dbaṅ po yin par gsuṅs so// yid kyi dbaṅ po ḥbaḥ ṣig gis draṅs paḥi yid kyi rnam par śes pa gaṅ yin pa de ni de las gṣan pa dag gi[173] spyod yul la mi ḥdod pa ñid pas deḥi phyir de[174] ñes pa med do//

---

165 NP.pa=par
166 NP.omit *med par*
167 CD.lta bu las=lta buḥi mdo las
168 NP.omit *ṣiṅ yul tha dad pa can yin*
169 C.yin=min?
170 NP.der ni=dper na
171 C.yin=min?
172 NP.kyi=kyis
173 N. gṣan pa dag gi=gṣan de dag gi
174 NP.omit *de*

{%Skt 9-16}[Pra. 46503-46508]{%Chn}[Z. 305c4-11; X. 154a14-21]

- uktaṃ ca bhagavatā "sarvābhijñeyaparijñeyaṃ[175] vo bhikṣavo dharmaparyāyaṃ deśayiṣyāmī"ty[176] uktvā "cakṣur abhijñeyaparijñeyaṃ rūpāṇi cakṣurvijñānaṃ cakṣuḥsaṃsparśo yad api taccakṣuḥsaṃsparśapratyayam adhyātmam utpadyate veditaṃ sukhaṃ duḥkhaṃ[177] vā aduḥkhāsukhaṃ vā yāvat manaḥsaṃsparśapratyayam / ayam ucyate sarvābhijñeyaparijñeyo dharmaparyāyaḥ"[178] iti / atà etāvad evābhijñeyaṃ parijñeyaṃ[179] cety avadhāryate[180] / na pudgalaḥ / tasmād vijñeyo 'py asau na bhavati / prajñāvijñānayoḥ samānaviṣayatvāt /

---

175 (Lee:) Pra: sarvābhijñeyaṃ. Ms: *sic*. T(97b4): bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kyaṅ dge sloṅ dag mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya baḥi chos kyi rnam graṅs thams cad bśad par byaḥo ṣes gsuṅs nas/. Zhēn(305c4-5): 比丘我今爲汝等說一切所應知一切所應識法門. Xuán(154a15): 吾今爲汝具足演說一切所達所知法門. Read *"sarvābhijñeyaparijñeyaṃ"*.

176 (Ejima:) "sarvābhijñeyaṃ vo bhikṣavo dharmaparyāyaṃ deśayiṣyāmī"ty.

T(97b4): dge sloṅ dag mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya baḥi chos kyi rnam graṅs thams cad bśad par byaḥo(=sarvaṃ vo bhikṣavo 'bhijñeyaparijñeyaṃ dharmaparyāyaṃ deśayiṣyāmīti).

Zhēn(305c4): 比丘我今爲汝等說一切所應知一切所應識法門, Xuán(154a14): 苾芻當知吾今爲汝具足演說一切所達所知法門(=sarvābhijñeyaparijñeyaṃ vo bhikṣavo dharmaparyāyaṃ deśayiṣyāmi).

Cf. Zá 222(Taisho 2, 55a28), Zá 196(Taisho 2, 50b10), SN 35, 46-47&50(IV, 29).

In the quotations hereabout we find out some confusing differences of their wordings. In connection with them, above all it must be noticed that the Pāli SN 35, 46-47&50 enumerate "sabbaṃ bhikkhave abhiññeyyaṃ", "sabbaṃ bhikkhave pariññeyyaṃ" and "sabbaṃ bhikkhave abhiññāpariññeyyaṃ". From this fact we could infer existence of some serial sūtras which expound "abhijñeya", "parijñeya" and "abhijñeya-parijñeya" one after another. And these sūtras had two different traditions: the one which used the compounds "sarvābhijñeya" etc. as in the quotations here in Sanskrit and its Chinese versions, and the another one which did not do so as in the Pāli SN and presumably also in our Tibetan version, presumably, because we cannot utterly deny intervention of any mistranslations. Now we come to be able to understand the following apparently abridged quotations.

177 (Ejima:) Pra: suḥkhaṃ. Read *"sukhaṃ duḥkhaṃ"* as in Ms.

178 (Ejima:) sarvābhijñeyaparijñeyo dharmaparyāyaḥ.

T(97b6): mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya baḥi chos kyi rnam graṅs thams cad (=sarvo 'bhijñeyaparijñeyo dharmaparyāyaḥ). Zhēn(305c8): 一切所應知一切所應識法門, Xuán(154a18): 一切所達所知 (=savābhijñeyaparijñeyo dharmaparyāyaḥ).

179 (Ejima:) Pra: pratijñeyaṃ. Ms: *sic*, but in the margin emended into "pari-". Tib(97b7): yoṅs su śes par bya ba. Read *"parijñeyaṃ"*.

180 (Ejima:) Pra: avardhāryate. Read *"avadhāryate"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

{%Tib 9-16}[C.86b7-87a3, D.85b1-4, N.97b7-98a3, P.97b4-8]

bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kyaṅ dge sloṅ dag mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya baḥi chos kyi rnam graṅs thams cad bśad par byaḥo ṣes gsuṅs nas/ mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya ba ni mig daṅ/ gzugs rnams daṅ/ mig gi rnam par śes pa daṅ/ mig gi ḥdus te reg pa daṅ/ gaṅ yaṅ[181] mig gi ḥdus te reg paḥi rkyen gyis naṅ[182] gi tshor ba bde baḥam/ sdug bsṅal ba daṅ/ bde ba yaṅ ma yin sdug bsṅal ba yaṅ ma yin pa skye ba de daṅ ṣes bya ba nas yid kyi ḥdus te reg paḥi rkyen gyis naṅ gi ṣes bya baḥi bar du rgyas par gsuṅs te/ ḥdi ni mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya baḥi chos kyi rnam[183] graṅs thams cad yin no ṣes gsuṅs so// deḥi phyir mṅon par śes par bya ba daṅ/ yoṅs su śes par bya ba ni de sñed cig yin par ṅes par gzuṅ gi/ gaṅ zag ni ma yin pas/ de lta bas na ḥdi rnam par śes par bya ba yaṅ ma yin te/ śes rab daṅ rnam par śes pa gñis ni yul ḥdra baḥi phyir ro//

181 C.yaṅ=yid
182 C.naṅ=nad
183 C.rnam=nam

{%Skt 9-17}[Pra. 46508-46525]{%Chn}[Z. 305c11-306a3; X. 154a21-154b16]

- cakṣuṣā ca pudgalaṃ paśyāma iti paśyantaḥ[184] paudgalikā anātmanā ātmānaṃ paśyāma iti dṛṣṭisthānam[185] āpannā bhavanti /

sūtre ca bhagavatā nītam etat / "skandheṣv eva pudgalākhye"ti[186] /[187] mānuṣyakasūtram /[188] "cakṣuḥ pratītya[189] rūpāṇi cotpadyate cakṣurvijñānaṃ trayāṇāṃ saṃnipātaḥ sparśaḥ sparśasahajātā[190] vedanā saṃjñā cetanā itīme catvāro 'rūpiṇaḥ[191] skandhāś cakṣurindriyaṃ ca rūpam etāvan manuṣyatvam ucyate / atreyaṃ saṃjñā sattvo naro manuṣyo mānavaś ca poṣaḥ puruṣaḥ[192] pudgalo jīvo jantur iti / atreyaṃ pratijñā ahaṃ cakṣuṣā rūpāṇi paśyāmīti /

---

184 (Ejima:) Pra: paśyanta. Read *"paśyantaḥ"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

185 (Ejima:) dṛṣṭisthānam. Ms: *sic*. T(98a1): bdag tu lta baḥi gnas su(=ātmadṛṣṭisthānam). Zhēn(305c13): 我見處深坑. Xuán(154a23): 惡見深坑.

186 (Ejima:) "skandheṣv eva pudgalākhye"ti. Unidentified.

187 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

188 (Ejima:) mānuṣyakasūtram /. Ms: mānuṣyakasūtraṃ.

T(98a2): mi pham paḥi mdo (D: mi pham paḥi mdo=ṅes paḥi don gyi mdo) las kyaṅ/. Pūr(127b5): miḥi mdo las. Zhēn(305c14): 於人經中說. Xuán(154a25): 如人契經作如是說.

(Lee:) Read "mānuṣyakasūtram /", inserting *daṇḍa* as in Pra.

189 (Ejima:) Pra: cakṣuḥpratītya. Read *"cakṣuḥ pratītya"*.

190 (Ejima:) sparśasahajātā. "sparśa-" omitted in T(98a2), Zhēn(305c15), Xuán(154a26), but not in some versions of Zá 306(Taisho 2, 87c27).

191 (Ejima:) Pra: rūpiṇo. Read " *'rūpiṇaḥ"*.

192 (Ejima:) puruṣaḥ. Omitted in T(98a4), Zhēn(305c18), Xuán(154a29). "士其" in Zá 306(Taisho 2, 87c29) corresponds to "puruṣaḥ"?

{%Tib 9-17}[C.87a3-87b5, D.85b4-86a6, N.98a3-98b5, P.97b8-98b3]

gaṅ zag pa[193] rnams mig gis gaṅ zag bltaḥo ṣes lta na[194] bdag med pas bdag bltaḥo ṣes bya ba yin pas bdag tu lta baḥi gnas su gyur pa yaṅ yin no//

bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kyaṅ mdo las/ phuṅ po rnams kho na la gaṅ zag ces byaḥo[195] ṣes ḥdi ṅes[196] par mdsad do// mi pham paḥi mdo[197] las[198] kyaṅ/ mig daṅ gzugs rnams la brten nas mig gi rnam par śes pa skyeḥo// gsum ḥdus pas ni reg paḥo// lhan cig skyes pa[199] ni tshor ba daṅ ḥdu śes daṅ sems pa dag ste/ de ltar na gzugs can ma yin paḥi phuṅ po de bṣi[200] daṅ/ gzugs can mig gi dbaṅ po daṅ de sñed cig la mi ñid ces byaḥo// ḥdi la sems can daṅ/ miṅ[201] daṅ[202] śed las skyes daṅ/ śed bu daṅ/ gso ba daṅ/ gaṅ zag daṅ/ srog daṅ/ skye bo ṣes bya ba ḥdi ni[203] miṅ yin no// ḥdi la bdag gi[204] mig gis[205] gzugs rnams[206] bltaḥo ṣes bya ba ḥdi ni khas ḥche ba yin no//

---

193 NP.omit *pa*
194 CD.lta na=gaṅ zag lta ba ni
195 NP.insert // after *byaḥo*
196 C.ṅes=des
197 CD.mi pham paḥi mdo=ṅes paḥi don gyi mdo
198 C.las=pas
199 CD.pa=pas
200 CD.bṣi=bṣin
201 CDNP.=*sic.* It is the better reading to read. *'mi'* instead of *miṅ.*
202 NP.insert / after *daṅ*
203 NP.omit *ni*
204 CD.gi=gis
205 CD.gis=gi
206 NP.rnams=rnams la

atrāyaṃ vyavahāra ity api sa āyuṣmān evaṃnāmā evaṃjātya evaṃgotra evamāhāra evaṃsukhaduḥkhapratisaṃvedī evaṃdīrghāyur evaṃcirasthitika evamāyuḥparyanta iti / iti hi bhikṣavaḥ saṃjñāmātrakam evaitat pratijñāmātrakam evaitad vyavahāramātrakam evaitat[207] / sarva ime dharmāḥ anityāḥ saṃskṛtāś cetitāḥ[208] pratītyasamutpannā" iti /[209]

nītārthaṃ ca sūtraṃ pratisaraṇam uktaṃ bhagavatā /[210] tasmān na punaḥ parīkṣyate /

---

207 (Ejima:) Pra: saṃjñāmātrakam evaitad vyavahāramātrakam evaitat.

Ms: *sic*(*Lee: saṃjñāmātrakam evai<ta>d vyavahāramātrakam evaitat).

T(98a6), Zhēn(305c21), Xuán(154b4) and also Zá 306(Taisho 2, 88a5) read *"saṃjñāmātrakam evaitat pratijñāmātrakam evaitad vyavahāramātrakam evaitat"*. Read therefore so.

208 (Ejima:) Pra: ceti tāḥ. Ms: cetitāḥ.

T(98a6): sems pas ḥphaṅs pa(=cittākṣiptāḥ?). Zhēn(305c23): 故意所造. Xuán(154b6): 思所造. Zá 306(Taisho 2, 88a6): 思願. Read *"cetitāḥ"*.

209 (Ejima:) mānuṣyakasūtram / "cakṣuḥ pratītya(read so in stead of "cakṣuḥpratītya")... pratītyasamutpannā" iti/.

Partially quoted 146, 12. Cf. Zá 306(Taisho 2, 87c26).

210 (Ejima:) nītārthaṃ ca sūtraṃ pratisaraṇam uktaṃ bhagavatā/.

Cf. Pūr(373b1), Yaś(704, 19).

ḥdi la[211] ḥdi ltar tshe daṅ ldan pa deḥi miṅ ni ḥdi ṣes bya/ rigs ni ḥdi ṣes bya/[212] rus ni ḥdi ṣes bya/ kha zas[213] ni ḥdi lta bu ṣig za za/ bde ba daṅ sdug bsṅal ni ḥdi lta bu ṣig myoṅ/ tshe ni ḥdi tsam ṣig thub/ yun ni ji srid cig gnas/ tseḥi mthaḥ ni ḥdi tsam ṣig go ṣes bya ba ḥdi ni tha[214] sñad yin no// dge sloṅ dag de ltar na ḥdi dag ni miṅ tsam/ ḥdi dag khas ḥche ba tsam/ ḥdi dag ni tha sñad tsam ste/ chos ḥdi dag[215] thams cad ni mi rtag pa/ ḥdus byas pa/ sems pas ḥphaṅs pa/ rten ciṅ ḥbrel bar ḥbyuṅ ba dag yin no ṣes gsuṅs so//

bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kyaṅ ṅes paḥi don gyi mdo la brten par gsuṅs te/ de lta bas na[216] ḥdi ni yaṅ daṅ yaṅ du brtag par bya ba yin no[217]//

---

211 CD.la=la ni

212 NP.omit /

213 NP.kha zas=zas

214 C.tha=bra?

215 NP.omit *ḥdi dag*

216 C.de lta bas na=de lta ba se na?

217 CDNP.brtag par bya ba yin no=*sic.* It is the better reading to read *'brtag bar bya ba ma yin no'* inserting 'ma'.

tathā coktaṃ "sarvam astīti brāhmaṇa yāvad eva dvādaśāyatanānī"ti[218] /[219] yadi cāyaṃ pudgalo nāyatanaṃ na so 'stīti[220] siddham / athāyatanaṃ na tarhy avaktavyaḥ / teṣām api caivaṃ paśyato "yāvatā bhikṣo cakṣur yāvatā rūpāṇi vistareṇa etāvatā bhikṣo tathāgataḥ sarvaṃ ca prajñapayati[221] sarvaprajñaptiṃ ce"ti /[222]

bimbisārasūtre coktam /[223] "ātmā ātmīyeti[224] bhikṣavo bālo 'śrutavān pṛthagjanaḥ prajñaptim anupatito na tv atrātmā[225] vā ātmīyaṃ vā duḥkham idam utpadyamānam utpadyate" iti[226] vistaraḥ //

---

218 (Ejima:) Pra: dvādaśāyanānīti. Read *"dvādaśāyatanānīti"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

219 (Ejima:) "sarvam astīti brāhmaṇa..."ti/.

Also quoted 301, 8. Cf. Zá 319(Taisho 2, 91a27), SN 35, 23(IV, 15, 13-16).

220 (Ejima:) Pra: na sostīti. Read *"na so 'stīti"*.

221 (Ejima:) Pra: prajñāpayati. Ms: prajñapayati.

(Lee:) Read *"prajñapayati"* as in Ms.

222 (Ejima:) "yāvatā bhikṣo cakṣur...ce"ti/. Cf. Zá 319(Taisho 2, 91a28).

223 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

224 (Lee:) Pra: ātmeti. Ms: *sic.* T(98b2): bdag daṅ bdag gi ṣes bya ba ni.

Read *"ātmīyeti"* according to Tib.

225 (Ejima:) Pra: na tv ātrātmā. Ms: *sic*(*Lee: na tv atra-).

Read *"na tv atrātmā"*.

226 (Ejima:) bimbisārasūtre coktam "ātmā ātmeti..." iti. Quoted 140, 17.

Cf. Zhōng 62(Taisho 1, 498b10). The similar phrase is cited in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 462b17).

de bṣin du bram ze thams cad yod do ṣes bya ba ni ḥdi lta ste/ skye mched bcu gñis dag tu zad do ṣes kyaṅ gsuṅs so// gal te gaṅ zag ḥdi skye mched ma yin na ni de yod pa ma yin no ṣes bya bar grub po// ḥon te skye mched yin no ṣe na/ ḥo na ni brjod par bya ba[227] ma yin no// de dag gi ltar na yaṅ ḥdi skad du dge sloṅ mi[228] ji sñed pa daṅ/ gzugs ji sñed pa ṣes bya ba rgyas par gsuṅs nas/ dge sloṅ ḥdi ji sñed cig ni[229] de bṣin gśegs pa[230] thams cad ḥdogs par mdsad do// thams cad brtags[231] so ṣes gsuṅs so ṣes ḥdon to//

gzugs can sñiṅ poḥi mdo las kyaṅ/ dge sloṅ dag bdag daṅ bdag gi ṣes bya ba ni byis pa so soḥi skye bo thos pa daṅ mi ldan pas brtags pa la lhuṅ bar zad de/ ḥdi la bdag gam bdag gi ni med[232] kyi sdug bsṅal ḥdi skye ba na skye bar zad do ṣes bya ba rgyas par gsuṅs so//

---

227 CDNP.brjod par bya ba=*sic*. It is the better reading to read *'brjod par mi bya ba'* inserting *'mi'*.

228 CDNP.mi=*sic*. It is the better reading to read *'mig'* instead of *'mi'*.

229 NP.ḥdi ji sñed cig ni=ḥdi sñed cig ni

230 NP.pa=pas

231 NP.brtags=btags

232 C.med=miṅ

{%Skt 9-18}[Pra. 46525-46617]{%Chn}[Z. 306a3-19; X. 154b16-154c5]

- śailayāpy arhantyā[233] māram ārabhyoktam /[234]

"manyase kiṃ nu sattveti māra dṛṣṭigataṃ[235] hi te /
śūnyaḥ saṃskārapuñjo 'yaṃ na hi sattvo 'tra[236] vidyate //
yathaiva hy aṅgasaṃbhārāt saṃjñā ratha iti smṛtā /
evaṃ skandhān upādāya saṃvṛtyā sattva ucyate //"

iti /[237]

kṣudrake[238] 'pi cāgame bādaribrāhmaṇam[239] adhikṛtyoktam /[240]

"śṛṇu tvaṃ bādare[241] dharmaṃ sarvagranthipramocanam /
yathā saṃkliśyate cittaṃ yathā cittaṃ viśudhyati //
ātmaiva hy ātmano nāsti viparītena kalpyate /
nāstīha sattva ātmā vā dharmās tv ete sahetukāḥ //

---

233 (Ejima:) śailayāpy arhantyā Ms: *sic.*

T(98b3): dgra bcom pa drug gis kyaṅ(=ṣaḍbhir apy arhadbhiḥ?). Zhēn(306a3): 有阿羅漢比丘尼名世羅. Xuán(154b16): 有阿羅漢苾芻尼名世羅.

234 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

235 (Ejima:) Pra: māradṛṣṭigataṃ.

Read *"māra dṛṣṭigataṃ"*("māra" is vocative as in SN 5, 10).

236 (Ejima:) Pra: sattvotra. Read *"sattvo 'tra"*.

237 (Ejima:) śailayāpy arhantyā māram ārabhyoktaṃ "manyase..."//iti/.

Out of two verses, the first one is left out in Zhēn(306a5). Cf. Zá 1202(Taisho 2, 327b7), SN 5, 10(I, 135, 18).

(Lee:) Pra: ucyate // iti /. Ms: ucyata iti /. Read *"ucyate // iti /"* as in Pra.

238 (Ejima:) Pra: kṣadrake. Read "kṣudrake" as in Ms and in the first edition.

239 (Ejima:) Pra: daridrabrāhmaṇam. Ms: *sic.*

T(98b5): rgya śug gi bu(cf. Mahāvyutpatti 5809: badaraphalam, rgya śug gi ḥbru), Zhēn(306a7): 波遮利(=vakkali?)婆羅門, Xuán(154b22): 婆羅門婆拕梨(=bādari). *Bié-yì-zá-ē-hán-jīng* 151(Taisho 2, 431a7): 尊者薄迦梨(=vakkali?).

Read tentatively *"bādaribrāhmaṇam"*.

240 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

241 (Ejima:) Pra: tvaṃ svādare. Ms: tvaṃm bādare.(*Lee: tvaṃs bādare)

Read *"tvaṃ bādare"*.

{%Tib 9-18}[C.87b5-88a3, D.86a6-86b4, N.98b5-99a4, P.98b3-99a2]

dgra bcom pa drug gis kyaṅ bdud las brtsams nas//

sems can ṣes bya bdud ci sems//
khyod ni lta bar gyur pa yin//
ḥdu byed phuṅ po ḥdi stoṅ ste//
ḥdi la sems can yod ma yin//
ji ltar yan lag tshogs rnams la//
śiṅ rtaḥi miṅ du bśad pa ltar//
de bṣin phuṅ po rnams brten nas//
kun rdsob sems can ṣes byaḥo//[242]

ṣes bśad do//

luṅ phran tshegs[243] las kyaṅ/ bram ze rgya[244] śug gi buḥi dbaṅ du byas nas//

ji ltar sems ni kun ñon moṅs//
ji ltar sems ni rnam byaṅ[245] daṅ//
mdud pa thams cad ḥjig[246] byed paḥi//
chos ni rgya śug bu khyod ñon//
bdag ñid kyis ni[247] bdag med de//
phyin ci log gis rtog[248] par byed//
ḥdi la bdag gam sems can med//
chos ḥdi dag ni rgyu daṅ bcas//

---

242 NP.omit //
243 C.tshegs=tshogs
244 C.rgya=rgyu
245 C.byaṅ=byad
246 C.ḥjig=ḥṅig?
247 NP.ni=na
248 CD.rtog=rtogs

dvādaśaiva bhavāṅgāni skandhāyatanadhātavaḥ /
vicintya sarvāṇy etāni pudgalo nopalabhyate //
śūnyam adhyātmakaṃ paśya śūnyaṃ paśya bahirgatam /
na labhyate so 'pi kaścid yo bhāvayati śūnyatām //"
iti /[249]

tathoktam /[250] "pañcādīnavā ātmopalambhe / ātmadṛṣṭir bhavati sattvadṛṣṭir jīvadṛṣṭiś ca[251] / nirviśeṣo bhavati tīrthikaiḥ sārdhaṃ unmārgapratipanno bhavati / śūnyatāyām asya cittaṃ na praskandati na prasīdati na saṃtiṣṭhate na vimucyate[252] / āryadharmā asya na vyavadāyanta" iti /[253]

---

249 (Ejima:) kṣudrake(read so instead of "kṣadrake") pi cāgame bādaribrāhmaṇam(read so) adhikṛtyoktaṃ "śṛṇu tvaṃ..."iti /.
Cf. *Bié-yì-zá-ē-hán-jīng* 151(Taisho 2, 431a20).
(Lee:) Pra: śūnyatām iti /. Ms: śūnyatām iti //. Read "*śūnyatāṃ // iti /*".

250 (Lee:) Pra: omit daṇḍa. Ms: //. Insert daṇḍa.

251 (Lee:) Pra: sattvadṛṣṭiḥ /. T(98b8): bdag tu lta ba dan sems can du lta ba dan srog tu lta bar ḥgyur/. Yaś(704, 32): ātmadṛṣṭir bhavati yāvaj jīvadṛṣṭir iti. Zhēn(306a16-17): 謂起我見衆生見, 墮於見處. Xuán(154c2-3): 謂起我見及有情見, 墮惡見趣. Read "*sattvadṛṣṭir jīvadṛṣṭiś ca /*".

252 (Ejima:) na vimucyate.
T(99a1): rnam par grol bar mi ḥgyur. Xuán(154c4): 不得解說. Zhēn(306a18) seems to omit it. Yaś(705, 1): nādhimucyata iti (Tibetan(388a4): rnam par grol bar mi ḥgyur ṣes bya baḥi), Pūr(373b7): rnam par grol bar mi ḥgyur.

253 (Ejima:) "pañcādīnavā ātmopalambhe..." iti/. Unidentified.

srid paḥi yan lag bcu gñis daṅ//
phuṅ po skye mched khams rnams te//
rnam par bsams na ḥdi kun la//
gaṅ zag dmigs pa ma yin no//
naṅ gi stoṅ pa yin par ltos//
phyi rol gnas pa stoṅ par ltos//
gaṅ ṣig[254] stoṅ pa ñid sgom[255] pa//
de yaṅ ḥgaḥ yaṅ mi dmigs so//

ṣes gsuṅs so//

de[256] bṣin du bdag tu[257] dmigs pa la ñes dmigs lṅa yod do// bdag tu lta ba daṅ sems can du lta ba daṅ[258] srog tu lta bar ḥgyur/ mu stegs can rnams daṅ khyad par med par ḥgyur/[259] lam gol bar ṣugs par ḥgyur/ [260]ḥdiḥi sems stoṅ pa ñid la mi ḥjug ciṅ rab tu daṅ bar mi ḥgyur la yaṅ dag par mi gnas pas rnam par grol bar mi ḥgyur/ ḥdiḥi ḥphags paḥi chos rnams rnam par byaṅ bar mi ḥgyur ro[261] ṣes gsuṅs so//

---

254 CD.gaṅ ṣig=raṅ bṣin
255 CD.sgom=bsgom
256 P.de=da
257 NP.tu=du
258 CD.insert / after *daṅ*
259 CD./=// ;NP.omit /
260 C.inserts / before *ḥdiḥi*
261 N.inserts // after *ro*

{%Skt 9-19}[Pra. 46617-46624]{%Chn}[Z. 306a19-28; X. 154c5-12]

- na vai ta[262] evaṃ granthaṃ pramāṇaṃ kurvanti / kiṃ kāraṇam /
- nāsmākam ayaṃ nikāye paṭhyata iti /
- kiṃ punas teṣāṃ nikāya eva pramāṇam āhosvid buddhavacanam / yadi nikāya eva pramāṇaṃ na tarhi teṣāṃ buddhaḥ śāstā / na ca te śākyaputrīyā bhavanti / atha buddhavacanaṃ pramāṇam / ayaṃ granthaḥ kasmān na pramāṇam / na hi kilaitat buddhavacanam iti / kiṃ kāraṇam /
- nāsmākaṃ nikāye paṭhyata iti /[263]
- ayam anyāyo vartate /
- ko 'trānyāyaḥ /
- yo hi granthaḥ / sarveṣu nikāyāntareṣv āmnāyate / na ca sūtraṃ dharmatāṃ vā bādhate / so 'smābhir apāṭhān na buddhavacanam iti vacanaṃ kevalaṃ sāhasamātram /

---

262 (Lee:) Pra: vaita. Read *"vai ta"*.

263 (Ejima:) Pra: nāsmākaṃ nikāye paṭhyata iti /. Ms: nāsmākam ayaṃ... . T(99a4): kho bo cag gi sde pa mi ḥdon(P: ḥdod) paḥi phyir ro ṣes zer ro (*Lee: inserts ṣes) grag go/(*sic*). Read *"nāsmākam ayaṃ nikāye paṭhyata iti /"* as in Ms.

(Lee:) Zhēn(306a24-25): 於我部中非昔所誦故. Xuán(154b9): 我部不誦故.

Read *"nāsmākam nikāye paṭhyata iti /"* as in Pra, omitting *ayaṃ* according to Tib, Chn1 and Chn2.

{%Tib 9-19}[C.88a3-6, D.86b4-7, N.99a4-7, P.99a2-6]

de dag ni gṣuṅ ḥdi tshad mar mi byed pa ñid do// ciḥi phyir ṣe na/ ḥdi kho bo cag gi[264] sde pa mi ḥdon to ṣes zer ro//

ci de dag la sde pa kho na tshad ma yin nam/ ḥon te saṅs rgyas kyi bkaḥ[265] tshad ma yin[266]/ gal te sde pa kho na tshad ma yin na ḥo na ni de dag gi ston[267] pa yaṅ saṅs rgyas ma yin la/ śākyaḥi bu yaṅ ma yin par ḥgyur ro//[268] ḥon te saṅs rgyas kyi bkaḥ tshad ma yin no ṣe na ni gṣuṅ ḥdi ciḥi phyir tshad ma ma yin/ ḥdi ni saṅs rgyas kyi bkaḥ ma yin no// ciḥi[269] phyir ṣe na[270]//

kho bo cag gi sde pa mi ḥdon[271] paḥi phyir ro[272] ṣes zer ro ṣes grag go//

ḥdi ni mi rigs par ṣugs pa yin no//

ḥdir mi rigs pa gaṅ ṣig yin ṣe na//

gṣuṅ gaṅ ṣig sde pa gṣan thams cad las ḥbyuṅ[273] la mdo daṅ/ chos ñid daṅ yaṅ mi ḥgal ba de kho bo cag mi ḥdon paḥi phyir saṅs rgyas kyi bkaḥ ma yin no ṣes[274] smra ba ste/ gzu lum[275] tsam ḥbaḥ ṣig tu zad do//

---

264 P.cag gi=cig
265 C.bkaḥ=bkal
266 NP.yin=yin te
267 NP.ston=stoṅ
268 CD.ḥgyur ro//=ḥgyur/
269 CD.ciḥi=de ciḥi
270 CD.na=na ni
271 P.ḥdon=ḥdod
272 NP. insert // after *ro*
273 NP.ḥbyuṅ=byuṅ
274 P.ṣes=ṣes ṣes
275 CD.lum=lums

{%Skt 9-20}[Pra. 46624-46713]{%Chn}[Z. 306a28-306b14; X. 154c12-155a1]

- kiṃ cedam api teṣāṃ sūtraṃ nāsti "sarvadharmā anātmāna" iti /[276]

syāt matam / naiva hi pudgalo dharma ucyate nāpy anyo dharmād iti / evaṃ tarhi na manovijñeyaḥ sidhyati / "dvayaṃ pratītya vijñānasyotpādaḥ" ity avadhāraṇāt /

iha caiva kathaṃ[277] vikalpyate /[278] "anātmany ātmeti saṃjñāviparyāsaś cittaviparyāso dṛṣṭiviparyāsa" iti /[279]

- anātmany ātmeti viparyāso na tv ātmani /[280]
- kiṃ ca punar anātmā /
- skandhāyatanadhātavaḥ /[281]

---

276 (Ejima:) "sarvadharmā anātmāna" iti /.

Cf. Zá 262(Taisho 2, 66b14), SN 22, 90(III, 133, 31), etc.

277 (Lee:) Pra: caivaṃ. T(99a8): ... ṣes bya ba ḥdi kho na la(P.omits 'la') yaṅ ji ltar rtog/. Zhēn(306b2): 於此文中汝云何分別救難. Xuán(154c16): 又於餘經如何會釋. Read *"caiva kathaṃ"*.

278 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

279 (Ejima:) "anātmany ātmeti..." iti /.

Cf. Zá 43(Taisho 2, 10c23), *Dà-jí-fǎ-mén-jīng* (Taisho 1, 229c22).

280 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

281 (Ejima:) Pra: kiṃ ca punaḥ/ "nātmā skandhāyatanadhātavaḥ". Ms: *sic.*

T(99a8): bdag med pa yaṅ gaṅ ṣig yin/ phuṅ po daṅ skye mched daṅ/ khams rnams yin no/. Zhēn(306b4): 何者非我, 諸陰入界. Xuán(154c18): 非我者何. 謂蘊處界. Read *"kiṃ ca punar anātmā/ skandhāyatanadhātavaḥ/"*.

{%Tib 9-20}[C.88a6-88b5, D.86b7-87a7, N.99a7-99b7, P.99a6-99b5]

gṣan yaṅ de dag la chos thams cad ni bdag med paḥo ṣes bya baḥi mdo ḥdi yaṅ med dam/

gaṅ zag ni chos ṣes kyaṅ mi bya la chos las gṣan ṣes kyaṅ mi byaḥo[282] ṣes bya bar ḥdod par gyur na/ de lta na ni yid kyi[283] rnam par śes par bya bar[284] mi ḥgrub ste/ gñis la brten nas rnam[285] par śes pa skyeḥo[286] ṣes ṅes par gsuṅs paḥi phyir ro//

bdag med pa la bdag go sñam du ḥdu śes phyin ci log pa daṅ/ sems phyin ci log pa daṅ/ lta ba phyin ci log pa ṣes bya ba ḥdi kho na la[287] yaṅ ji ltar rtog//

bdag med pa la bdag go sñam pa phyin ci log yin gyi bdag la ni ma yin no//

bdag med pa yaṅ gaṅ ṣig yin/

phuṅ po daṅ skye mched daṅ/ khams rnams yin no//

---

282 NP.insert // after *byaḥo*

283 CDNP.kyi=*sic.* It is the better reading to read *'kyis'* instead of *'kyi'*.

284 NP.omit *bya bar*

285 C.rnam=nam?

286 NP.insert // after *skyeḥo*

287 P.omits *la*

- yat tāvad uktaṃ prāk no tu vaktavyaṃ rūpāṇi vā no veti tat tāvad apoḍham[288] / uktaṃ ca sūtrāntare "ye kecit bhikṣavaḥ śramaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā ātmeti samanupaśyantaḥ samanupaśyanti sarve ta imān eva pañcopādānaskandhān" iti /[289] tasmāt sarva evānātmany ātmagrāhaḥ / tathoktam / "ye kecid anekavidhaṃ pūrvanivāsaṃ samanusmarantaḥ samanusmārṣuḥ samanusmaranti samanusmariṣyanti vā punaḥ sarve ta imān eva pañcopādanaskandhān" iti /[290]

- yady evam idaṃ kasmād āha "rūpavān aham abhūvam atīte 'dhvanī"ti[291] /[292]

- evam anekavidhaṃ ye samanusmarantīti pradarśayati / yadi tu rūpavantaṃ pudgalaṃ paśyet / satkāyadṛṣṭiprasaṅgaḥ syāt / apāṭha eva tv atra śaraṇaṃ syāt / tasmāt prajñaptisat pudgalo rāśidhārādivat[293] /

---

288 (Lee:) Pra: aśocam Ms: aśocaṃ. T(99b1): gaṅ yin pa ni bsal to/. Yaś(705, 13): apoḍham. Zhēn(306b5): 此言最不可忍. Xuán(154c19): 便違前說.

Read *"apoḍham"* according to Tib, Chn2.

289 (Ejima:) "ye kecit bhikṣavaḥ..." iti /. Quoted 282, 1.

Cf. Zá 45(Taisho 2, 11b3), Zá 63(Taisho 2, 16b15), SN 22, 47(III, 46, 10).

290 (Ejima:) "ye kecid anekavidhaṃ..."ti /.

Cf. Zá 46(Taisho 2, 11b23), SN 22, 79(III, 86, 11).

291 (Ejima:) Pra: adhvanīti. Ms: dhvanīti. Read *" 'dhvanīti"*.

292 (Ejima:) "rūpavān aham abhūvam atīte 'dhvanī(read so)"ti /.

Cf. Zá 46(Taisho 2, 11b25), SN 22, 79(III, 86, 15).

293 (Lee:) Pra: rāśidhārāvat. Ms: *sic.*

T(99b5): phuṅ po daṅ rgyun la sogs pa bṣin no/. Yaś(705, 22): rāśidhārādivat. Zhēn(306b14): 譬如聚流等. Xuán(152c16): 如聚如流.

Read *"rāśidhārādivat"* according to Tib, Chn1.

re ṣig sṅar gzugs rnams ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi bya/[294] gzugs rnams ma[295] yin ṣes kyaṅ brjod par mi byaḥo ṣes smras pa gaṅ yin pa ni bsal to// mdo gṣan las/ dge sloṅ dag dge sbyoṅ[296] ṅam bram ze gaṅ la la[297] bdag go sñam du rjes su lta ba de dag thams cad ni ñe bar len paḥi phuṅ po lṅa po ḥdi dag kho na la ṣes gsuṅs te/ de lta bas na bdag tu ḥdsin pa thams cad ni bdag med pa kho na la yin no// de bṣin du gaṅ la sṅon gyi gnas rnam pa du ma rjes su dran pa na[298] rjes su dran par gyur tam/ rjes su dran nam/ rjes su dran par ḥgyur ba de dag thams cad ni ñe bar len paḥi phuṅ po lṅa po ḥdi dag kho na la ṣes gsuṅs so//

gal te de lta na ni ciḥi phyir bdag ni ḥdas paḥi dus na gzugs ḥdi lta bu daṅ ldan par gyur to[299] ṣes gsuṅs//[300]

gaṅ dag de ltar rnam pa du ma rjes su dran pa[301] ṣes bya ba[302] rab tu ston par byed do// gal te gaṅ zag gzugs daṅ ldan par lta bar gyur na ḥjig tshogs la lta bar thal bar ḥgyur bas ḥdi la ni ma[303] ston[304] pa kho na skyabs yin no// de lta bas na gaṅ zag ni btags paḥi yod pa yin te/ phuṅ po daṅ rgyun la sogs pa bṣin no//

---

294 CD.bya/=byaḥo//
295 NP.omit *ma*
296 CN.sbyoṅ=sbyod?
297 NP.insert / after *la*
298 CD.omit *rjes su dran pa na*
299 NP.insert // after *to*
300 NP.//=/
301 NP.insert / after *dran pa*
302 P.ba=bar
303 N.ma=mi
304 CD.ston=bton

{%Skt 9-21}[Pra. 46714-46801]{%Chn}[Z. 306b14-27; X. 155a1-17]

- yady evaṃ tarhi na buddhaḥ sarvajñaḥ prāpnoti / na hi kiṃcic cittam[305] asti caittā vā yat sarvaṃ jānīyāt kṣaṇikatvāt / pudgalas tu jānīyāt /

- evaṃ tarhi cittavināśe pudgalasyāvināśābhyupagamāt nityatvam asyābhyupetaṃ bhavati / naiva ca vayaṃ sarvatra jñānasaṃmukhībhāvād buddhaṃ sarvajñam ācakṣmahe / kiṃ tarhi / sāmarthyāt / yā hy asau buddhākhyā saṃtatis tasyā idam asti sāmarthyaṃ yad ābhogamātreṇāviparītaṃ jñānam utpadyate yatreṣṭam // āha cātra /

"saṃtānena samarthatvād yathāgniḥ sarvabhuṅ mataḥ /
tathā sarvavid eṣṭavyo na sakṛtsarvavedanāt[306] //"[307]

---

305 (Ejima:) Pra: trittam. Read *"cittam"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

306 (Ejima:) Pra: 'sakṛt sarvasya vedanāt. Ms: na sakṛt sarvasya vedanāt.
T(100a1): cig car thams cad mkhyen phyir min/.
Read *"na sakṛtsarvavedanāt"*(../⏑ – ⏑ –/).

307 (Ejima:) "saṃtānena samarthatvād../".
Cited and criticized in the *Fó-dì-jīng-lùn*(*Buddhabhūmiśāstra*)(Taisho 26, 309c7).

{%Tib 9-21}[C.88b-89a3, D.87a7-87b4, N.99b7-100a5, P.99b5-100a3]

gal te de ltar na ḥo na ni saṅs rgyas thams cad mkhyen pa ma yin par ḥgyur te/ thams cad śes par ḥgyur baḥi sems sam[308] sems las byuṅ ba gaṅ yin pa de ni cuṅ zad kyaṅ med de/ skad cig ma yin paḥi phyir ro/[309] /gaṅ zag gis ni śes par ḥgyur ro//

de lta na ni ḥo na sems ḥjig pa na gaṅ zag mi ḥjig par khas blaṅs paḥi phyir ḥdi rtag pa ñid du khas blaṅs pa yin no// kho bo cag ni thams cad la[310] mkhyen pa mṅon sum du gyur paḥi phyir saṅs rgyas thams cad mkhyen pa yin par ni mi smraḥo// ḥo na ji lta bu ṣe na/ mthu yod paḥi phyir te/ saṅs rgyas ṣes bya baḥi rgyud gaṅ yin pa de la gaṅ du bṣed par gtad pa[311] tsam gyis phyin ci ma log paḥi mkhyen pa skye ba[312] gaṅ yin paḥi mthu ḥdi yod do// ḥdir smras pa//

rgyun gyis spyod[313] paḥi phyir na dper//
me yis[314] thams cad sreg ḥdod lta//
de bṣin thams cad mkhyen ḥdod byaḥi//
cig car thams cad mkhyen phyir min//

---

308 NP.sam=daṅ
309 CD.phyir ro//=phyir/
310 CD.omit *la*
311 C.gtad=btad; D.gtad pa=gtaṅ ba
312 NP.insert / after *skye ba*
313 D.spyod=sbyod
314 C.yis=mis?

- katham idaṃ gamyate /

- atītādivacanāt /

"ye cābhyatītāḥ saṃbuddhā ye ca buddhā anāgatāḥ /
yaś ca etarhi saṃbuddho bahūnāṃ śokanāśanaḥ //"

iti /[315]

skandhā eva ca traiyadhvikā iṣyante na pudgalo[316] yuṣmābhiḥ /

---

315 (Ejima:) "ye cābhyatītāḥ saṃbuddhā..." iti /.

Cf. Zá 100(Taisho 2, 28a11), Zá 1188(Taisho 2, 322a22), *Chū-yào-jing*(Taisho 4, 718b24), AN 4, 36(II, 21, 19), SN 6, 2(I, 140, 11), *Mahāvastu* ed. by Senart(III, 327, 10), *Udānavarga* ed. by Bernhard XXI, 11(I, 281, 7), etc.

(Lee:) Pra: śokanāśana iti /. Read *"śokanāśanaḥ //iti /"*.

316 (Lee:) Pra: pudgalā. Ms: *sic*.

T(100a2-3): /khyed cag kyaṅ phuṅ po rnams kho na dus gsum pa yin par ḥdod kyi gaṅ zag ni ma yin no/. Cf. Yaś(706, 1-2): na pudgala iti. Zhēn(306b27): 汝等但許五陰有三世非許人. Xuán(155a17): 汝宗唯許蘊有三世非數取趣.

Read *"pudgalo"*.

ḥdi ji ltar khoṅ du chud ce na/
ḥdas pa la sogs pa gsuṅs paḥi phyir te//

rdsogs saṅs rgyas ḥdas gaṅ dag daṅ//
saṅs rgyas ma byon gaṅ dag daṅ//
da ltaḥi rdsogs saṅs rgyas gaṅ yin//
maṅ po rnams kyi[317] mya ṅan sel//[318]

ṣes gsuṅs so//

khyed cag kyaṅ phuṅ po rnams kho na dus gsum pa[319] yin par ḥdod kyi gaṅ zag ni ma yin no//

317 CD.kyi=ni
318 CD. //=/
319 CD.pa=ba

{%Skt 9-22}[Pra. 46801-46809]{%Chn}[Z. 306b27-306c8; X. 155a23-155b9]

- yadi skandhā eva pudgalaḥ[320] kasmād idam āha / "bhāraṃ ca vo bhikṣavo deśayiṣyāmi bhārādānaṃ ca bhāranikṣepaṇaṃ ca bhārahāraṃ ce"ti /[321]
- kasmād idaṃ na vaktavyaṃ syāt /
- na hi bhāra eva bhārahāro yuktaḥ /
- kiṃ kāraṇam /
- na hy evaṃ dṛśyata iti /
- avaktavyo 'pi na yuktaḥ /
- kiṃ kāraṇam /
- na hy evaṃ dṛśyate / bhārādānasyāpi skandhāsaṃgrahaprasaṅgāc ca /

ity artham eva bhārahāraṃ nirdideśa bhagavān / "yo 'sāv āyuṣmān evaṃnāmā yāvad evaṃcirasthitika evamāyuḥparyantaḥ"[322] sa eva[323] yathā vijñāyeta / mānyathā vijñāyi nityo vāvaktavyo[324] veti[325] / skandhā eva ca skandhānām upaghātāya saṃvartante pūrvakā uttareṣām iti bhāraṃ ca bhārahāraṃ ca kṛtvoktāḥ / upaghātārtho hi bhāra iti /[326]

---

320 (Ejima:) Pra: pudgalāḥ. Ms: pudgalaḥ.

(Lee:) Read *"pudgalaḥ"* as in Ms.

321 (Ejima:) "bhāraṃ ca vo bhikṣavo deśayiṣyāmi..."ti /.

The similar phrase is cited in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 463b11).

Cf. Zá 73(Taisho 2, 19a16), Zēng 25, 4(Taisho 2, 631c12), SN 22, 22(III, 25, 17), *Tattvasaṃgrahapañjikā* (ed. by Krishnamacharya)(130, 1)

322 (Ejima:) "yo 'sāv āyuṣmān evaṃnāmā yāvad evaṃcirasthitika evamāyuḥparyantaḥ". Cf. Zá 73(Taisho 2, 19a22), Zēng 25, 4(Taisho 2, 631c19), Zá 306(Taisho 2, 88a4), SN 22, 22(III, 25, 25), *Tattvasaṃgrahapañjikā* (ed. by Krishnamacharya)(130, 15).

323 (Ejima:) Pra: sa eṣa. Ms: sa eva. T(100a6): de ñid. Read *"sa eva"*.

Cf. Yaś(706, 22).

324 (Ejima:) Pra: vā avaktavyaṃ. Ms: vā avaktavyo. Read *"vāvaktavyo"*.

Cf. Yaś(706, 23).

325 (Ejima:) nityo vāvaktavyo(read so) veti. T(100a6): rtag paḥam gaṅ zag ces bya ba(?). Yaś(706, 23): nityo vāvaktavyo vā... iti.

326 (Ejima:) upaghātārtho hi bhāra iti/.

This sentence is left out in T(100a7), Zhēn(306c8), Xuán(155b9), or is possibly translated as "故非實有補特伽羅" by Xuán-zàng who sometimes renders the Sanskrit original more freely and explanatorily than Zhēn-dì.

{%Tib 9-22}[C.89a3-6, D.87b4-7, N.100a5-100b2, P.100a3-7]

gal te phuṅ po rnams kho na gaṅ zag yin na ciḥi phyir dge sloṅ[327] dag khyed[328] la khur yaṅ bstan to// khur len pa daṅ/ khur ḥdor ba daṅ/ khur khyer ba yaṅ bstan gyi[329] ṣes gsuṅs[330]/

ciḥi phyir gsuṅ bar[331] mi bya/

khur ñid khur khyer ba yin par ni rigs pa ma yin te/

ciḥi phyir ṣe na/

de lta bu mi snaṅ baḥi phyir ro//

brjod par bya ba ma yin pa yaṅ rigs pa ma yin te/

ciḥi phyir ṣe na/

de lta bu mi snaṅ baḥi phyir ro//

khur len pa[332] yaṅ phuṅ pos ma bsdus par yaṅ[333] thal bar[334] ḥgyur ro//

khur khyer ba ni bcom ldan ḥdas kyis ci nas tshe daṅ ldan pa miṅ ḥdi ṣes bya ba nas yun ni ḥdi srid cig gnas nas tsheḥi mthaḥ ni ḥdi tsam ṣig go ṣes bya baḥi bar gaṅ yin pa de ñid śes par ḥgyur ṣiṅ/ rtag paḥam gaṅ zag ces bya ba gṣan du śes par mi ḥgyur ba don de[335] kho naḥi phyir bstan ste/[336] phuṅ po sṅa ma rnams kho na phuṅ po phyi ma rnams la gnod par byed pa yin pas khur daṅ[337] khur khyer ba ṣes bśad pa yin no//

---

327 C.sloṅ=slod
328 N.kyed=kyod
329 NP.gyi=gyis
330 P.gsuṅs=gsuṅs so/
331 D.gsuṅ bar=gsuṅs par
332 NP.khur len pa=phuṅ po len pa
333 NP.omit *yaṅ*
334 NP.bar=bar yaṅ
335 NP.omit *de*
336 CD.ste/=te; N.ste/=te/
337 NP.daṅ=la

{%Skt 9-23}[Pra. 46810-46817]{%Chn}[Z. 306c8-20; X. 155b9-19]

- asty eva pudgalo yasmād uktaṃ "nāsti sattva upapāduka iti mithyādṛṣṭiḥ"[338] /
- kaś caivam āha nāsti sattva upapāduka iti / sattvas tu tathāsti yathā vibhakto bhagavateti brūmaḥ[339] /[340] tasmād yaḥ paratropapādukasattvākhya-skandhasaṃtānāpavādaṃ karoti tasyaiṣā mithyādṛṣṭir nāsti sattva upapāduka iti / skandhānām upapādukatvāt /

athaiṣā mithyādṛṣṭiḥ pudgalāpavādikā satī kiṃprahātavyā bhavet / na hy eṣā satyadarśanabhāvanāprahātavyā[341] yujyate / pudgalasya satyeṣv anantarbhāvāt[342] /

"ekaḥ pudgalo loka utpadyamāna utpadyate" iti[343] vacanāt na skandhā iti cet / na / samudāye 'py ekopacārād ekatilaikataṇḍulavat / ekarāśyekavacanavac ca /

---

338 (Ejima:) "nāsti sattva uapāduka iti mithyādṛṣṭiḥ".

Cited in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra* (Taisho 32, 464c20): 若言無人名爲邪見... .

Cf. Zhōng 189(Taisho 1, 735c15), Zá 306(Taisho 2, 88a18).

339 (Ejima:) Pra: brūbho. Read *"brūmo"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

340 (Ejima:) Pra: sattvas tu yathāsti tathā vibhakto bhagavateti brūmo(read so) mānuṣyakasūtre. Ms: *sic.*

T(100a8): ji ltar bcom ldan ḥdas kyis rnam par phye ba ltar yod do ṣes zer ro/, Xuán(155b11): 如佛所言我說有故(=tathāsti yathā vibhakto bhagavateti brūmaḥ/.). Zhēn(306c10): 如佛世尊分別衆生, 我說亦爾(=sattvas tu tathāsti yathā vibhakto bhagavateti brūmaḥ/). "mānuṣyakasūtre" may be added later.

Read *"sattvas tu tathāsti yathā vibhakto bhagavateti brūmaḥ /"*.

341 (Lee:) Pra: darśanabhāvanāprahātavyā. Ms: *sic.* T(100b1-2): ḥdi bden pa mthoṅ bas spaṅ bar bya ba yin par yaṅ mi ruṅ la bsgom pas spaṅ bar bya ba yin par yaṅ mi ruṅ ste/. Cf. Yaś(706, 28): ato na satyadarśanaprahātavyaiṣā... . Zhēn(306c14-15): 此邪見不應由見諦滅, 亦不應由修道滅. Xuán(155b15-16): 見修所斷, 理並不然. Read *"satyadarśanabhāvanāprahātavyā"* according to Tib, Chn1.

342 (Ejima:) Pra: pudgalasya sattveṣv antarbhāvāt. Ms: ...satvesv... .

T(100b2): gaṅ zag bden pa rnams kyi khoṅs(P: khoṅ) su ma gtogs paḥi phyir ro /. Zhēn(306c15): 人不屬四諦攝故. Xuán(155b16): 補特伽羅非諦攝故.

Read *"pudgalasya satyeṣu anantarbhāvāt"*. Cf. Yaś(706, 26), Pūr(375b2).

343 (Ejima:) "ekaḥ pudgalo..." iti /.

Cited in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 463a14, c28). Cf. Zhēng 8, 3(Taisho 2, 561a18), Zhēn 12, 3(Taisho 2, 569b24), AN 1, 13(I, 22, 2).

{%Tib 9-23}[C.89a6-89b2, D.87b7-88a3, N.100b2-6, P.100a7-100b3]

gaṅ zag ni yod pa ñid de/ ḥdi ltar sems can skye ba pa med do ṣes zer ba ni log par lta ba yin no ṣes gsuṅs so//

sems can skye ba pa med do ṣes su zer/ ji ltar bcom ldan ḥdas kyis rnam par phye[344] ba ltar yod do[345] ṣes zer ro// de lta bas na ḥdi ni gaṅ ṣig pha rol du[346] skye ba pa sems can ṣes bya ba phuṅ poḥi rgyun la sems can skye ba pa med do[347] ṣes skur pa ḥdebs pa deḥi log par lta ba yin te/ phuṅ po rnams ni skye ba pa yin paḥi phyir ro//

gaṅ zag[348] la skur pa ḥdebs pa[349] ḥdi log par lta ba yin na yaṅ ci ṣig gis spaṅ bar[350] bya bar ḥgyur/ ḥdi bden pa mthoṅ bas spaṅ bar bya ba yin par yaṅ mi ruṅ la bsgom pas spaṅ bar bya ba yin par yaṅ mi ruṅ ste/ gaṅ zag bden pa rnams kyi khoṅ[351] su ma gtogs paḥi phyir ro//

gal te ḥjig rten na yaṅ gaṅ zag gcig pu[352] skye ba na skyeḥo ṣes gsuṅs paḥi phyir phuṅ po rnams ma yin no ṣe na ma yin te/ spyi la yaṅ gcig ñe bar ḥdogs paḥi phyir til gcig daṅ/ ḥbras thug po che gcig ces bya ba lta bu daṅ/ phuṅ po gcig daṅ/ tshig gcig ces bya ba bṣin no//

---

344 C.phye=phyo
345 CD.insert // after *yod do*
346 CNP.du=tu
347 NP.insert // after *med do*
348 NP.omit *zag*
349 NP.omit *ḥdebs pa*
350 N.bar=par
351 CDN.khoṅ=khoṅs
352 CN.pu=bu

{%Skt 9-24}[Pra. 46818-46904]{%Chn}[Z. 306c20-307a8; X. 155b19-155c6]

- saṃskṛta iti vā pudgalo vaktavya utpattimattvābhyupagamāt /
- na sa evam utpadyate yathā skandhā apūrvaprādurbhāvāḥ[353] /
- kiṃ tarhi /
- skandhāntaropādānāt / yathā yājñiko jāto vaiyākaraṇo jāta ity ucyate vidyopādānāt / bhikṣur jātaḥ parivrājako jāta iti liṅgopādānāt / vṛddho jāto vyādhito jāta ity avasthāntaropādānād iti /
- na / pratikṣepāt /[354]

sūtra eva hi pratikṣiptaṃ bhagavatā paramārthaśūnyatāyām / "iti hi bhikṣavo 'sti karmāsti vipākaḥ kārakas tu nopalabhyate / ya imāṃś ca skandhān nikṣipati anyāṃś ca skandhān pratisaṃdadhāty anyatra dharmasaṃketād" iti /[355] phālgunasūtre[356] coktam / "upādatta iti phālguna[357] na vadāmī"ti /[358]

tasmān nāsti skandhānāṃ kaścid upādātā / nāpi nikṣiptā[359] /

---

353 (Lee:) Pra: apūrvaprādurbhāvāt. Ms: *sic*. T(100b4): ji ltar phuṅ po rnams sṅon med pa las ḥbyuṅ(D.ḥbyuṅ=byuṅ) ba de ltar. Zhēn(306c21): 如陰先未有後有. Xuán(155b21): 如蘊新起.

Read "*apūrvaprādurbhāvāḥ*".

354 (Lee:) Pra: na pratikṣepāt /. Ms: *sic*. T(100b6): /ma yin te/(P.omits /) bkag paḥi phyir ro/. Read "*na / pratikṣepāt /*".

355 (Ejima:) paramārthaśūnyatāyām/ "iti hi bhikṣavo 'sti karmāsti vipākaḥ..."iti/. Quoted 129, 9. Cf. Zá 335(Taisho 2, 92c18).

356 (Ejima:) Pra: phalgu-. Ms: *sic*.

Zhēn(306c29): 頗求那, Xuán(155b28): 頗勒具那. Zá 372(Taisho 2, 102b3): 頗求那.

Read "*phālguna-*". Cf. Yaś(707, 17).

357 (Ejima:) Pra: phalgu na. Ms: phagnuṃna. Read "*phālguna*".

358 (Ejima:) phālgunasūtre(read so) coktam "upādatta iti..." iti/.

Cf. Zá 372(Taisho 2, 102b3), SN 12, 12(II, 14, 7)

359 (Ejima:) nikṣiptā. Ms: *sic*. Read "*nikṣeptā*".

(Lee:) Yaś(707, 19): nāpi nikṣipteti. Read "*nikṣiptā*" as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-24}[C.89b2-90a1, D.88a3-88b2, N.100b6-101a5, P.100b3-101a3]

yaṅ na gaṅ zag ḥdus byas yin no ṣes bya bar brjod par bya ste/ skye ba daṅ ldan pa ñid du khas blaṅs paḥi phyir ro//

de ni ji ltar phuṅ po rnams sṅon med pa las ḥbyuṅ[360] ba de ltar skye ba ni ma yin no//

ḥo na ji lta bu ṣe na/

phuṅ po gṣan len paḥi phyir te/ dper na rig[361] pa blaṅs paḥi phyir mchod sbyin pa skyes so// brda sprod pa pa skyes so ṣes bya ba daṅ/ rtags[362] blaṅs[363] paḥi phyir dge sloṅ skyes so// kun tu rgyu skyes[364] so ṣes bya ba daṅ/ gnas skyabs gṣan blaṅs[365] paḥi[366] phyir rga ba skyes so// na ba skyes so ṣes bya ba bṣin[367] no//

ma yin te/[368] bkag paḥi phyir ro//

bcom ldan ḥdas kyis don dam pa stoṅ pa ñid kyi mdo kho na las/ dge sloṅ dag las ni yod do// rnam par smin pa ni yod do// chos su brdar brtags[369] pa ma gtogs pa gaṅ ṣig phuṅ po ḥdi rnams ḥdor bar byed ciṅ phuṅ po gṣan dag ñiṅ mtshams sbyor bar byed paḥi byed pa po ni mi dmigs so ṣes gsuṅs so// dbo las skyes kyi mdo las kyaṅ/ dbo las skyes len ces mi smraḥo ṣes gsuṅs te/

de lta bas na phuṅ po rnams len par byed pa yaṅ ḥgaḥ yaṅ med la/ ḥdor bar byed pa yaṅ med do//

---

360 CDN.ḥbyuṅ=byuṅ
361 NP.rig=rigs
362 NP.rtags=brtags
363 NP.omit *blaṅs*
364 P.skyes=skyas
365 NP.blaṅs=blaṅ
366 CD.paḥi=baḥi
367 NP.bṣin=yin
368 P.omits /
369 N.brtags=btags

kaṃ ca tāvad bhavān yājñikaṃ yāvad vyādhitaṃ adhikṛtya dṛṣṭāntaṃ karoti / pudgalaṃ yadi so 'siddhaḥ[370] /

atha cittacaittān[371] / teṣāṃ pratikṣaṇam apūrvotpattir eva /

atha śarīram / tasyāpi tathā / śarīravidyāliṅgavac ca skandhapudgalayor anyatvam āpadyate / jīrṇa śarīrāntaram eva vyādhitaṃ ca / pratiṣiddho hi sāṃkhyīyaḥ[372] pariṇāmavādaḥ /

tasmād adṛṣṭāntā ete /

---

370 (Ejima:) Pra: kaṃ ca tāvad bhavān yājñikaṃ yāvad vyādhitaṃ adhimucyate/ dṛṣṭāntaṃ(read so as in the first edition) karoti pudgalaṃ yadi/ so 'siddhaḥ/.

Ms: kañ ca tāvad bhavān pākṣikaṃ yāvad vyādhim adhimucyate dṛṣṭāntaṃ [ka]roti/ pudgalaṃ yadi so siddhaḥ/.

T(100b8): re ṣig khyod mchod sbyin pa nas rga baḥi bar gaṅ gi dbaṅ du byas nas(=kam adhikṛtya) dper byed/ gal te gaṅ zag yin no ṣe na(P: ṣes na) ni de ma grub po/,

Xuán(155c1): 又汝所引祠者等生, 其體是何而能喻此, 若執是我, 彼不極成.

T and Xuán both read "kaṃ ca tāvad bhavān yājñikaṃ yāvad vyādhitaṃ adhikṛtya dṛṣṭāntaṃ karoti/ pudgalaṃ yadi so 'siddhaḥ/".

Zhēn(307a03): 汝今信執何延若師生乃至病者生. 立爲人譬若執我, 此不成就. Zhēn reads "kaṃ ca tāvad bhavān yājñikaṃ yāvad vyādhitaṃ adhimucyate/ dṛṣṭāntaṃ karoti pudgalaṃ yadi so 'siddhaḥ/".

(Lee:) Read "*kaṃ ca tāvad bhavān yājñikaṃ yāvad vyādhitaṃ adhikṛtya dṛṣṭāntaṃ karoti/ pudgalaṃ yadi so 'siddhaḥ/*" according to Tib, Chn1.

371 (Ejima:) Pra: atha cittacaitāḥ/ na/. Ms: atha cittacaittān/. T(101a1): ḥon te sems daṅ sems las byuṅ ba rnams yin no ṣe na ni, Zhēn(307a4): 若執心及心法...不可爲譬, Xuán(155c2): 若心心所...取捨不成. "取捨不成" in Xuán and "不可爲譬" in Zhēn are respectively an explanatory expression and a prescribed one that corresponds to "tasmād adṛṣṭāntā ete". They do not necessarily presuppose the "na" which is arbitrarily inserted by the first decipherer.

Read "*atha cittacaittān*" just as Ms.

372 (Ejima:) Pra: sāṃkhyīyaḥ Ms: *sic*. Read "*sāṃkhyeyaḥ*" as in Yaś(707, 29).

(Lee:) Read "*sāṃkhyīyaḥ*" as in Ms.

re ṣig khyod mchod sbyin pa nas rga baḥi bar gaṅ gi dbaṅ du byas nas dper byed//

gal te gaṅ zag yin no ṣe[373] na ni de ma grub po//

ḥon te sems daṅ sems las byuṅ[374] ba rnams yin no[375] ṣe na ni/[376] de dag skad cig re re la sṅon med pa las skye ba kho na yin no//

ḥon te lus yin no ṣe na/ de yaṅ de daṅ ḥdra la/ lus daṅ/ rig pa daṅ/ rtags bṣin du phuṅ po daṅ gaṅ zag gñis gṣan ñid du yaṅ ḥgyur ro// rga ba daṅ na ba yaṅ lus gṣan kho na yin no// graṅs can paḥi ḥgyur bar smra ba ni bkag zin to//

de lta bas na ḥdi dag ni dpe ṅan pa yin no/

---

373 P.ṣe=ṣes

374 C.byuṅ=byud

375 N.inserts // after *yin no*

376 CD.omit /

{%Skt 9-25}[Pra. 46905-46909]{%Chn}[Z. 307a8-13; X. 155c6-12]

- yadi ca skandhānām apūrvotpādo na pudgalasyeṣyate / so 'nyaś ca tebhyo nityaś ca sphuṭaṃ dīpito bhavati / pañca skandhā ekaḥ pudgala iti brūvatā katham anyatvaṃ nocyate /
- kathaṃ tāvat bhūtāni catvāri rūpaṃ tv ekaṃ na ca bhūtebhyo 'nyad rūpam /
- pākṣika eṣa doṣaḥ /
- katamasmin pakṣe /
- bhūtamātrikapakṣe / tathāpi tu yathā bhūtamātraṃ rūpam evaṃ skandha-mātraṃ pudgala ity abhyupetaṃ bhavati /

{%Tib 9-25}[C.90a1-3, D.88b2-4, N.101a5-7, P.101a3-6]

gal te yaṅ phuṅ po rnams ni sṅon med pa las skyes pa[377] yin la/ gaṅ zag ni ma[378] yin par ḥdod na ni de de dag las gṣan pa daṅ/ rtag[379] par gsal bar yoṅs su bstan pa yin no// phuṅ po ni lṅaḥo// gaṅ zag ni gcig go ṣes smra bas ji ltar na gṣan ñid du mi brjod/

re ṣig ji ltar na ḥbyuṅ ba dag ni bṣi yin/[380] gzugs ni gcig yin[381] la ḥbyuṅ ba rnams las gzugs gṣan yaṅ ma yin/

smra ba ḥdi ni phyogs la[382] yod pa yin no//

phyogs gaṅ la ṣe na/

ḥbyuṅ ba tsam paḥi phyogs laḥo// de lta na yaṅ ji ltar ḥbyuṅ ba tsam gzugs yin pa de bṣin du phuṅ po tsam gaṅ zag yin par khas blaṅs pa yin no//

---

377 NP.las skyes pa=la skye ba
378 C.ma=na?
379 C.rtag=rtags
380 C./=//
381 NP.omit *yin*
382 NP.la=la la

{%Skt 9-26}[Pra. 46909-46924]{%Chn}[Z. 307a14-307b3; X. 155c12-29]

- yadi skandhamātraṃ pudgalaḥ kasmāt bhagavatā sa jīvas tac charīram anyo veti[383] na vyākṛtam /[384]

- praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā / sa hi jīvadravyam ekam antarvyāpārapuruṣam adhikṛtya pṛṣṭavān / sa ca kasmiṃś cin nāstīti katham asyānyatvam ananyatvaṃ vā vyākriyatām / kaurmasyeva romṇaḥ kharatā[385] mṛdutā vā /

eṣa ca granthaḥ pūrvakair eva nirmocitaḥ / sthaviro hi nāgaseno[386] milindena rājñopasaṃkramyoktaḥ[387] /

"pṛccheyam ahaṃ bhadantam /[388] bahuvollakāś ca śramaṇā[389] bhavanti / yadi yad eva pṛccheyaṃ tad eva vyākuryā iti / pṛcchety uktaḥ pṛṣṭavān / kiṃ nu sa jīvas tac charīram anyo jīvo 'nyac charīram iti / avyākṛtam etad ity avocat sthaviraḥ / sa āha / nanu bhadantaḥ pūrvam eva pratijñāṃ kārito nānyad[390] vyākartavyam iti / kim idam anyad evoktam avyākṛtam etad iti /

---

383 (Ejima:) Pra: sa jīvas tac charīrakanyo veti. Read *"sa jīvas tac charīram anyo veti"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

384 (Ejima:) kasmāt bhagavatā sa jīvas tac charīram anyo(read so) veti na vyākṛtam /.

Cf. Zá 957(Taisho 2, 244a13), Zá 962(Taisho 2, 245c3), MN 72(I, 484, 17).

385 (Ejima:) Pra: kaurmasyeva romṇo 'ntaḥ kharatā.

Ms: kaurmasye ca rom[ṇa]ḥ khataratā, "ta" in "khataratā" seems to be erased. T(101a7): rus spal gyi spu gśor ram.

Read *"kaurmasyeva romṇaḥ kharatā"*.

386 (Lee:) Pra: nāgasenaḥ. Read *"nāgaseno"*.

387 (Ejima:) kaliṅgena rājñā. Ms: *sic*.

Zhēn(307a19): 旻鄰陀王, Xuán(155c18): 畢鄰陀王.

T(101a8): rgyal po des ḥdu sbyin ("des" is ambiguous. "ḥdu"="mela". Cf. *Mahāvyutpatti* 3291, "sbyin"="da". Therefore "des ḥdu sbyin" may be a rendering of something like "-milinda"). Read *"milindena rājñā"*.

If so, then we should now consider how and why Milinda has come to be called "kaliṅgarājan" in Ms.

388 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

389 (Ejima:) Pra: bahuvollakāśva śravaṇā. Ms: bahuvāllakāś ca śramaṇā.

T(101a8): dge sbyoṅ rnams ni smra ba maṅ ba(D adds: ma) lags so.

Yaś(708, 9): bahuvollakā iti.

Read *"bahuvollakāś ca śramaṇā"*.

390 (Lee:) Pra: nā 'nyad. Read *"nānyad"* as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-26}[C.90a3-90b3, D.88b4-89a3, N.101a7-102a1, P.101a6-101b7]

gal te phuṅ po tsam gaṅ zag yin na ciḥi phyir bcom ldan ḥdas kyis srog de ñid lus yin paḥam/ gṣan yin no ṣes luṅ ma bstan ṣe[391] na/

ḥdri ba poḥi bsam pa la ltos[392] paḥi phyir te/ des[393] ni naṅ gi byed paḥi skyes bu srog gi rdsas gcig po dris so// de yaṅ ḥgaḥ yaṅ med na ḥdi ji ltar gṣan ñid dam gṣan ma yin pa ñid du[394] luṅ bstan par bya ste/ rus sbal gyi spu gśor[395] ram ḥjam ṣes bya ba bṣin[396] no//

mdud[397] pa ḥdi ni sṅa ma dag kho nas kyaṅ bkrol zin te/ rgyal po des ḥdu sbyin gnas brtan klu sdeḥi thad du ḥoṅs nas btsun pa dge sbyoṅ rnams ni smra ba maṅ ba[398] lags so// gal te gaṅ dris pa de ñid lan ḥdebs na bdag ḥdri bar ḥtshal lo ṣes smras so// drir gsol ṣes smras pa daṅ/[399] ci lags[400] srog de ñid lus lags sam/ srog kyaṅ gṣan lags[401] la lus kyaṅ gṣan lags ṣes dris so// gnas brtan gyis ḥdi ni lan mi gdab[402] pa yin no ṣes smras pa daṅ/ des smras pa/ bdag gis sṅa nas btsun pa gṣan luṅ bstan par mi byaḥo[403] ṣes dam ḥchar gsol ba[404] ma lags sam/ ciḥi slad du ḥdi skad du ḥdi ni lan mi gdab pa yin no ṣes gṣan kho na gsuṅs/

---

391 NP.ṣe=ce
392 NP.ltos=bltos
393 CD.des=des na
394 CD.omit *du*
395 CD.spu gśor=yul bśor
396 NP.bṣin=yin
397 P.mdud=bdud
398 CD.maṅ ba=maṅ ba ma
399 CD.daṅ/=dag
400 CD.insert / after *lags*
401 NP.omit lags
402 CD.gdab=gdags
403 NP.insert // after *byaḥo*
404 NP.omit *ba*

sthavira āha / aham api mahārājaṃ pṛccheyam / bahuvollakāś ca rājāno bhavanti / yadi yad eva pṛccheyaṃ tad eva vyākuryā iti / pṛcchety uktaḥ pṛṣṭavān / yas te 'ntaḥpure āmravṛkṣas tasya kim amlāni phalāni āhosvit madhurāṇīti / naiva mamāntaḥpure kaścid āmravṛkṣo 'stīty āha / nanu mayā pūrvam eva mahārājaḥ pratijñāṃ kārito nānyad vyākartavyam iti / kim idam anyad evoktam āmra eva nāstīti / sa āha /[405] katham asato vṛkṣasya phalānām amlatāṃ madhuratāṃ vā vyākaromīti / evam eva mahārāja sa eva jīvo nāsti kuto 'sya śarīrād anyatām ananyatāṃ vā vyākaromī"ti/[406]

---

405 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

406 (Ejima:) "pṛccheyam ahaṃ bhadantaṃ..." iti/(up to the line 24).

This dialogue of Nāgasena and Milinda must be derived from the same origin of the Milindapañho in Pāli and in Chinese(Taisho No. 1670A & B), but is not found out verbatim in them at all.

gnas brtan gyis smras pa/ rgyal po chen po rgyal po rnams ni smra ba mañ ba lags so// gal te gañ dris pa de ñid lan ḥdebs na bdag kyañ ḥdri bar ḥtshal lags so// drir gsol ṣes smras pa dañ/ khyod kyi slas la śiṅ ljon pa a-mra ḥbras bu yod pa gañ yin pa deḥi ḥbras bu rnams ci skyur ram ḥon te[407] mṅar lags[408] ṣes dris so// bdag gi slas la śiṅ ljon pa a-mra ñid ḥgaḥ yañ med[409] do ṣes smras so// bdag gis sṅa nas rgyal po chen po gṣan luṅ bstan par mi byaḥo[410] ṣes dam ḥchar gsol ba[411] ma lags sam/ ciḥi slad du ḥdi skad du śiṅ ljon pa a-mra ñid med do ṣes gṣan kho na gsuṅs/ des smras pa/ ji ltar na śiṅ ljon pa med paḥi ḥbras bu rnams skyur baḥam mṅar ba ñid du luṅ bstan par bya/ rgyal po chen po de bṣin du srog de ñid med na ciḥi slad du ḥdi lus las gṣan pa ñid dam gṣan ma yin pa ñid du luṅ bstan par bgyi ṣes bya ba lta buḥo//

---

407 NP.insert // after *te*
408 NP.omit *lags*
409 C.med=mred
410 P. inserts // after *byaḥo*; N.inserts / after *byaḥo*
411 NP.omit *ba*

{%Skt 9-27}[Pra. 46925-47018]{%Chn}[Z. 307b3-27; X. 155c29-156a25]

- kasmāt bhagavatā 'pi noktaṃ nāsty eveti /

- praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā / sa hi yasyāpi skandhasaṃtānasya jīva ity ākhyā tasyāpy abhāvaṃ pratīyād iti mithyādṛṣṭiṃ pātitaḥ syāt / pratītya-samutpādasyājñānāt / sa ca taddeśanāyā akṣamaḥ /

itaś caitad evaṃ niścīyate / yat bhagavatoktam "asty ātmety ānanda vatsasagotrāya parivrājakāya[412] praśnaṃ pṛṣṭo vyākuryāṃ nanv akalpaṃ syād vacanāya / sarvadharmā anātmāna iti / nāsty ātmety ānanda vatsasagotrāya[413] parivrājakāya praśnaṃ pṛṣṭo vyākuryāṃ nanu vatsasagotraḥ parivrājakaḥ pūrvam eva saṃmūḍho bhūyasyā mātrayā saṃmoham āpadyeta / abhūt me ātmā sa me etarhi nāstīti / asty ātmety ānanda śāśvatāya paraiti[414] / nāsty ātmety ānandocchedāya paraitī"ti[415] vistaraḥ /[416]

---

412 (Ejima:) vatsasagotrāya parivrājakāya. Ms: *sic.*

Zhēn(307b8): 跋娑同姓外道, T(101b8): kun tu rgyu gnas pa daṅ rus mthun pas(=vatsasagotrāya parivrājakāya). Xuán(156a6): 姓筏蹉出家外道(=vasagotrāya parivrājakāya?). SN(IV, 400, 22): vacchagotte paribbājake. Zá(Taisho 2, 245b10): 婆蹉種出家. Is "vatsasagotra-" merely a misspelling?

413 (Ejima:) nāsty ātmety ānanda vatsasagotrāya... .

Ms: nāsty ātmaity ānanda vatsa[ṣa]gotrāya... . As for "vatsasagotra", see above.

414 (Ejima:) Pra: pareti. Ms: *sic.* Read *"paraiti"*. See the next.

415 (Ejima:) Pra: paretīti. Ms: paraitīti. Read *"paraitīti"* as in Ms.

416 (Ejima:) "asty ātmety..."ti vistaraḥ /.

Cf. Zá 961(Taisho 2, 245b10), SN 44, 10(IV, 400, 22).

{%Tib 9-27}[C.90b3-91a3, D.89a3-89b3, N.102a1-102b2, P.101b7-102a8]

ciḥi phyir bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kyaṅ med pa kho naḥo ṣes ma gsuṅs śe na/[417]

dri ba poḥi[418] bsam pa la bltos[419] paḥi phyir te/[420] des srog ces bya ba phuṅ poḥi rgyun gaṅ yin pa de yaṅ med par go bar gyur na log par lta bar ltuṅ bar ḥgyur te/ rten ciṅ ḥbrel bar ḥbyuṅ ba mi śes paḥi phyir ro// de ni de bstan pa yaṅ mi bzod do//

ḥdi ni bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kun dgaḥ bo kun tu[421] rgyu gnas pa daṅ/ rus mthun pas dri ba dris pa dag[422] yod do[423] ṣes luṅ bstan na ni chos thams cad bdag med pas tshig ma legs pa ma yin nam/ kun dgaḥ bo kun tu[424] rgyu gnas pa daṅ rus mthun paḥi dri ba dris pa[425] bdag med do ṣes luṅ bstan na ni kun tu[426] rgyu gnas pa daṅ rus mthun paḥi sṅa[427] nas kun tu[428] rmoṅs pa yod pa dag gi[429] bdag sṅon yod par gyur pa las da ni bdag gi de yaṅ med do ṣes kun tu[430] rmoṅs paḥi phyir[431] ṣiṅ ches[432] rgyas par ḥgyur ba ma yin nam/ kun dgaḥ bo bdag yod ces bya ba ni rtag paḥi mthar ḥgyur ro// kun dgaḥ bo bdag med ces bya ba ni chad paḥi mthar ḥgyur ro ṣes rgyas par gsuṅs pa gaṅ yin pa ḥdi las kyaṅ de bṣin du ṅes par zuṅ[433] śig//

---

417 NP.omit /
418 NP.dri ba poḥi=ḥdri ba poḥi
419 CD.bltos=ltos
420 C./=//
421 CDN.tu=du
422 CDNP.dag=*sic*. It is the better reading to read *'bdag'* instead of *'dag'*.
423 N.inserts // after *yod do*
424 CDN.tu=du
425 P.omits *pa*
426 CN.tu=du
427 D.sṅa=stan
428 CDN.tu=du
429 CDN.gi=gis
430 CD.tu=du
431 CD.paḥi phyir=pa phyir
432 C.ches=chos
433 NP.zuṅ=zuṅs

āha cātra /[434]

"dṛṣṭidaṃṣṭrāvabhedaṃ[435] ca bhraṃśaṃ cāpekṣya karmaṇām /
deśayanti jinā dharmaṃ vyāghrīpotāpahāravat //
ātmāstitvaṃ hy upagato bhinnaḥ syād dṛṣṭidaṃṣṭrayā /[436]
bhraṃśaṃ kuśalapotasya kuryād aprāpya saṃvṛtim //"

iti /[437]

---

434 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

435 (Ejima:) Pra: dṛṣṭidaṃṣṭrāvabhadaṃ. Ms: dṛṣṭidraṃṣṭrāvabhedañ.

Read "dṛṣṭidaṃṣṭrāvabhedaṃ" as in the first edition.

The Tibetan versions have some ambiguities. T(102a4): lta baḥi(P: bas) mche bas smas(P:smras) pa daṅ/. "smas pa"="kṣata", cf. Mahāvyutpatti 7355. Is "smas pa" the incorrect conjugation of "rmas pa"? Cf. 470, 9 (bhinnaḥ=T(102a5): rmas par gyur).

436 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

437 (Ejima:) "dṛṣṭidaṃṣṭrāvabhedaṃ(read so) ca..." iti /.

These two verses are attributed to Kumāralāta by commentators.

Pŭ-guāng(Taisho 41, 445b20): 經部中鳩摩邏多(Sautrāntika-Kumāralāta)有是頌言.

Yuán-huī(Taisho 41, 980a1): 經部師中鳩摩邏多(Sautrāntika-Kumāralāta)頌.

Pūr(377a4): ḥdir smras pa ṣes bya ba ni/ btsun pa gṣon nu len gyis so/.

Yaś(708, 14): āha cātreti bhadanta-kumāralātaḥ/.

The first verse is quoted by Kamalaśīla in the *Tattvasaṃgrahapañjikā*(ed. by Krishnamacharya) 129, 19 with a slightly different reading "avekṣya" for "apekṣya" in the *pāda b*.

(Lee:) Pra: saṃvṛtim iti /. Ms: saṃvṛtim iti //. Read *"saṃvṛtim // iti /"*.

ḥdir smras pa//

lta baḥi[438] mche bas smras[439] pa daṅ//
las rnams ḥjig pa la ltos[440] nas//
stag mos phru gu khyer ba ltar//
rgyal bas chos ni ston par mdsad//
bdag yod ñid du khas blaṅs nas//
lta baḥi mche bas rmas[441] par gyur//
kun rdsob rtog par ma gyur nas//
dge ba phru gu ñams byed ḥgyur//

438 NP.baḥi=bas
439 D.smras=smas
440 P.la ltos=las bltos; N.la ltos=la bltos
441 CD.rmas=smras

punar āha /[442]

"asattvād bhagavān jīvaṃ tattvānyatvena nāvadat /
nāstīty api ca nāvocan mā bhūt prājñaptiko 'py asan //[443]
yatra hi skandhasaṃtāne śubhāśubhaphalāstitā /
jīvākhyā tatra sā na syāt jīvanāstitvadeśanāt //
prajñaptimātraṃ skandheṣu jīva ity api nāvadat /
abhavyaḥ śūnyatāṃ boddhuṃ tadānīṃ tādṛśo janaḥ //
tathā hy ātmāsti nāstīti pṛṣṭo vātsyena[444] nāvadat /
āśayāpekṣayā[445] praṣṭuḥ sati tv astīti nāha kim //"[446]

---

442 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

443 (Ejima:) Pra: mābhūt prājñaptikopy asan //.

Ms: mā bhūt prajñaptiko (')py asan/.

T(102a5): btags(D: brtags) paḥaṅ(P: pa) med du ḥgyur ḥoṅ bas/(?).

Read *"mā bhūt prājñaptiko 'py asan//"*.

444 (Ejima:) pṛṣṭo vāsty eva. Ms: pṛṣṭo vāstyena.

T(102a7): gnas pas... dris pa. Read *"pṛṣṭo vātsyena"*.

445 (Ejima:) āśayāpekṣāyā. Ms: āśayāpekṣayā.

Read *"āśayāpekṣayā"*(instr. f.) as in Ms.

446 (Ejima:) "asattvād bhagavān jīvaṃ...nāha kim //".

These four verses are attributed by Pŭ-guāng(Taisho 41, 445b29) and Yuán-huī(Taisho 41, 980a1) to "論主"(śāstrakāra) i.e. Vasubandhu. Yaś and Pūr give no information about them.

yaṅ smras pa//

med phyir bcom ldan ḥdas kyis srog//
de ñid gṣan du ma gsuṅs so//
brtags[447] paḥaṅ[448] med du ḥgyur ḥoṅ bas//
med do ṣes kyaṅ ma gsuṅs so//
phuṅ poḥi rgyu[449] ni gaṅ[450] la dge//
mi dgeḥi[451] ḥbras bu yod pa ñid//
de la srog ces bya ste de//
srog med[452] bstan pas med par[453] ḥgyur//
srog[454] ces bya ba phuṅ po la//
btags tsam ṣes kyaṅ ma gsuṅs te//
de tsheḥi skye bo de ḥdra ste//
stoṅ ñid rtogs paḥi skal ldan min//
ḥdi ltar gnas pas bdag yod dam//
med ces dri ba[455] ḥdri ba yi[456]//
bsam pa la ltos[457] ma gsuṅs te//
yod na ci phyir yod mi gsuṅs//

---

447 NP.brtags=btags
448 NP.paḥaṅ=pa
449 CDNP.rgyu=*sic.* It is the better reading to read *'rgyun'* instead of *'rgyu'*.
450 NP.gaṅ=dag
451 P.dgeḥi=dge baḥi
452 CD.med=miṅ
453 N.par=pas
454 D.srog=grog
455 NP.dri ba=dris pa; C.dri ba=bri ba
456 C.yi=li
457 NP.ltos=bltos

{%Skt 9-28}[Pra. 47019-47110]{%Chn}[Z. 307b28-307c13; X. 156a28-156b15]

- śāśvatalokādīnām apy avyākaraṇaṃ praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā /[458] yadi hi tāvad ātmā loka iṣṭaḥ syāt tasyābhāvād ayuktaṃ caturdhā vyākaraṇam / atha sarva eva saṃsāro lokas tasyāpy ayuktam /

śāśvate loke na kasya cit parinirvāṇaṃ prāpnuyāt / aśāśvate sarveṣām ucchedaḥ prāpnuyāt / ubhayathātve niyamata ekeṣāṃ parinirvāṇaṃ prāpnuyāt ekeṣāṃ na / anubhayathātve naiva parinirvāṇaṃ nāparinirvāṇaṃ prāpnuyāt /

458 (Ejima:) śāśvatalokādīnām apy avyākaraṇaṃ praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā/.
Cf. Zá 962(Taisho 2, 245b26f.). MN 72(I, 483, 28f.).

{%Tib 9-28}[C.91a3-2, D.89b3-90a1, N.102b2-103a1, P.102a8-102b7]

ḥjig rten rtag ces bya ba la sogs pa yaṅ ḥdri ba poḥi bsam pa la lto s[459] nas luṅ ma bstan te/ re ṣig gal te ḥjig rten bdag yin par ḥdod par gyur na ni de med paḥi phyir luṅ[460] bstan pa rnam pa bṣi char mi rigs so// ḥon te ḥjig rten ḥkhor ba thams[461] cad yin[462] no ṣe na ni de yaṅ rigs pa ma yin te/

ḥjig rten rtag na ḥgaḥ yaṅ yoṅs su mya ṅan las ḥdaḥ bar mi ḥgyur ro// mi rtag na ni thams cad chad par ḥgyur ro// gñi ga ltar yin na ni kha cig ni ṅes par yoṅs su mya ṅan las ḥdaḥ bar ḥgyur la kha cig ni mi ḥgyur ro// gñi ga ltar ma yin na ni yoṅs[463] su mya ṅan las ḥdaḥ ba yaṅ ma yin/ yoṅs su mya ṅan las mi ḥdaḥ ba yaṅ ma yin pa kho nar ḥgyur ro//

---

459 NP.stos=bltos
460 CD.luṅ=luṅ ma
461 C.thams=brams
462 C.yin=min
463 C.yoṅs=loṅs

ato mārgādhīnatvāt parinirvāṇasya caturdhāpi niyamato[464] na vyākriyate / nirgranthaśrāvakacaṭakavat[465] /

ata evāntavān[466] loka iti catuṣkāvyākaraṇam / tulyārtho hy eṣa catuṣkaḥ / tathā hy[467] uktikaḥ[468] parivrājaka etaṃ catuṣkaṃ[469] pṛṣṭvā punaḥ pṛṣṭavān /[470] "kiṃ nu sarvo loko 'nena mārgeṇa niryāty āhosvid ekadeśo lokasye"ti // sthavira ānanda āha / "yam eva tvam uktika[471] prathamato bhagavantaṃ praśnaṃ pṛṣṭavāṃs tam evaitarhi pṛcchasy anena paryāyeṇe"ti[472] /[473]

bhavati tathāgataḥ paraṃ maranād ity api catuṣkaḥ praṣṭur āśayāpekṣayā na vyākṛtaḥ / sa hi muktam ātmānaṃ[474] tathāgataṃ kṛtvā pṛṣṭavān /

---

464 (Lee:) Pra: niyamo. T(102b3): rnam pa bṣi char yaṅ ṅes(D.ṅes=ṅas) par luṅ mi ston te/. Read *"niyamato"*.

465 (Ejima:) nirgranthaśrāvakacaṭakavat. Ms: nigranthaśrāvakavaṭa[bh]avat.

T(102b3): gcer bu paḥi(P:pa) ñan thos kyis byeḥu(D:byiḥu) bzuṅ ba bṣin no(=nir-granthaśrāvakagṛhītacaṭakavat?). Zhēn(307c6): 譬如不記尼乾弟子握中之雀.

Xuán(156b5): 如離繫子問雀死生.

466 (Lee:) Pra: ataevāntavān. Read *"ata evāntavān"*.

467 (Lee:) Pra: hi. Read *"hy"*.

468 (Ejima:) Pra: muktikaḥ. Ms: uktitaḥ.

Zhēn(307c8): 郁肢柯, Xuán(156b8): 嗢底迦. T(102b4): smra byed kyis. Zá(Taisho 2, 247c15, etc.): 鬱底迦, AN(V, 193, 2): uttiyo. Read *"uktikaḥ"*.

469 (Ejima:) Pra: eva catuṣkaṃ. Ms: *sic.*

T(102b24): bṣi tshan ḥdi(=etaṃ catuṣkaṃ). Zhēn(307c8): 以此四(問佛).

Read *"etaṃ catuṣkaṃ"*.

470 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

471 (Ejima:) Pra: tvaṃ muktika tat-. Ms: tvaṃm(*Lee: tvamm) uktikatat.

Here it should be taken into account that the Ms has once written "uktitaḥ" in stead of "uktikaḥ". Read *"tvam uktika"*.

472 (Ejima:) Pra: paryāyeṇe"ti sarvam /. Ms: -eti sarvaṃ.

Read "paryāyeṇe"ti /". Omit "sarvam".

473 (Ejima:) tathā hi(*Lee: read *hy*) uktikaḥ(read so, see the next) parivrājaka..."kiṃ nu sarvo loko..."ti// sthavira ānada āha / "yam eva..."ti.

Cf. Zá 965(Taisho 2, 247c16, 26, 29), AN 10, 95(V, 194, 12).

474 (Ejima:) Pra: muktvāmānaṃ. Ms: muktvātmānaṃ.

T(102b6): bdag grol ba de bṣin ḥoṅs pa yin par bsams nas. Zhēn(307c13): 執已解脫我名如來. Xuán(156b14): 妄計已解脫我名爲如來. Read *"muktam ātmānaṃ"*.

deḥi phyir yoṅs su mya ṅan las ḥdaḥ ba ni lam la rag lus paḥi phyir rnam pa bṣi char yaṅ ṅes[475] par luṅ mi ston te/ gcer bu pa[476] ñan thos kyis byeḥu[477] bzuṅ ba bṣin no//

de ñid kyi phyir ḥjig rten mthaḥ daṅ ldan ṣes bya ba la sogs pa rnam pa bṣi yaṅ luṅ ma bstan[478] te/ bṣi tshan ḥdi ni don mthun no// ḥdi ltar kun tu[479] rgyu smra byed kyis bṣi tshan ḥdi ṣus nas yaṅ ci lags/ ḥjig rten thams cad lam ḥdi[480] ṅes par ḥbyuṅ ṅam/ ḥon te ḥjig rten phyogs gcig lags ṣes ṣus pa daṅ/ gnas brtan kun dgaḥ bos smra byed khyod kyis bcom ldan ḥdas la daṅ po ñid du ṣu ba ṣus pa gaṅ yin pa de ñid de[481] rnam graṅs[482] gṣan gyis ḥdriḥam ṣes smraḥo//

de bṣin ḥoṅs pa śi phan chad yod dam ṣes bya ba bṣi tshan[483] ḥdi yaṅ ḥdr i[484] ba poḥi bsam pa la ltos[485] nas luṅ ma bstan te/ des ni bdag grol ba de bṣin ḥoṅs pa yin par bsams nas ṣu ba ṣus so//

---

475 D.ṅes=ṅas
476 CD.pa=paḥi
477 CD.byeḥu=byiḥu
478 C.bstan=bsdan
479 CDN.tu=du
480 CDNP.ḥdi=*sic*. It is the better reading to read *'ḥdi gyis'* instead of *'ḥdi'*.
481 CDNP.de=*sic*. It is the better reading to read *'da ni'* instead of *'de'*.
482 C.graṅs=gaṅs
483 C.tshan=tshen?
484 CD.ḥdri=dri
485 NP.ltos=bltos

{%Skt 9-29}[Pra. 47111-47123]{%Chn}[Z. 307c14-308a2; X. 156b15-156c2]

- paudgalikas tu paryanuyojyaḥ kiṃ kāraṇaṃ bhagavān jīvantaṃ pudgalam astīti vyākaroti paraṃ maraṇān na vyākarotīti /
- śāśvatadoṣaprasaṅgaḥ /
- idaṃ tarhi kasmād vyākaroti / "bhaviṣyasi tvaṃ maitreyānāgate 'dhvani tathāgato 'rhan samyaksaṃbuddha" iti /[486] kasmāc ca śrāvakam abhyatītaṃ kālagatam upapattau vyākaroty "amuko 'mutropapanna" iti /[487] evam api hi śāśvatatvaprasaṅgaḥ /

yadi ca bhagavān pūrvaṃ pudgalaṃ dṛṣṭvā parinirvṛtaṃ punaḥ na paśyaty ajñānān na vyakarotīti sarvajñatvaṃ śāstur utsāditaṃ bhavati[488] /[489] na vā so 'stīty abhyupagantavyam /

---

486 (Ejima:) "bhaviṣyasi tvaṃ maitreyānāgate 'dhvani tathāgato 'rhan samyaksaṃbuddha" iti/.

This is cited in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 466c9) as follows: 佛語彌勒 "阿逸多, 汝後成佛時名曰慈氏". Cf. Zhōng 66(Taisho 1, 510b24), where the Buddha addresses himself to the bhikṣus, not directly to Ajita as in our text and in the citations in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra* and the *Mahāvibhāṣā*(Taisho 27, 893c1), etc.

487 (Ejima:) śrāvakam abhyatītaṃ kālagatam upapattau vyākaroty "amuko 'mutropapanna" iti/.

Cf. Zá 852(Taisho 2, 217a28), Zá 854(Taisho 2, 217b22), Zá 957(Taisho 2, 244a19), SN 55, 8(V, 356, 22), SN 55, 10(V, 358, 18), SN 44, 9(IV, 398, 13).

488 (Ejima:) Pra: sarvajñatvaṃ śāstur utpāditaṃ(Ms: *sic*) bhavati.

T(103a2): ston paḥi thams cad mkhyen pa ñid bsal ba yin no. Zhēn(307c21): 撥大師一切智德. Xuán(156b21): 撥大師具一切智.

Read *"sarvajñatvaṃ śāstur utsāditaṃ bhavati"*.

Yaś(710, 5) reads "sārvajñaṃ" for "sarvajñatvaṃ".

489 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-29}[C.91b2-7, D.90a1-7, N.103a1-7, P.102b7-103a7]

gaṅ zag pa rnams la brgal[490] ṣiṅ brtag par bya ste/ bcom ldan ḥdas kyis ciḥi phyir gaṅ zag gson po ni yod do[491] ṣes luṅ ston la śi phan chad ni luṅ mi ston/

rtag paḥi ñes par thal bar ḥgyur baḥi phyir[492] ro//

ḥo na ni ciḥi phyir byams pa khyod ma ḥoṅs paḥi dus na de bṣin gśegs pa dgra bcom pa yaṅ dag par rdsogs paḥi saṅs rgyas su ḥgyur ro ṣes bya ba ḥdi[493] luṅ ston/ ciḥi phyir che ge mo ṣig tu skyes so ṣes ñan thos ḥdas pa dus ḥdas pa skye ba la luṅ ston/ de lta yin na ni rtag pa ñi du thal bar[494] ḥgyur ro//

gal te yaṅ bcom ldan ḥdas kyis gaṅ zag sṅar gzigs la yoṅs su mya ṅan las ḥdas nas kyaṅ[495] mi gzigs te/ mi mkhyen paḥi phyir luṅ mi ston to[496] ṣe na ni/ ston paḥi thams cad mkhyen pa ñid bsal ba yin no// yaṅ na ni de med do ṣes khas blaṅ bar[497] bya dgos so//

---

490 NP.brgal=rgal
491 NP.insert // after *yod do*
492 P.phyir=byir
493 CD.ṣes bya ba ḥdi=ṣes
494 NP.thal bar=thams cad par
495 NP.kyaṅ=yaṅ
496 N.to=te
497 NP.blaṅ bar=blaṅs par

atha paśyaty anucyamāno 'py asāv asti śāśvataś ceti siddhaṃ bhavati /

athaitad api na vaktavyaṃ paśyati vā na veti / evaṃ tarhi idam api śanaiḥ śanair avaktavyaṃ kriyatāṃ sarvajño vā bhagavān na veti[498] /

- asty eva pudgalo yasmāt "satyataḥ sthitito nāsti me ātmeti dṛṣṭisthānam" uktam /

- "astīty api dṛṣṭisthānam" uktam /[499] tasmād ajñāpakam etat /

"ubhayam api tv etad antagrahaṇaṃ śāśvatocchedadṛṣṭisaṃgṛhītam"[500] ity ābhidharmikāḥ / tathaiva ca yuktam / "asty ātmety ānanda śāśvatāya paraiti nāsty ātmety ānandocchedāya paraiti"ti vātsyasūtre vacanāt /[501]

---

498 (Ejima:) Pra: sarvajño vā na vā bhagavān na veti/.

Ms: sarvajño vā na vā(erased?) bhagavān na veti/.

Read *"sarvajño vā bhagavān na veti/"* as in Yaś(710, 7).

499 (Ejima:) satyataḥ sthitito nāsti me ātmeti dṛṣṭisthānam uktam / astīty api dṛṣṭisthānam uktam /. Cf. Zhōng 10(Taisho 1, 432a15), MN 2(I, 8, 3).

As for "satyataḥ sthititaḥ", cf. MN 22(I, 138, 6).

500 (Ejima:) Pra: ubhayam api tv etad antagrāhadṛṣṭiśāśvatocchedadṛṣṭisaṃgṛhītam. Ms: ... antagrāhadṛṣṭiḥ śāśvato-... .

T(103a5): ḥdi gñi ga yaṅ mthar ḥdsin(P: mdsin) pa yin te(=antagrahaṇaṃ)/ rtag pa daṅ chad par lta bas bsdus pa dag yin no. Zhēn(307c28): 此二皆是邊見, 斷常二邊見所攝故, Xuán(156b28): 執我有無俱邊見攝, 如次墮在常斷邊故.

The Chinese translators both read "ubhayam api tv etad antagrāhadṛṣṭiḥ/ śāśvatocchedadṛṣṭisaṃgṛhītatvād/"?

Read *"ubhayam api tv etad antagrahaṇaṃ śāśvatocchedadṛṣṭisaṃgṛhītam"*.

501 (Ejima:) "asty ātmety ānanda śāśvatāya paraiti nāsty ātmety ānandocchedāya paraiti"ti vātsyasūtre vacanāt/.

Cf. Zá 961(Taisho 2, 245b21), SN 44, 10(Ānanda, IV, 400, 26). The title "Vātsyasūtra" seems to have been given by the Pudgalavādin not only to Zá 961(or SN 44, 10), but also to a certain group of sūtras i.e. to Zá 957-964(or SN 44, 9; SN 44, 8(Vaccha); SN 44, 11; SN 33, 2-3; SN 44, 10; MN 72(Aggivacchagotta); SN 33, 1; MN 73(Mahāvacchagotta)) which deal with dialogues of the Bhagavat and Vatsagotra. The *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 470b21) cites one paragraph of "Vātsyāyanasūtra"(跋蹉耶那修多羅) from Zá 957(Taisho 2, 244b3, more developed than SN 44, 9) in order to prove the existence of the *antarābhava*.

ḥon te gzigs na ni ma gsuṅs bṣin du yaṅ de yod pa daṅ rtag pa ṣes bya bar grub pa yin no//

ḥon te gzigs sam mi gzigs ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ brjod par mi bya ba yin na n i[502]/ de lta na ni ḥo na bcom ldan ḥdas thams cad mkhyen pa yin nam ma yi n[503] ṣes bya ba ḥdi yaṅ rim gyis mi brjod par gyis śig//

gaṅ zag ni yod pa ñid de/[504] ḥdi ltar bden pa daṅ/ gnas par bdag gi bdag med do sñam pa ni lta baḥi gnas su gsuṅs so//

yod do sñam pa yaṅ lta baḥi gnas su gsuṅs te/ de lta bas na ḥdi ni khuṅs su mi ruṅ ṅo//

chos mṅon pa pa rnams na re ḥdi gñi ga yaṅ mthar mdsin[505] pa yin te/ rtag pa daṅ chad par lta bas bsdus pa dag yin no ṣes zer ro// de kho na bṣin du rigs te gnas paḥi mdo[506] las/ kun dgaḥ bo bdag yod do ṣes[507] bya ba ni rtag par ḥgyur ro// kun dgaḥ bo bdag med do ṣes[508] bya ba ni chad par ḥgyur ro ṣes gsuṅs paḥi phyir ro//

---

502 CD.omit *ni*
503 NP. insert /after *ma yin*
504 NP.omit /
505 CDN.mdsin=ḥdsin
506 CD.gnas paḥi mdo=gnas ma buḥi mdo
507 CD.yod do ṣes=yod ces
508 CD.med do ṣes=med ces

{%Skt 9-30}[Pra. 47124-47215]{%Chn}[Z. 308a2-27; X. 156c2-25]

- yadi tarhi pudgalo nāsti ka eṣa saṃsarati / na hi saṃsāra eva[509] saṃsaratīti yuktam / uktaṃ ca bhagavatā "avidyānivaraṇānāṃ sattvānāṃ saṃdhāvatāṃ saṃsaratām" iti /[510]
- atha pudgalaḥ kathaṃ saṃsarati /
- skandhāntaratyāgopādānāt /
- uktottara eṣa pakṣaḥ / yathā tu kṣaṇiko 'gniḥ saṃtatyā saṃcaratīty ucyate[511] tathā sattvākhyaḥ skandhasamudāyas tṛṣṇopādānaḥ saṃsaratīty ucyate /
- yadi skandhamātram[512] idaṃ kasmād āha bhagavān "aham eva sa tena kālena tena samayena sunetro nāma śāstā 'bhūvam" iti /[513]
- kasmān na vaktavyaṃ syāt /
- anyatvāt skandhānām /

---

509 (Ejima:) Pra: saṃsāra eṣa. Ms: saṃsāre e[va]. T(103a7): ḥkhor ba ñid.
Read *"saṃsāra eva"*.

510 (Ejima:) "avidyānivaraṇānāṃ sattvānāṃ..." iti /.
Cf. Zá 136(Taisho 2, 42b5), SN 22, 99(III, 149, 29).

511 (Ejima:) Pra: saṃtatyā saṃsaratīty ucyate. Ms: santatyā... .
T(103a8): rgyun gyis ḥgro ba(=saṃtatyā saṃcarati). Zhēn(308a9): 由相續故說行(=saṃtatyā saṃcaratīty ucyate). Xuán(156c7): 由相續說有流轉(=saṃtatyā saṃsaratīty ucyate). Pūr(378b2): rgyun gyis ḥgroḥo ṣes bya ba(=saṃtatyā saṃcaratīty ucyate). Yaś(710, 17): saṃtatyā saṃcaratīty ucyate(Tibetan 394a1: rgyun gyis ḥgro ba).
Read *"saṃtatyā saṃcaratīty ucyate"*.
Cf. Zá 957(Taisho 2, 244a23), SN 44, 9(untracable).

512 (Ejima:) skandhamātram. Cf. T(103b1): phuṅ po can(=skandhavad), but "phuṅ po tsam"(=skandhamātram) in D(90b1).

513 (Ejima:) "aham eva sa tena kālena tena samayena sunetro nāma śāstā 'bhūvam" iti/.
A paragraph, literally different but with the same purport and purpose, is cited in the *Sāṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 463b24) as follows: 佛言"我前世時作轉輪聖王名曰善見(Sunetra, not Sudarśana), 亦名大天". 以是故今受新陰前我不異. 是故人與陰各如是. Pūr(378b3): ñi ma bdun ḥchar baḥi mdo las, Yaś(710, 20): saptasūryodayasūtre.
Cf. Zhōng 8(Taisho 1, 429b11), Zhōng 130(Taisho 1, 619b29), AN 7, 62(IV, 103, 24), AN 6, 54(III, 371,16).

{%Tib 9-30}[C.91b7-92a7, D.90a7-90b6, N.103a7-104a1, P.103a7-103b7]

gal te yaṅ[514] gaṅ zag med na ḥkhor ba ḥdi suḥi[515] yin/ ḥkhor ba ñid ḥkhor bar rigs pa ni[516] ma yin no// bcom ldan ḥdas kyis kyaṅ sems can ma rig[517] paḥi sgrib pa can[518] kun tu[519] rgyug pa[520] rnams ḥkhor ro ṣes gsuṅs so//

yaṅ gaṅ zag ji ltar ḥkhor /[521]

phuṅ po gṣan ḥdor ba daṅ[522] len paḥi phyir ro//

phyogs ḥdi ni lan btab zin to[523]/ ji ltar me[524] skad cig ma yin yaṅ rgyun gyis ḥdro ba[525] de bṣin du sred pa ñe bar len pa can sems can ṣes bya ba phuṅ poḥi tshogs ḥkhor ro//

gal te ḥdi phuṅ po tsam[526] yin na ciḥi phyir bcom ldan ḥdas kyis ṅa ñid deḥi tshe deḥi[527] dus na mig bzaṅ[528] ṣes bya baḥi ston par ḥgyur te[529] ṣes gsuṅs[530]//

ciḥi phyir gsuṅs bar bya bar[531] mi ḥgyur/

phuṅ po rnams gṣan yin paḥi phyir ro//

---

514 NP.omit *yaṅ*
515 NP.suḥi=su yi
516 CD.rigs pa ni=rig pa
517 NP.rig=rigs
518 NP.insert / after *can*
519 CD.tu=du
520 CD.rgyug pa=rgyu ba
521 CDNP.omit /, but inserted according to my opinion.
522 CD.insert / after *daṅ*
523 NP.to=te
524 NP.me=mi
525 CD.ḥdro ba=dro ba
526 NP.tsam=can
527 P.omits *deḥi*
528 CD.bzaṅ=bzaṅs
529 CD.te=to
530 CD.gsuṅs=gsuṅs so
531 CD.gsuṅs bar bya bar=gsuṅs bar

- atha kiṃ pudgalaḥ / sa evāsau śāśvataḥ tarhi syāt /[532] tasmād "aham eva sa" ity ekasaṃtānatāṃ darśayati / yathā sa evāgnir dahann āgata iti /

yadi cātmā bhavet tathāgatā eva suvyaktaṃ paśyeyuḥ / paśyatāṃ cātmagrāho dṛḍhataraḥ syāt[533] / "ātmani ca saty ātmīyaṃ bhavatī"ti sūtre vacanād[534] ātmīyagrāho[535] 'py eṣāṃ skandheṣv adhikaṃ pravarteta / saiṣāṃ[536] syāt satkāyadṛṣṭiḥ / ātmīyadṛṣṭau ca satyām ātmīyasnehaḥ / evam eṣāṃ dṛḍhatarātmātmīyasnehaparigāhitabandhanānāṃ[537] mokṣo dūratarībhavet /

---

532 (Ejima:) Pra: atha kiṃ pudgalaḥ/ sa evāsau/ śāśvato hi syāt/. Ms: atha kim pudgalaḥ sa evāsau śāśvato hi syāt/. T(103b2): ḥo na ci(P: ciḥi) de ñid gaṅ zag yin na ni rtag par ḥgyur ro/(=atha kiṃ pudgalaḥ sa evāsau śāśvataḥ tarhi syāt/). Zhēn(308a13): 若爾何者有人. 若昔人卽是今人, 人則常住. Xuán(156c11): 若爾是何物, 謂補特伽羅, 昔我卽今體, 應常住.

Read *"atha kiṃ pudgalaḥ/ sa evāsau śāśvataḥ tarhi syāt/"*.

533 (Lee:) Pra: syād ātmasnehaś ca. T(103b3): gzigs na yaṅ bdag tu ḥdsin pa śin tu dam por ḥgyur ro/. Zhēn(308a16-17): 見已世尊卽立我執. Xuán(156c14-15): 觀已應生堅固我執. Omit *"ātmasnehaś ca"* according to Tib, Chn1, Chn2. Read *"syāt"*.

534 (Ejima:) "ātmani ca saty ātmīyaṃ bhavatī"ti sūtre vacanād.

Cited in the *Saṃmatīyaśāstra*(Taisho 32, 462b27) as follows: 若有我者卽有我所, 若有我所卽有我. 我及我所諦實不可得, 是故無我.

Cf. Zhōng 200(Taisho 1, 765b28): 因神(ātman)故有我(ātmīya), 無神見(or, 則) 無我(ātmany asaty ātmīyaṃ na bhavati). 是爲神神所有不可得不可施設. MN 22(I, 138, 3): attani vā bhikkhave sati attaniyam me ti assāti... . attaniye vā bhikkhave sati attā me ti assāti. ... attani ca bhikkhave attaniye ca saccato thetato anupalabbhamāne yam p' idaṃ diṭṭhiṭṭhānaṃ.

Such a logical expression about the "ātmamoha" is not so frequent in the Nikāyas or Āgamas as we imagine, though we read in many places "etam mama eso ham asmi eso me attā"(SN 12, 62(II, 94, 18), etc.). In this sense the following is besides noticed as a rare instance: asmīti bhikkhave sati, itthasmīti hoti, evasmīti hoti aññathasmīti hoti, asasmīti hoti satasmīti hoti, santi hoti itthaṃ santi hoti, evaṃ santi hoti aññathā santi hoti, api ha santi hoti api itthaṃ santi hoti, api evaṃ santi hoti api aññathā santi hoti, bhavissanti hoti aññathā bhavissanti hoti. ...asmīti bhikkhave asati, itthasmīti na hoti evasmīti na hoti, ...(AN 4, 200(II, 215, 26)), cf. AN 4, 199(II, 212, 13), Zá 984(Taisho 2, 256a24).

535 (Lee:) Pra: ātmagrāho. Ms: *sic*. T(103b4): bdag yod na bdag gir yaṅ ḥgyur ro ṣes mdo las ḥbyuṅ baḥi phyir de dag phuṅ po rnams la bdag gir ḥdsin pa lhag par ḥbyuṅ bas. Zhēn(308a18-19): 衆生於五陰中生我所執. Xuán(156c16-18): 若執有我便執我所, 執我所故, 於諸蘊中便復發生我我所愛. Read *"ātmīyagrāho"*.

536 (Ejima:) Pra: saiṣā. Ms: *sic*. T(103b4): de ni de dag gi. Pūr(378b5): de ni de dag gi(s). Yaś(710, 25): saiṣāṃ. Read *"saiṣāṃ"*.

537 (Ejima:) Pra: dṛḍhatarātmātmīyasnehaparisāditabandhanānāṃ. Ms: *sic*.

T(103b5): bdag daṅ bdag gir chags paḥi ḥchiṅ ba śin tu dam pos brlag pa(D: glags pa). Yaś(710, 26):...-parigāhita-...(T(394a7):...gugs pa).Pūr(378b6):...glags pa.

Read *"dṛḍhatarātmātmīyasnehaparigāhitabandhanānāṃ"*.

ḥo na ci de ñid[538] gaṅ zag yin na ni rtag par ḥgyur ro// de lta bas na ṅa ñid de yin no ṣes bya ba ni rgyud gcig pa ñid du ston par mdsad pa yin te/ dper na me de ñid sreg ciṅ ḥoṅs so ṣes bya ba bṣin no//

gal te yaṅ bdag[539] yod par gyur na de bṣin gśegs pa rnams kyis[540] śin tu gsal ba kho nar gzigs par ḥgyur ro// [541]gzigs na yaṅ bdag tu ḥdsin pa śin tu dam por ḥgyur ro// bdag yod na bdag gir yaṅ ḥgyur ro[542] ṣes mdo las ḥbyuṅ baḥi phyir de dag phuṅ po rnams la bdag gir ḥdsin pa lhag par ḥbyuṅ bas de ni de dag gi ḥjig tshogs la lta bar ḥgyur ro// bdag gir lta ba yod na yaṅ bdag gir chags par ḥgyur te/ de lta bas na bdag daṅ bdag gir chags paḥi ḥchiṅ ba śin tu dam pos glags[543] pa de dag la thar pa[544] thag riṅ bar ḥgyur ro//

---

538 NP.ci de ñid=ciḥi de ñid
539 CD.bdag=bdag de
540 NP.kyis=kyi
541 NP.omit //
542 NP.insert // after *ro*
543 NP.glags=brlag
544 D.pa=ba

atha matam /[545] naivātmani pravartate sneha iti / tat ka idānīm eṣa yogo yad anātmany ātmādhimokṣāt[546] sneha utpadyate ātmany eva tu notpadyate / tasmāt tasya dṛṣṭyarbudam[547] etasmiñ chāsana utpannaṃ ya eṣa ekeṣāṃ pudgalagrāha ekeṣāṃ sarvanāstitāgrāhaḥ[548] / ye 'pi ca dravyāntaram evātmānaṃ manyante tīrthakarās[549] teṣām eṣa mokṣābhāvadoṣo niṣkampaḥ[550] /

---

545 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

546 (Ejima:) ātmādhimokṣāt. Ms: *sic.* T(103b6): bdag tu rmoṅs pas(=ātmamohāt?). Zhēn(308a22): 由信有我. Xuán(156c20): 橫計爲我.

547 (Ejima:) Pra: tasmāt dṛṣṭyarvudam etasmin śāsane utpannaṃ ya eṣa.../ ye 'pi ca.... Ms: tasmāt dṛṣṭyarbudam etasmin chāsane(śā- erased, and corrected into chā- in the margin) utpannaṃ ya eṣa.../ ye pi ca... .

T(103b6): de lta bas na kha cig ni gaṅ zag tu ḥdsin kha cig ni thams cad med pa ñid du ḥdsin pa gaṅ yin pa de ni bstan pa ḥdi la skyon byuṅ ba yin no/...gaṅ dag... .(=tasmāt tasyārbudam etasmiñ chāsana utpannaṃ ya eṣa.../ ye 'pi ca...).

Zhēn(308a23): 是故於如來正法中, 無因緣起見瘡疱. 謂有諸人... 是諸外道(=tasmād dṛṣṭyarbudam etasmiñ chāsana utpannaṃ/ ya eṣa... ye 'pi ca...?).

Xuán(156c21): 故彼(tasya)於佛眞聖教中無有因緣起見瘡皰. 如是一類...外道(=tasmāt tasya dṛṣṭyarbudam etasmiñ chāsana utpannaṃ ya eṣa.../ ye 'pi ca...?).

The Chinese expressions "無因緣" and "無有因緣" seem to be employed here to describe irrational appearances of the arbudas.

Read *"tasmāt tasya dṛṣṭyarbudam etasmiñ chāsana utpannaṃ ya eṣa.../ ye 'pi ca..."*.

As for "dṛṣṭyarbuda", see 262, 14 and Yaś(428, 10).

548 (Ejima:) ekeṣāṃ sarvanāstitāgrāhaḥ.

"ekeṣāṃ"=空見外道 in Pŭ-guāng(Taisho 41, 446c28), =Madhyamakacittānām in Yaś(710, 32), not identified in Pūr(378b8).

549 (Ejima:) Pra: tīrthakārās.

Read *"tīrthikarās"* as in Ms.

"tīrthikarās"=數·勝論等外道 in Pŭ-guāng (Taisho 41, 446c29), =Kapila, Kaṇāda, Akṣapāda, Jaimini, etc. in Pūr(378b8).

(Lee:) Pra: tīrthakārās. Ms:tīrthakarās. Read *"tīrthakarās"* as in Ms.

550 (Ejima:) teṣām eva mokṣābhāvadoṣo niṣkampaḥ. Ms: teṣām eṣa mokṣa-

bhāvadoṣo niṣkampaḥ. T(103b7): de dag gi ltar na yaṅ thar pa med paḥi ñes pa ḥdi g-yo ba med pa yin no /.

Read *"teṣām eṣa mokṣābhāvadoṣo niṣkampaḥ"*.

ḥon te bdag la chags pa mi ḥbyuṅ ba kho naḥo ṣes bya bar ḥdod na/ de ni bdag med pa la ni bdag tu rmoṅs pas chags pa skyeḥi bdag ñid la ni[551] mi skyeḥo ṣes bya ba de ga la[552] ruṅ ste/ de lta bas na kha cig ni gaṅ zag tu ḥdsin kha cig ni thams cad med pa ñid du ḥdsin pa gaṅ yin pa de ni bstan pa ḥdi la skyon byuṅ ba yin no// mu stegs byed gaṅ dag bdag rdsas gṣan kho na yin par sems pa de dag gi ltar na yaṅ thar pa med paḥi ñes pa ḥdi g-yo ba med pa yin no//

551 CD.omit *ni*
552 P.ga la=dag

{%Skt 9-31}[Pra. 47216-47220]{%Chn}[Z. 308a27-308c6; X. 156c26-157b7]

- yadi tarhi sarvathāpi nāsty ātmā kathaṃ kṣaṇikeṣu citteṣu cirānubhūtasyārthasya smaraṇaṃ bhavati / pratyabhijñānaṃ vā /
- smṛtiviṣayasaṃjñānvayāc cittaviśeṣāt /
- kīdṛśāc cittaviśeṣāt /[553]
- yato 'nantaraṃ smṛtir bhavati tadābhogasadṛśasambandhisaṃjñādimato 'nupahataprabhāvād[554] āśrayaviśeṣaśokavyākṣepādibhiḥ /

tādṛśo 'pi hy atadanvayaś cittaviśeṣo na samarthaḥ tāṃ smṛtiṃ bhavayitum / tadanvayo 'pi cānyādṛśo na samarthas tāṃ smṛtiṃ bhavayitum / ubhayathā tu samartha ity evaṃ smṛtir bhavaty anyasya tatsāmarthyādarśanāt[555] /

---

553 (Ejima:) Pra: kīdṛśāc cittaviśeṣāt yato 'nantaraṃ... .

Read *"kīdṛśāc cittaviśeṣāt/ yato 'nantaraṃ... ."* in accordance with the punctuation in Ms.

554 (Ejima:) Pra: 'nupahata prabhāvād. Read *" 'nupahataprabhāvād"*.

555 (Ejima:) Pra: anyasyāṃ sāmarthyādarśanāt. Ms: *sic.*

T(104a3): gṣan la ni deḥi mthu ma mthoṅ baḥi phyir ro (=anyasya tat-sāmarthyādarśanāt). Zhēn(308b8): 不見餘物於念有功能故. Xuán(157a6): 不見離此有功能故. Cf. Yaś(711, 20): anyasya cittaviśeṣād anyasya.

Read *"anyasya tatsāmarthyādarśanāt"*.

{%Tib 9-31}[C.92a7-93a5, D.90b6-91b3, N.104a1-104b6, P.103b7-104b5]

ḥo na gal te bdag rnam pa thams cad du med na sems skad cig ma rnams la ñams su myoṅ nas riṅ mo ṣig lon[556] paḥi don ji ltar[557] dran[558] paḥam ṅo śes par ḥgyur//

dran paḥi yul la ḥdu śes paḥi rgyu las byuṅ baḥi sems kyi khyad par las so//

sems kyi khad par ji lta bu las śe na//

gaṅ gi mjug thogs su dran pa skye ba ste/ de dag la rtag pa daṅ ḥdra ba[559] daṅ ḥbrel pa can gyi ḥdu śes la sogs pa daṅ ldan pa daṅ rten gyi khyad par daṅ/ mya ṅan daṅ rnam par gyeṅs pa la sogs pas mthu ma[560] ñams pa can las so//

de lta bu yin yaṅ deḥi rgyu las byuṅ ba ma yin paḥi sems kyi khyad par gyis ni dran pa de bskyed par mi nus so// deḥi rgyu las byuṅ ba yin yaṅ gṣan lta bu ni dran pa de bskyed[561] par[562] mi nus kyi gñi ga ltar na nus pas de ltar na dran par ḥgyur te/ gṣan la ni deḥi mthu ma mthoṅ baḥi[563] phyir ro//

---

556 C.lon=len
557 NP.omit *ji ltar*
558 D.dran=bran
559 C.ḥdra ba=ḥdre ba
560 NP.thu ma=mthun
561 CD.bskyed=skyed
562 N.par=bar
563 D.baḥi=paḥi

- katham idānīm anyena cetasā dṛṣṭam anyat smarati / evaṃ hi devadattacetasā dṛṣṭaṃ yajñadattacetaḥ smaret /

- na / asambandhāt /[564] na hi tayoḥ saṃbandho 'sti akāryakāraṇabhāvād yathaikasāṃtānikayoḥ[565] / na ca brūmo 'nyena cetasā dṛṣṭam anyat smaratīti / api tu darśanacittāt smṛticittam anyad utpadyate[566] saṃtatipariṇatyā yathoktam iti ka evaṃ sati doṣaḥ /

smaraṇād eva ca pratyabhijñānaṃ bhavati /

- asaty ātmani ka evaṃ smarati[567] /

- smaratīti ko 'rthaḥ /

- smṛtyā viṣayaṃ gṛhnāti /

- kiṃ tadgrahaṇam anyat smaraṇāt /

- smṛtiṃ tarhi karoti /[568]

---

564 (Lee:) Pra: nāsambandhāt. T(104a4): ma yin te /(DP.omit /) ḥbrel ba med paḥi phyir ro//. Yaś(711, 21): na / asambandhād iti.

Read *"na / asambandhāt /"*.

565 (Ejima:) Pra: yathaikasaṃtānikayoḥ. Ms: yathaikasāntānikayoḥ.

Read *"yathaikasāṃtānikayoḥ"*.

T(104a4): ji ltar rgyud gcig la yod paḥi rgyu daṅ ḥbras bu ltar. "rgyu daṅ ḥbras bu" seems to be an explanatory addition by the translators. Cf. Yaś(711, 22): yathaikasāṃtānikayoś cetasoḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvāt saṃbandho/, and Pūr(380a5).

566 (Ejima:) Pra: anyad utpadyate /.

A note "Y. anyad evotpadyate" is given by Pradhan, but it should not be disregarded that the Tibetan version (398b5) reads "anyad utpadyate". Anyway read *"anyad utpadyate"*(without a daṇḍa) in the light of its context and the Chinese and Tibetan versions.

567 (Ejima:) Pra: ka eṣa smarati. Ms: ka e[v]a(*Lee: eṣa) smarati.

T(104a6): su ṣig gis de ltar dran. Read *"ka evaṃ smarati"*.

568 (Ejima:) Pra: smṛtiṃ tarhi kaḥ karoti /. Ms: smṛtin... .

T(104a6): ḥo na ni dran pa(P: pas) byed pa yin no/(=smṛtiṃ tarhi karoti/?). Zhēn(308b16): 不異此念, 能作取故(=smṛtyā ananyaḥ kartā gṛhṇāti/?). Xuán(157a14): 雖不異念, 但由作者(=smṛtyā ananyo 'pi karoti/?). The Chinese, possibly, do not translate the Sanskrit original verbatim. The present Sanskrit reading still remains questionable for a reason that its context to the preceding sentence is not necessarily clear.

(Lee:) Cf. Yaś(712, 11-16): asaty ātmani ka evaṃ vijānāti. ... vijñānaṃ tarhi karoti. ... . Read *"smṛtiṃ tarhi karoti/"* omitting "kaḥ" according to Tib and the context.

da ni ji ltar na sems gṣan gyis mthoṅ la gṣan gyis dran de ltar na ni lhas byin[569] gyis[570] sems kyis[571] mthoṅ la mchod sbyin gyi[572] sems kyis dran par ḥgyur ro//

ma yin te/[573] ḥbrel pa med paḥi phyir ro// de gñis ni rgyu daṅ ḥbras bur[574] ma gyur paḥi phyir ji ltar[575] rgyud gcig la yod paḥi rgyu daṅ ḥbras bu ltar[576] ḥbrel pa ni med do// sems gṣan gyis mthoṅ la gṣan gyis dran no ṣes kyaṅ mi zer ro// ḥon kyaṅ ji skad bśad pa ltar rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi tshul gyis mthoṅ baḥi sems la[577] dran paḥi sems gṣan skyeḥo ṣes bya ba de lta bu la ñes pa ci ṣig yod//

dran pa kho na las ṅo śes pa yaṅ yin no//

bdag med na su ṣig gis de ltar dran//

dran ṣes bya baḥi don ci yin//

dran pas yul ḥdsin paḥo//

ci de[578] ḥdsin pa dran pa las gṣan ṣig yin nam/

ḥo na ni dran pa[579] byed pa yin no//

---

569 NP.sbyin=byin

570 CDNP.gyis=*sic.* It is the better reading to read *'gyi'* instead of *'gyis'*.

571 NP.kyis=kyi

572 CD.gyi=gyis

573 CDNP.omit /, but inserted according to my opinion.

574 CDNP.ḥbras bur=*sic.* It is the better reading to read *'ḥbras bu ltar'* instead of *'ḥbras bur'*.

575 CD.ji ltar=ji ltar na

576 CD.bu ltar=bur

577 DNP.la=*sic. las* is the better reading?

578 D.de=di

579 P.pa=pas; N.pa=par

- uktaḥ sa yas tāṃ karoti /[580] smṛtihetuś cittaviśeṣaḥ[581] /
- yat tarhi caitraḥ smaratīty[582] ucyate /
- tato hi[583] caitrākhyāt saṃtānāt tāṃ bhavantīṃ dṛṣṭvocyate caitraḥ smaratīti[584] /
- asaty ātmani kasyeyaṃ smṛtiḥ /
- kimarthaiṣā ṣaṣṭhī /
- svāmyarthā[585] /
- yathā kasya kaḥ svāmī /
- yathā goś caitraḥ /
- katham asau tasyāḥ svāmī /
- tadadhīno[586] hi tasyā vāhadohādiṣu viniyogaḥ /
- kva ca punaḥ smṛtir viniyoktavyā yata etasyāḥ[587] svāmī mṛgyate /
- smartavye 'rthe /
- kimarthaṃ viniyoktavyā /
- smaraṇārtham /
- aho sūktāni sukhaidhitānām / saiva hi nāma tadarthaṃ viniyoktavyeti / katham ca viniyoktavyā / utpādanata āhosvit[588] saṃpreṣaṇataḥ /
- smṛtigatyayogād utpādanataḥ /

---

580 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

581 (Ejima:) Pra: smṛtihetucittaviśeṣaḥ/. Ms: *sic.* T(104a7): dran paḥi rgyu ni sems kyi khyad par yin no/. Zhēn(308b17): 因緣能生此念, 謂想類差別心. Xuán(157a15): 念因, 謂彼類心差別. Read *"smṛtihetuś cittaviśeṣaḥ/"*.

582 (Lee:) Cf. Yaś(712, 5): *yat tarhi caitraḥ smaratīty* tat katham iti vākyādhyāhāraḥ.

583 (Ejima:) Pra: tato. Read *"tato hi"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

584 (Ejima:) caitraḥ smaratīti. Ms: *sic.* Left out in T(104a7), but not in Zhēn(308b19 :說名憶念) and Xuán(157a18: 說彼能憶).

585 (Ejima:) kimarthaiṣā ṣaṣṭhī/ svāmyarthā/... .

Cf. Pāṇini 2, 3, 39: "svāmi-īśvara-adhipati-dāyāda-sākṣi-pratibhū-prasūtaiś ca (ṣaṣṭhī saptamī)".

586 (Ejima:) Pra: tadādhīno. Read *"tadadhīno"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

587 (Lee:) Pra: ya evaṃ tasyāḥ.

T(104b1): dran pa gaṅ du sbyar bar bya na/ hdi ltar hdihi(D.hdihi=dehi) (=yata etasyāḥ?) rje bo btsal/. Cf. Yaś(712, 17-18): ... yāvat kva ca punar vijñānaṃ viniyoktavyaṃ yata etasya svāmī mṛgyate.

Read *"yata etasyāḥ"*.

588 (Lee:) Pra: ahosvit. Read *"āhosvit"* as in Ms.

gaṅ gis de byed pa de ni bśad zin te/ dran paḥi rgyu ni sems kyi khyad par yin no//

ḥo na gaṅ nag pas dran no ṣes bya ba ji lta bu ṣe na/

nag pa ṣes bya baḥi rgyud[589] de las de skye bar mthoṅ nas smra[590] bar zad do//

bdag med [591] na dran pa ḥdi suḥi yin//

drug pa ḥdiḥi don ji lta bu yin/

rje boḥi don yin no//

dper na gaṅ gi rje bo gaṅ lta bu yin//

dper na baḥi nag pa lta bu yin no//

ḥdi ji ltar deḥi rje bo yin//

de rmo ba[592] daṅ bṣo ba[593] la sogs pa la sbyor ba de la rag lus pa yin no//

dran pa gaṅ du sbyar bar bya na/ ḥdi ltar ḥdiḥi[594] rje bo btsal//

dran par bya baḥi don laḥo//

ciḥi phyir sbyar bar bya//

dran par bya baḥi phyir ro//

kye ma de ñid deḥi don du sbyor ro[595] ṣes bya ba ni bsod nams kyis bskyed pa rnams kyis legs par smras so// ji ltar sbyar bar bya/[596] ci de bskyed paḥi sgo nas sam/ ḥon te mṅag paḥi sgo nas//

dran pa la ḥgro ba mi ruṅ bas bskyed paḥi sgo nas so//

---

589 NP.rgyud=rgyu
590 C.smra=sma
591 CD.med=med pa
592 NP.rmo ba=rma
593 P.bṣo=bṣi ba; N.bṣo=bṣi pa
594 CD.ḥdiḥi=deḥi
595 NP.omit *ro*
596 NP.omit /

- hetur eva tarhi svāmī prāpnoti phalam eva ca svam / yasmād dhetor ādhipatyaṃ[597] phale phalena ca tadvān hetur iti / yo hy eva hetuḥ smṛtes tasyaivāsau /

yaś cāpi sa caitrābhidhānaḥ saṃskārasamūhasaṃtāna ekato gṛhītvā gavākhyasvāmīty ucyate sa cāpi tasya deśāntaravikārotpattau kāraṇabhāvaṃ cetasi kṛtvā svāmīty ucyate na tu khalu[598] kaścid ekaś caitro nāmāsti na cāpi gauḥ / tasmāt tatrāpi na hetubhāvaṃ vyatītyāsti svāmibhāvaḥ /

evaṃ ko vijānāti kasya vijñānam ity evamādiṣu vaktavyam / tasya hetur indriyārthamanaskārā yathāyogam ity eṣa viśeṣaḥ /

---

597 (Ejima:) ādhipatyaṃ. Cf. "adhipati" in Pāṇini 2, 3, 39.

598 (Lee:) Pra: cetasi kṛtvā na tu khalu... . Ms: *sic.*

T(104b3): rgyuḥi dṅos po yid(P.yid=yod) la bsams nas rje bo ses brjod par zad kyi... . Cf. Yaś(712, 8-9): ... kāraṇabhāvaṃ cetasi kṛtvā. kiṃ. svāmīty ucyate. na tu pudgalaṃ. Zhēn(308c2-3): 思量爲因緣故, 說名牛主, 於中無一人名天與. Xuán(157b2-3): 是牛相續於異方生變異生因, 故名爲主, 此中無一實制怛羅亦無實牛.

Read *"cetasi kṛtvā svāmīty ucyate na tu khalu ..."* inserting "svāmīty ucyate".

de lta na ni rgyu kho nas[599] rje bo yin la ḥbras bu kho na bran yin par ḥgyur te[600]/ ḥdi ltar rgyu ni ḥbras bu la dbaṅ byed la ḥbras bu yaṅ de daṅ ldan pa[601] rgyu yin pas de ni dran paḥi rgyu gaṅ yin pa de kho naḥi[602] yin no//

gaṅ yaṅ nag pa ṣes bya ba ḥdu byed kyi tshogs kyi[603] rgyun la gcig tu bzuṅ nas ba ṣes bya baḥi rje bo[604] brjod pa de yaṅ de yul gṣan du daṅ/ ḥgyur ba ḥbyuṅ ba la rgyuḥi dṅos po yid[605] la bsams nas rje bo ṣes brjod par zad kyi nag pa ṣes bya ba gcig pu[606] ni ḥgaḥ yaṅ med la ba ṣes bya ba yaṅ med do// de lta bas na de la yaṅ rgyuḥi dṅos po ma gtogs paḥi rje boḥi dṅos po med do//

de bṣin du su ṣig gis[607] rnam par śes/[608] suḥi rnam par śes pa yin ṣes bya ba de lta bu la sogs pa yaṅ brjod par bya ste/ deḥi rgyu ni ci rigs par dbaṅ po daṅ don daṅ yid la byed pa dag[609] yin no[610] ṣes bya ba ḥdi ni khyad par yin no//

---

599 CD.nas=na la
600 C.te=to
601 CD.pa=na
602 CD.kho naḥi=kho na
603 P.kyi=kyis
604 N.inserts / after *bo*
605 P.yid=yod
606 D.pu=pa; P.pu=bu
607 NP.gis=gi
608 NP.omit /
609 D.yid la byed pa dag=yid la byed bdag
610 N.inserts // after *yin no*

{%Skt 9-32}[Pra. 47315-47324]{%Chn}[Z. 308c6-18; X. 157b7-20]

- yo 'py āha /[611] bhāvasya bhavitrapekṣatvāt sarvo hi bhāvo bhavitāram apekṣate / yathā devadatto gacchatīty atra gatir bhāvo gantāraṃ devadattam apekṣate / tathā vijñānaṃ bhāvaḥ / tasmād yo vijānāti tena bhavitavyam iti / sa vaktavyaḥ / ko 'yaṃ devadatta iti /

yady ātmā sa eva sādhyaḥ / atha vyavahārapuruṣaḥ / so 'pi na kaścid ekaḥ saṃskārā hi ta evaṃnāmānaḥ / tatra yathā devadatto gacchati tathā vijānāti[612] /

---

611 (Lee:) Insert *daṇḍa* as in Ms.

Cf. Yaś(712, 26): yo 'py āha. bhāvasya bhavitrapekṣatvād iti Vaiyākaranah.

612 (Ejima:) Pra: yathā vijānāti. Read *"tathā vijānāti"* as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-32}[C.93a5-93b2, D.91b3-7, N.104b6-105a4, P.104b5-105a3]

gaṅ yaṅ bya ba ni byed pa po la ltos[613] paḥi phyir te/ bya ba thams cad ni byed pa po la ltos[614] te/ ji ltar lhas byin[615] ḥgroḥo[616] ṣes bya ba ḥdi la ḥgro bar bya ba ni ḥgro ba po lhas byin[617] la ltos[618] pa de bṣin du rnam par śes pa ni bya ba yin no// de lta bas na gaṅ ṣig gis rnam par śes pa de yaṅ brjod[619] dgos so ṣes zer ba[620] de la lhas byin ṣes bya ba ḥdi ci yin ṣes brjod par byaḥo//

gal te bdag yin no ṣe na/ de ñid bsgrub par bya ba yin no// ḥon te skyes bu[621] tha sñad gdags pa yin no ṣe na/ de yaṅ gcig pu ni ḥgaḥ yaṅ med kyi ḥdu byed de dag la yaṅ[622] miṅ de skad ces byaḥo// de la ji ltar lhas byin ḥgro ba de bṣin du rnam par śes so//

---

613 NP.ltos=bltos
614 N.ltos=bltos
615 P.lhas byin=lha byin; CD.lhas byin=lha sbyin
616 P.inserts // after *ḥgroḥo*
617 P.lhas byin=lha sbyin
618 NP.ltos=bltos
619 NP.omit *brjod*
620 C.ba=bo
621 CD.bu=bur
622 NP.omit *yaṅ*

- kathaṃ ca devadatto gacchati /

- kṣaṇikā hi saṃskārā abhinnasaṃtānā devadatta iti bālair ekasattvapiṇḍa-grāheṇādhimuktāḥ[623] svasya saṃtānasya deśāntarotpattau kāraṇaṃ bhavanta[624] ucyante gacchati devadatta iti / sā ca deśāntarotpattir gatir iti[625] / jvālāśabdasaṃtānayor gacchatigamanābhidhānavat[626] /

ta eva ca punar vijñānasya kāraṇaṃ bhavanta ucyante vijānāti[627] devadatta iti / āryair api teṣāṃ saṃjñayā tathocyante vyavahārārtham /

---

623 (Ejima:) ekasattvapiṇḍagrāheṇa.

T(105a1): gcig pa(P: la) ñid bzuṅ nas(=ekatvagrāheṇa). Zhēn(308c14): 執彼許爲一衆生(=ekasattvagrāheṇa). Xuán(157b15): 於中執爲一體(=ekapiṇḍagrāheṇa?).

624 (Ejima:) Pra: svasya saṃtānasya deśāntare kāraṇaṃ bhavanta.

T(105a1): raṅ gi rgyun yul gṣan du ḥbyuṅ ba la rgyur gyur na(=svasya saṃtānasya deśāntarotpattau kāraṇaṃ bhavanta). Zhēn(308c14): 彼於別處作自相續因. Xuán(157b15): 爲自相續異處生因.

Read *"svasya saṃtānasya deśāntarotpattau kāraṇaṃ bhavanta"*.

625 (Ejima:) Pra: deśāntaropattir gatir ita.

Read *"deśāntarotpattir gatir iti"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

626 (Ejima:) gacchatigamanābhidhānavat.

Ms: ggacchatārgamanābhidhānavat (*Lee: ggacchatāgamanābhidhānavat).

T(105a2): ḥgroḥo ṣes brjod pa yin no(=gacchatīty abhidhānam). Zhēn(308c16): 譬... 於別處生說名行. Xuán(157b17): 如...世依此說焰聲能行.

Yaś(712, 28): gacchatigamanābhidānavad iti(Tibetan(397a1): ḥgroḥo ḥgro baḥo ṣes brjod pa bṣin no ṣes bya ba ni). Pūr(381a5): ḥgro baḥi(?) ḥgro baḥo... .

627 (Ejima:) Pra: jānāti. Ms: *sic.* T(105a2): rnam par śes so. Zhēn(308c17): 識. Xuán(157b19): 能了. Read *"vijānāti"*.

lhas byin[628] ji ltar ḥgro ṣe na/

ḥdu byed skad cig pa[629] rgyun tha mi dad pa rnams la byis pa rnams kyis gcig pa ñid du[630] bzuṅ nas lhas byin ṣes mos pa rnams raṅ gi rgyun yul gṣan du ḥbyuṅ ba la rgyur gyur na lhas byin ḥgroḥo ṣes byaḥo// yul gṣan du ḥbyuṅ ba de ni ḥgro ba yin te/ me daṅ sgraḥi rgyun dag la ḥgroḥo ṣes ḥgro baḥo ṣes[631] brjod pa yin no//

de dag ñid rnam par śes paḥi rgyur gyur na lhas byin gyis rnam par śes so ṣes kyaṅ byaḥo// ḥphags pa rnams kyis kyaṅ tha sñad gdags paḥi don[632] du de dag la miṅ du de skad ces gsuṅs so//

---

628 CD.lhas byin=lha sbyin

629 D.pa=ba

630 P.gcig pa ñid du=gcig la ñid; N.gcig pa ñid du=gcig pa ñid

631 DP.omit *ḥgro baḥo ṣes*

632 NP.gdags paḥi don=gdags paḥi phyir

{%Skt 9-33}[Pra. 47325-47409]{%Chn}[Z. 308c18-309a2; X. 157b20-157c4]

- yat tarhi "vijñānaṃ vijānātī"ti[633] sūtra uktaṃ kiṃ tatra vijñānaṃ karoti /
- na kiṃcit karoti / yathā tu kāryaṃ kāraṇam anuvidhīyata ity ucyate / sādṛśyenātmalābhād akurvad api kiṃcit / evaṃ vijñānam api viṣayaṃ vijānātiity[634] ucyate / sādṛśyenātmalābhād akurvad api kiṃcit /
- kiṃ punar asya sādṛśyam /
- tadākāratā / ata eva tad indriyād apy utpannaṃ viṣayaṃ vijānātīty ucyate nendriyam /

atha vā tathā 'trāpi vijñānasaṃtānasya vijñāne kāraṇabhāvād vijñānaṃ vijānātīti vacanaṃ[635] nirdoṣaṃ kāraṇe kartṛśabdanirdeśāt[636] / ghaṇṭā rautīti yadvat /

api khalu yathā pradīpo gacchati / tathā vijñānaṃ vijānātīti /

---

633 (Ejima:) "vijñānaṃ vijānātī"ti.

Cf. Zhōng 211(Taisho 1, 790c6), MN 43(I, 292, 25).

634 (Ejima:) Pra: vijānāti-. T(105a4): yul rnam par śes so, Zhēn(308c21): 識境, Xuán(157b23): 了境. Read "*viṣayaṃ vijānāti-*".

635 (Ejima:) Pra: vacanān. Ms: vacanan. T(105a5): gsuṅs pa.

Read "*vacanaṃ*" as in Ms.

636 (Ejima:) kartṛśabdanirdeśāt. Ms: karttṛ-... .

Yaś(713, 2): kartṛśabdaniveśād (Tibetan(397a6): byed pa poḥi sgrar bstan paḥi phyir).

{%Tib 9-33}[C.93B2-7, D.91b7-92a5, N.105a4-105b3, P.105a3-105b1]

ḥo na gaṅ mdo las[637] rnam par śes pas rnam par śes so ṣes gsuṅs pa de la rnam par śes pa ci ṣig byed/

cuṅ zad kyaṅ mi byed de/ ji ltar ḥbras bu ni cuṅ zad kyaṅ mi byed mod kyi ḥdra bar bdag ñid thob paḥi phyir rgyu daṅ mthun par byed do ṣes bya ba de bṣin du rnam par śes pa yaṅ cuṅ zad kyaṅ mi byed mod kyi ḥdra bar bdag ñid thob paḥi phyir yul rnam par śes so ṣes byaḥo//[638]

ḥdiḥi ḥdra ba ci ṣe na//[639]

deḥi rnam pa ñid do// de ñid kyi phyir de ni dbaṅ po las kyaṅ skyes mod kyi yul rnam par śes so ṣes bya baḥi dbaṅ po ni[640] ma yin no//

yaṅ na ni der yaṅ rnam par śes paḥi rgyun rnam par śes paḥi rgyur gyur paḥi phyir [641]rnam par śes pas rnam par śes so ṣes gsuṅs pas[642] ñes pa med de/[643] rgyu la byed pa poḥi sgrar bstan paḥi phyir dril bus[644] sgrogs so ṣes bya ba bṣin no//

gṣan yaṅ ji ltar sgron ma ḥgro ba ltar rnam par śes pas[645] rnam par śes so ṣes bya ba yaṅ de daṅ ḥdraḥo//

---

637 NP.insert / after *las*
638 NP.omit //
639 NP.ṣe na//=ṣig
640 NP.omit *ni*
641 NP.insert / after *phyir*
642 NP.pas=pa
643 NP.de/=do//
644 CD.bus=bu
645 C.pas=paḥi

- kathaṃ ca pradīpo gacchati /

- pradīpa ity arciṣāṃ saṃtāna upacaryate / sa deśāntareṣūtpadyamānas taṃ taṃ deśaṃ[646] gacchatīty ucyate / evaṃ vijñānam api cittānāṃ saṃtāna upacaryate / tad viṣayāntareṣūtpadyamānaṃ taṃ taṃ viṣayaṃ[647] vijānātīty ucyate /

yathā vā bhavati jāyate tiṣṭhati rūpam ity[648] atra bhavitur bhāvād anarthāntaratvam evaṃ vijñānasyāpi syāt /

---

646 (Ejima:) Pra: taṃ deśam. Ms: tan tad deśam.

T(105a7): yul de dań der(P:de). Pūr(381b2): yul de dań der. Y(713, 6) : taṃ taṃ deśaṃ. Read *"taṃ taṃ deśaṃ"*.

647 (Ejima:) Pra: taṃ viṣayaṃ. Ms: tam viṣayam.

T(105a8): yul de dań de. Pūr(381b2): yul de dań (de). Yaś(713, 8): taṃ taṃ viṣayaṃ. Read *"taṃ taṃ viṣayaṃ"*

648 (Ejima:) Pra: yathā cābhijāyate tiṣṭhati rupam ity. Ms: ...rūpam ity.

T(105a8): yań na ji ltar gzugs ḥgyur ro// skyeḥo gnas so ṣes bya ba(=yathā vā bhavati jāyate tiṣṭhati rūpam iti). Zhēn(308c29): 復次譬如世間說"色有色生色住". Xuán(157c2): 或如色有色生色住. Pūr(381b3): yań ji ltar gzugs ḥgyur ro ṣes bya ba rgyas par ḥbyuń ba ni/ ji ltar ḥgyur ba po ḥgyur ba la.... . Yaś(713, 9): yathā vā rūpaṃ(originally omitted in the manuscripts) bhavatīti vistaraḥ/ yathā bhavitū rūpasya bhāvāj... .

Read *"yathā vā bhavati jāyate tiṣṭhati rūpam ity"*.

sgron ma ji ltar ḥgro ṣe na/

sgron ma ṣes bya ba ni me lce rnams kyi[649] rgyun la ñe bar ḥdogs par byed la/ de yul gṣan dag tu[650] ḥbyuṅ ba la[651] yul de daṅ der[652] ḥgroḥo ṣes byaḥo// de bṣin du rnam par śes pa ṣes bya ba ni sems rnams kyi rgyun la ñe bar ḥdogs par byed la de yul gṣan dag la skye ba la yul de daṅ de rnam par śes so ṣes byaḥo//

yaṅ na ji ltar gzugs ḥgyur ro// skyeḥo gnas so ṣes bya ba ḥdi la ḥgyur ba po daṅ ḥgyur ba don gṣan ma yin pa ltar rnam par śes pa la yaṅ[653] de daṅ ḥdra bar ḥgyur ro//

649 P.kyi=kyis
650 NP.dag tu=du
651 CD.la=las
652 NP.der=de
653 CD.omit *yaṅ*

{%Skt 9-34}[Pra. 47409-47426]{%Chn}[Z. 309a2-23; X. 157c4-26]

- yadi vijñānād vijñānam utpadyate nātmanaḥ /[654] kasmān na nityaṃ tādṛśam evotpadyate / na ca kramaniyamenāṅkurakāṇḍapatrādivat /

- sthityanyathātvasya saṃskṛtalakṣaṇatvāt / eṣa hi sarvasaṃskṛtasya[655] svabhāvo yad avaśyaṃ prabandhasyānyathātvaṃ bhavati / anyathā hi nikāmadhyānasamāhitānāṃ sadṛśakāyacittotpattau prathamakṣaṇanirviśeṣatvāt[656] paścād api na syāt svayaṃ vyutthānam /

kramo 'pi hi cittānāṃ[657] niyata eva yato yad utpattavyaṃ tata eva tasyotpādāt[658] /

tulyākāram api hi kiṃcidutpādane samarthaṃ bhavati gotraviśeṣāt / tadyathā[659] strīcittānantaraṃ yadi tatkāyavidūṣaṇācittam utpannaṃ bhavati / tatpatiputrādicittaṃ vā / punaś ca paścāt saṃtatipariṇatyā strīcittam utpadyate / tat samarthaṃ bhavati tatkāyavidūṣaṇācittotpādane tatpatiputrādicittotpādane vā / tadgotratvāt[660] / anyathā na samartham /

---

654 (Lee:) Pra: nātmānaḥ. Read *"nātmanaḥ /"* as in Ms.

655 (Lee:) saṃskṛtasya. Ms: *sic.*

T(105b2): ... ḥdi ni ḥdus byas(P.ḥdus byas=ḥdus byas so) thams cad(D.omits 'thams cad') kyi raṅ bṣin yin(D.omits 'yin') no/. Zhēn(309a4-5): 一切有爲法性皆如此必定相續不同. Xuán(157c6-7): 謂諸有爲自性法爾微細相續後必異前.

Read *"sarvasaṃskṛtasya"*.

656 (Ejima:) Pra: -niṃrviśeṣatvāt. Read *"-nirviśeṣatvāt"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

657 (Ejima:) cittānāṃ. T(105b3): sems can rnams kyi(D:*sic*)?

658 (Ejima:) Pra: yato nūtpattavyaṃ tata eva tasyotpādāt.

Ms: yato notpattavyaṃ... . T(105b3): gaṅ las gaṅ ṣig skye bar ḥgyur ba de kho na las de skye baḥi phyir(=yato yad utpattavyaṃ...). Zhēn(309a7): 若心應從此心生, 從此彼必定生故. Xuán(157c9): 若此心次彼心應生, 於此心後彼必生故.

Read *"yato yad utpattavyaṃ tata eva tasyotpādāt"*.

659 (Ejima:) Pra: yadyathā. Read *"tadyathā"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

660 (Ejima:) tadgotratvāt. Ms: tatgotratvāt. "tadgotratvāt" as in the footnote of the first edition.

{%Tib 9-34}[C.93b7-94b1, D.92a5-92b5, N.105b3-106a5, P.105b1-106a2]

gal te rnam par śes pa las rnam par śes pa skyeḥi[661] bdag las ma yin na ciḥi phyir rtag tu de daṅ[662] ḥdra ba kho nar skye bar mi ḥgyur ṣiṅ myu gu daṅ sdoṅ po daṅ ḥdab ma la sogs pa bṣin du rim pa ṅes[663] par skye bar mi ḥgyur ṣe na//

gnas pa gṣan du ḥgyur ba ni ḥdus byas kyi mtshan ñid yin paḥi phyir te/ rgyun gdon mi za bar gṣan du ḥgyur ba gaṅ yin pa ḥdi ni ḥdus bya s[664] thams cad[665] kyi raṅ bṣin yin[666] no// de lta ma yin na bsam gtan rdsogs pas mñam par gṣag pa rnams las lus daṅ sems ḥdra ba skye na[667] skad cig ma daṅ po daṅ khyad par med paḥi phyir phyis kyaṅ bdag ñid ldaṅ bar mi ḥgyur ro//

gaṅ las gaṅ ṣig skye bar ḥgyur ba de kho na las de skye baḥi phyir sems can rnams kyi rim pa yaṅ ṅes pa[668] kho na ste/ rigs kyi bye brag las sems rnam pa ḥdra yaṅ ḥgaḥ ṣig sems ḥgaḥ skyed[669] pa la nus pa yin te/ dper na bud med kyi sems kyi[670] mjug thogs su gal te deḥi lus sun ḥbyin paḥi sems sam/ deḥi khyo ḥam bu la sogs paḥi sems skye bar ḥgyur la/ yaṅ phyis rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur bas bud med kyi sems skye na de ni[671] deḥi lus sun ḥbyin paḥi sems skyed[672] paḥam/[673] deḥi khyo ḥam[674] bu la sogs paḥi sems[675] skyed[676] par nus pa yin te/ deḥi rigs can yin pa ñid kyi phyir ro// gṣan du ni mi nus so//

---

661 NP.skyeḥi=skyeḥo
662 CD.daṅ=dag
663 C.ṅes=ṅas
664 NP.ḥdus byas=ḥdus byas so
665 CD.omit *thams cad*
666 CD.omit *yin*
667 DN.skye na=skyen
668 NP.pa=par
669 CD.skyed=bskyed
670 CD.omit *sems kyi*
671 D.inserts / after *ni*
672 CD.skyed=bskyed
673 NP.omit /
674 CD.insert / after *ḥam*
675 NP.omit *sems*
676 CD.skyed=bskyed

atha punaḥ paryāyeṇa strīcittād bahuvidhaṃ cittam utpannaṃ tato yad bahutaraṃ paṭutaram āsannataraṃ vā[677] tad evotpadyate / tadbhāvanāyā balīyastvāt / anyatra tatkālikāt kāyabāhyapratyayaviśeṣāt /

- saiva balīyasī bhāvanā kasmān nityaṃ na phalati /

- sthityanyathātvasya saṃskṛtalakṣaṇatvāt / tasya cānyathātvasyānya-bhāvanāphalotpattāv ānuguṇyāt /

etad dhi sarvacittaprakāreṣu diṅmātram / nirantarakāraṇajñāne tu buddhānāṃ prabhutvam // evaṃ hy āhuḥ /

"sarvākārakāraṇam ekasya mayūracandrakasyāpi /
nāsarvajñair jñeyaṃ sarvajñabalaṃ hi tajjñānam //"

iti /[678]

prāg evārūpiṇāṃ cittabhedānām /

---

677 (Ejima:) Pra: bahutaram āsannataraṃ vā. Ms :...āsannataram vā.

T(105b6): de las ches mań ba dań/ ches gsal ba dań/ ches ñe bar(P: ba) skyes pa gań yin pa(=tato yad bahutaraṃ paṭutaram āsannataraṃ vā, cf. Yaś(714, 7)). Zhēn(309a14): 於此衆心中若心多生明了生, 最近生. Xuán(157c16): 然多心中若先數起, 明了近起.

Read *"tato yad bahutaraṃ paṭutaram āsannataraṃ vā"*.

"yad" as a relative pronoun corresponds to the following "tad".

678 (Ejima:) "sarvākārakāraṇam..." iti//.

This verse is attributed by Pŭ-guāng(Taisho 41, 449a20) to the Sautrāntikas(經部中), and by Pūr(382b8) and Yaś(714, 21) to Rāhula.

(Lee:) Pra: tajjñānam iti //. Ms: ta<j>jñānam iti /. Read *"tajjñānam // iti /"*.

yaṅ bud med kyi sems las rnam graṅs kyi sems rnam pa maṅ po ṣig skyes par gyur na de las ches maṅ ba daṅ/ ches gsal ba daṅ/ ches ñe bar[679] skyes pa gaṅ yin pa de kho na skye bar ḥgyur te/ deḥi bsgos pa[680] stobs daṅ ldan paḥi phyir ro// deḥi ḥdus paḥi lus daṅ phyi rol gyi rkyen gyi khyad par ni ma gtogs so//

bsgos pa[681] de ñid ches[682] stobs daṅ[683] ldan na ciḥi phyir rtag tu ḥbras bu mi ḥbyin ṣe[684] na/

gnas pa gṣan du ḥgyur ba ñid ni ḥdus byas kyi mtshan ñid yin paḥi phyir la/ gṣan du ḥgyur ba de yaṅ bsgos pa[685] gṣan gyi[686] ḥbras bu skye baḥi rjes[687] su mthun paḥi phyir ro//

ḥdi ni sems kyi rnam pa thams cad la phyogs tsam du zad kyi mjug[688] thogs kyi rgyu[689] śes pa la ni saṅs rgyas rnams[690] mṅaḥ bdag yin te/ ḥdi skad du/ /[691]

rma byaḥi mdoṅs ni gcig la yaṅ//
rgyu[692] yi rnam pa thams cad ni//
kun mkhyen min pas śes bya min//
de śes kun mkhyen stobs yin no//[693]

ṣes bśad na/ gzugs can ma yin pa sems kyi bye brag rnams lta smos kyaṅ ci dgos//

---

679 NP.bar=ba
680 NP.bsgos pa=dgos pa
681 NP.bsgos pa=dgos pa
682 NP.ches=chos
683 NP.omit *daṅ*
684 NP.ṣe=ce
685 NP.bsgos pa=dgos pa
686 NP.gyi=gyis
687 D.rjes=rjas
688 NP.mjug=ḥjug
689 P.rgyu=rgya
690 NP.omit *rnams*
691 CDP.omit //; N.//=/
692 P.rgyu=rgya
693 NP.omit //

{%Skt 9-35}[Pra. 47501-47603]{%Chn}[Z. 309a23-309c6; X. 157c26-158b6]

- ya eva tv ayam ekīyas tīrthika[694] ātmaprabhavāṃ cittotpattiṃ manyate / tasyaivedaṃ sphuṭaṃ codyam āpadyate / kasmān na nityaṃ tādṛśam evotpadyate / na ca kramaniyamenāṅkurakāṇḍapatrādivad iti /

694 (Ejima:) ya eva tv ayam ekīyas tīrthika ātmaprabhavāṃ cittotpattiṃ manyate.

ekīyas tīrthikas=Vaiśeṣikas, Cf. Pŭ-guāng(Taisho 41, 449a27), Fă-bǎo(Taisho 41, 810b12), Pūr(383a3), Yaś(715, 3).

Here starts the author a critique of the Vaiśeṣika(or the Naiyāyika) theory on the ātman, cognition and reminiscence. The following citations or references by Vasubandhu(c. 400-480 A. D.) give us a few but very important informations which belongs to the so-called "dark period" i.e. to the period from the first compilation of the *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*(2nd century) up to Praśastapāda(5th-6th century) as the author of the systematic *Padārthadharmasaṃgraha*. According to such relevant knowledges of ours, Vasubandhu is posterior to the Naiyāyika Vātsyāyana(4th century.) and a little senior to Praśastapāda who was slightly later criticized by Dignāga(c.470-530) and whose theories were critically introduced into the Nyāya system by Uddyotakara(the second half of the 6th century). What concerns the disputes here between Vasubandhu and the Vaiśeṣikas, I am not sure for the present which of Vasubandhu and Praśastapāda is prior to the another. The materials now offered by Vasubandhu require to be analysed from the historical view-point focussed upon the 'interdisciplinary' situations at that time. But it is not our task to do so; it would need another separate paper. The present writer restricts himself merely to draw the reader's attention to some parallel or related passages in the *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*(VS), the *Praśastapādabhāṣya*(PBh) and others.

{%Tib 9-35}[C.94a1-95a6, D.92b5-93b1, N.106a5-107a3, P.106a2-106b7]

ciḥi phyir de daṅ ḥdra ba kho nar skye bar mi ḥgyur ṣiṅ myu gu daṅ sdoṅ bu daṅ ḥdab ma la sogs pa bṣin du rim pa ṅes par skye bar mi ḥgyur ṣes bya ba ḥdi ni mu stegs can gaṅ la la sems ni bdag las skyeḥo sñam du sems pa de kho na la gsal bar klan kar ḥgyur ro//

manaḥsaṃyogaviśeṣāpekṣatvād[695] iti cet / na / anyasaṃyogāsiddheḥ[696] / saṃyoginoś ca[697] paricchinnatvād aprāptipūrvikā prāptiḥ saṃyoga iti lakṣaṇavyākhyānāc[698] cātmanaḥ[699] paricchedaprasaṅgaḥ /

tato manaḥsamcārād ātmanaḥ saṃcāraprasaṅgo vināśasya vā[700] / pradeśasaṃyoga iti[701] cet / na / tasyaiva tatpradeśatvāyogāt /

---

695 (Ejima:) manaḥsaṃyogaviśeṣāpekṣatvād iti.

Cf. VS 9, 2, 6: ātmamanasoḥ saṃyogaviśeṣāt saṃskārāc ca smṛtiḥ //,

PBh(620, 17): liṅgadarśanecchānusmaraṇādyapekṣād ātmamanasoḥ saṃyogaviśeṣāt paṭvabhyāsādarapratyayajanitāc ca saṃskārād dṛṣṭaśrutānubhūteṣv artheṣu śeṣānuvyavasāyecchānusmaraṇadveṣahetur atītaviṣayā smṛtir iti //,

NS 3, 2, 32-33 and NBh on them.

696 (Ejima:) anyasaṃyogāsiddheḥ.

T(106a4): ḥbrel pa gṣan ma yin paḥi phyir ro(D: *sic*). Yaś(715, 7): tābhyām ātmamanobhyām anyasya saṃyogasyāsiddheḥ, and the same in Pūr(383a6).

If so, then it is misread in Xuán(158a1: 我與餘合非極成故, to the effect that "ātmano 'nyena saṃyogasyāsiddheḥ".

697 (Lee:) Pra: saṃyoginos tu. Ms: *sic*. T(106a4): /ḥbrel pa can dag yoṅs su chad paḥi phyir daṅ/. Yaś(715, 8-9): saṃyoginoś ca iti vistaraḥ. Zhēn(309a27-28): 由二和合物有定量故. Xuán(158a1-2): 我與餘合非極成故, 又二物合有分限故. Read *"saṃyoginoś ca"*.

698 (Ejima:) "aprāptipūrvikā prāptiḥ saṃyoga" iti lakṣaṇavyākhyānāc.

PBh(484, 6): aprāptayoḥ prāptiḥ saṃyogaḥ. Upaskāra(324, 18) ad VS 7, 2, 9: aprāptipūrvikā prāptiḥ saṃyogaḥ(N.B.: the Upaskāra belongs to the 15th century).

And it deserves attention that Praśastapāda employs the word "-pūrvika" in the definition of the "vibhāga" while not in that of "saṃyoga"; PBh(494, 24): prāptipūrvikāprāptir vibhāgaḥ.

699 (Ejima:) Pra: ātmānaḥ. Ms: ātmanaḥ. Read *"ātmanaḥ"* as in Ms.

700 (Ejima:) Pra: virāgasya vā. Ms: *sic*.

T(106a5): ñams par (thal bar ḥgyur ro). Zhēn(309b1): 及滅. Xuán(158a4): 或應與意俱有壞滅. Pūr(383b6): ñams par ṣes bya ba ni thal bar ḥgyur ro ṣes bya bar sbyar te/. Yaś(715, 21): vināśasya veti("iti" added here in the Tibetan version) prasaṃga iti vartate/ ātmana iti ca/.

Read *"vināśasya vā"*.

701 (Ejima:) pradeśasaṃyoga iti.

Cf. NS 3, 2, 25: jñānasamavetātmapradeśasaṃnikarṣān manasaḥ smṛtyutpatter na yugapad utpattiḥ //,

NBh(857, 8): jñānasādhanaḥ saṃskāro jñānam ity ucyate jñānasaṃskṛtair ātmapradeśaiḥ paryāyeṇa manaḥ saṃnikṛṣyate/ ātmamanaḥsaṃnikarṣāt smṛtayo 'pi paryāyeṇa bhavantīti//.

gal te yid daṅ phrad paḥi bye brag la ltos[702] paḥi phyir ro ṣe na/[703] ma yin te/ ḥbrel pa gṣan ma yin paḥi phyir ro// ḥbrel pa can dag yoṅs su chad paḥi phyir daṅ/ phrad pa ṣes bya baḥi mtshan ñid ni ma phrad pa sṅon du ḥgro ba can gyi phrad pa yin no ṣes rnam par bśad paḥi phyir bdag yoṅs su chad par thal bar ḥgyur ro//

deḥi phyir yid ḥphos[704] pa las[705] bdag ḥpho baḥam/ ñams par thal bar ḥgyur ro// gal te phyogs gcig phrad do ṣe na/ ma yin te/ phyogs de de ñid kyi yin pa ñid du mi ruṅ baḥi[706] phyir ro//

---

702 NP.ltos=bltos
703 CDP.omit /
704 CD.ḥphos=ḥphros
705 DP.las=la
706 D.ruṅ baḥi=duṅ paḥi

astu vā saṃyogas tathāpi nityam aviśiṣṭe[707] manasi kathaṃ saṃyogaviśeṣaḥ / buddhiviśeṣāpekṣa iti cet / sa eva paricodyate[708] /[709] kathaṃ buddhiviśeṣa iti / saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣād ātmamanaḥsaṃyogād iti[710] cet / cittād evāstu saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣāt[711] / na hi kiṃcid ātmana upalabhyate[712] sāmarthyam auṣadhakāryasiddhāv iva kuhakavaidyaphuḥsvāhānāṃ[713] /

saty ātmani tayoḥ saṃbhava[714] iti cet / vāṅmātram /

āśrayaḥ sa iti cet / yathā kaḥ kasyāśrayaḥ / na hi te citrabadarādivad[715] ādhārye nāpi sa kuḍyakuṇḍādivad ādhāro yuktaḥ pratighātiyutatvadoṣāt /[716]

---

707 (Ejima:) Pra: nityabhaviśiṣṭe. Ms: nityam a[ṣ]iśiṣṭe (*Lee: aviśiṣṭe).

Read *"nityam aviśiṣṭe"*.

708 (Ejima:) sa eva paricodyate.

Pradhan annotates "Y. evoparicodyate". In fact Yaś(715, 32), in the Wogihara's edition at least, reads "sa evopari codyate" and it should be corrected into "sa eva paricodyate" when compared with its Tibetan version(400b5). Cf. Pūr(384a1).

709 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

710 (Ejima:) saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣād ātmamanaḥsaṃyogād iti.

Cf. PBh(620, 17); PBh(633, 16): paṭupratyayāpekṣād ātmamanasoḥ saṃyogād āścarye 'rthe paṭuḥ saṃskārātiśayo jāyate/ yathā dākṣiṇātyasyoṣṭradarśanād iti/... .

711 (Ejima:) Pra: cittād evāstu saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣatvāt. Ms: *sic.*

T(106a7): ḥdu byed kyi khyad par la ltos(P: bltos) paḥi sems kho na las yin par zad kyi. Yaś(716, 9): cittād eva saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣād buddhiviśeṣo 'stu/, and Pūr(384a6) in the same sentence.

Read *"cittād evāstu saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣāt"*.

712 (Ejima:) Pra: ātmanaḥ upalabhyate. Read *"ātmana upalabhyate"* as in Ms(the last akṣara "te" in the margin).

713 (Ejima:) -phuḥ-. Ms: -[ph]uḥ. T,P(106a8): pu, D(93a2): phu. Zhēn(309b10): 部 (or 剖). Xuán(158a11): 普. Yaś(716, 16): -phūḥ-(Tibetan: phu). Pūr(384a8): phu.

714 (Ejima:) Pra: tayoḥ saṃyoga. Ms: tayo saṃyoga. T(106a8): de gñis srid do(=tayoḥ saṃbhavaḥ). Zhēn(309b10): 此二得成. Xuán(158a11): 此二...有. Yaś(716.18): tayoḥ saṃbhava, and Pūr(384b2). Read *"tayoḥ saṃbhava"* .

715 (Ejima:) Pra: -vadarādivad. Read *"-badarādivad"*.

716 (Ejima:) Pra: na...yuktaḥ/ pratighātiyutadoṣāt. Ms: na... yuktaḥ pratighāti-yutadoṣāt/. T(106b1): ...rigs pa ma yin te/ thogs pa daṅ tha dad pa ñid kyi ñes par ḥgyur baḥi phyir ro/. Zhēn(309b13): 非..., 由有相礙俱有二過失故. Xuán(158a13): 非...如是便有更相礙失, 及有或時別住失故. Yaś(716, 27) :...kiṃ kāraṇam ity āha/ pratighāti-yutatvadoṣād iti/ pratighātitvadoṣād yutatvadoṣāc ca/, and Pūr(384b6).

Read *"na...yuktaḥ pratighātiyutatvadoṣāt/"*.

Pradhan's note 15 is confusing. As for "yuta", cf. e.g. PBh(495, 22): nanv evam avayavāvayavinor yutasiddhidoṣaprasaṃgaḥ iti/ na/ yutasiddhyaparijñānāt... .

phrad pa yod du chug na yaṅ ḥon kyaṅ yid rtag tu khyad par med pa la ji ltar phrad pa khyad par du ḥgyur//[717]

gal te bloḥi khyad par la ltos[718] pa yin no ṣe na/ ji ltar bloḥi khyad par yin ṣes de ñid la klan ka tshol bar byed do//

gal te ḥdu byed kyi khyad par la ltos[719] paḥi bdag daṅ yid phrad pa las so ṣe na/ ḥdu byed kyi khyad par la ltos[720] paḥi sems kho na las yin par zad kyi bdag gi[721] nus pa ni cuṅ zad kyaṅ mi dmigs te/ sman gyi ḥbras bu grub pa la sman pa ṅan g-yo can gyis phu svā hā ṣes smras pa dag bṣin no//

gal te bdag yod na de gñis srid do ṣe na ni/ tshig tsam du zad do//

gal te de ni rten yin no ṣe na/ dper na gaṅ gi rten gaṅ yin pa lta bu de dag kyaṅ ri mo daṅ rgya śug[722] la sogs pa ltar brten pa ma yin la/ de yaṅ rtsig pa daṅ gṣoṅ bu la sogs pa ltar rten du rigs pa ma yin te/ thogs pa daṅ tha dad pa ñid kyi[723] ñes par ḥgyur baḥi phyir ro//

---

717 P.khyad par du ḥgyur//=khyad par ḥgyur ro//
718 NP.ltos=bltos
719 NP.ltos=bltos
720 NP.ltos=bltos
721 CD.gi=gis
722 NP.śug=śugs
723 CD.kyi=kyis

- naiva sa evamāśrayaḥ /

- kathaṃ tarhi[724] / yathā gandhādīnāṃ pṛthivīti cet / atiparitoṣitāḥ smaḥ / idam eva hi naḥ pratyāyakaṃ nāsty ātmeti / yathā na gandhādibhyo 'nyā pṛthivīti / ko hi sa gandhādibhyo 'nyāṃ pṛthivīṃ nirdhārayati / vyapadeśas tu pṛthivyā gandhādaya iti viśeṣaṇārtham / te hy eva tadākhyā gandhādayo yathā pratīyeran nānya iti / kāṣṭhapratimāyāḥ śarīravyapadeśavat /

saty api ca saṃskāraviśeṣāpekṣatve kasmān na yugapat sarvajñānotpattiḥ /

- yo hi baliṣṭhas tenānyeṣāṃ pratibandhaḥ /

- sa eva baliṣṭhaḥ kasmān nityaṃ na phalati / yo 'sya nyāyaḥ so 'stu bhāvanāyāḥ[725] / ātmā tu nirarthakaḥ kalpyate /

avaśyam ātmābhyupagantavyaḥ / smṛtyādīnāṃ guṇapadārthatvāt /[726] tasya cāvaśyaṃ[727] dravyāśritatvāt /[728] teṣāṃ cānyāśrayāyogād iti[729] cet / na / asiddheḥ[730] / na hy eṣāṃ guṇapadārthatvaṃ siddham / sarvam eva no vidyamānaṃ dravyam / "ṣaṭ dravyāṇi śrāmaṇyaphalānī"ti vacanāt /[731] nāpy eṣāṃ dravyāśritatvaṃ siddham / parīkṣito hy āśrayārthaḥ / tasmād yat kiṃcid eva tat /

---

724 (Ejima:) Pra: tarhiṃ. Read *"tarhi"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

725 (Ejima:) bhāvanāyāḥ.

"bhāvanā" is the second kind of "saṃskāra", cf. PBh(633,14).

726 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

727 (Ejima:) Pra: arthād avaśyaṃ. Ms: *sic.* T(106b6): gdon mi za bar.

Read *"avaśyaṃ"*.

728 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

729 (Ejima:) smṛtyādīnāṃ guṇapadārthatvāt... iti.

Cf. VS 1, 1, 6; 1, 1, 16: dravyāśrayy aguṇavān saṃyogavibhāgeṣv akāraṇam anapekṣa iti guṇalakṣaṇam //.

730 (Ejima:) Pra: na/. Ms: na/ asiddheḥ/.

T(106b6): ...ma yin te/ ma grub paḥi phyir ro/.

Read *"na/ asiddheḥ"* as in Ms.

731 (Ejima:) "ṣaḍ(read so) dravyāṇi śrāmaṇyaphalānī"ti. Unidentified.

gal te de ni de lta bur[732] rten ma yin no//

ḥo na ji lta bu ṣe na/ dper na dri la sogs paḥi sa lta buḥo ṣe na/ ḥdi ñid kho boḥi bdag med do ṣes bya ba yid ches par byed pa yin pas kho bo yoṅs su tshim par byas te/ dper na dri la sogs pa las sa gṣan ma yin pa bṣin no// dri la sogs pa las sa gṣan yin par ṅes par ḥdsin par byed pa de su ṣig yin/[733] saḥi dri la sogs pa ṣes bya baḥi tha sñad ni ci nas dri la sogs pa de dag ñid de ṣes byaḥi/[734] gṣan ni ma yin no ṣes bya bar śes par ḥgyur ba khyad par du bya baḥi phyir te/ śiṅ[735] gzugs kyi lus ṣes bya ba bṣin no//

ḥdu byed kyi khyad par la ltos[736] pa yin du zin kyaṅ ciḥi phyir śes pa thams cad dus gcig tu skye bar mi ḥgyur/

gaṅ ṣig stobs che ba des gṣan dag la gegs byed do//

stobs che ba de ñid ciḥi phyir rtag par ḥbras bu mi ḥbyin te/ ḥdiḥi tshul gaṅ yin pa de bsgos pa yin na bdag tu rtog pa ni don med pa yin no//

gal te bdag ni gdon mi za bar khas blaṅ bar bya ste/ dran pa la sogs pa ni yon tan gyi dṅos po yin paḥi phyir la de yaṅ gdon mi za bar rdsas la brten pa yin paḥi phyir ro// de dag gi rten gṣan yin par yaṅ mi ruṅ baḥi phyir ro ṣe na/[737] ma yin te/ ma grub paḥi phyir ro// ḥdi dag ni yon tan gyi dṅos po ñid yin par ma grub po// kho bo cag gi ltar na yod pa thams cad ni rdsas yin te/ dge sbyoṅ gi tshul gyi ḥbras bu ni rdsas drug go[738] ṣes ḥbyuṅ baḥi phyir ro// de dag rdsas la brten pa ñid du yaṅ ma grub ste/ rten gyi don ni brtags zin to// de lta bas na ḥdi ni gyi naḥo//

---

732 P.bur=bu
733 P./=//
734 P./=//
735 CD.śiṅ=śiṅ gi
736 NP.ltos=bltos
737 NP.omit /
738 NP.insert // after *go*

{%Skt 9-36}[Pra. 47604-47618]{%Chn}[Z. 309c6-26; X. 158b7-26]

- ātmany asati kimarthaḥ karmārambhaḥ /
- ahaṃ sukhī syām ahaṃ duḥkhī na syām ity evamarthaḥ /
- ko 'sāv ahaṃ nāma /[739]
- yadviṣayo 'yam ahaṃkāraḥ /
- kiṃviṣayo 'yam ahaṃkāraḥ /
- skandhaviṣayaḥ /[740]
- kathaṃ jñāyate /
- teṣu snehāt / gaurādibuddhibhiḥ sāmānādhikaraṇyāc ca[741] / gauro 'ham ahaṃ śyāmaḥ / sthūlo 'ham ahaṃ kṛśaḥ / jīrṇo 'ham ahaṃ yuveti / gaurādi-buddhibhiḥ samānādhikaraṇo[742] 'yam ahaṃkāro dṛśyate / na cātmana ete prakārā iṣyante[743] / tasmād api skandheṣv ayam iti gamyate /

ātmana upakārake 'pi śarīra ātmopacāro yathā ya evāyaṃ sa evāhaṃ sa evāyaṃ me bhṛtya iti /[744]

---

739 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

740 (Ejima:) Pra: skandhaviṣayaḥ/. Ms: *sic.*

T(107a1): bdag tu ḥdsin pa ḥdiḥi yul gaṅ ṣig yin/ yul ni phuṅ po yin no/. The first sentence here is apparently interrogatory, and differs from the preceding one "bdag tu ḥdsin pa ḥdiḥi yul gaṅ yin paḥo" i.e. "yadviṣayo 'yam ahaṃkāraḥ". As often happens the scribe of this Ms fails to copy a very similar sentence "kiṃviṣayo 'yam ahaṃkāraḥ". On the other hand, the Tibetan translators read "viṣayo skandhaḥ", but not "skandhaviṣayaḥ" which is, as a *bahuvrīhi* compound, predicated to "ahaṃkāraḥ". Zhēn(309c8): 我計執何法爲境界, 諸聚爲境界. Xuán(158b8): 何名我執境. 謂諸蘊相續.

Read therefore *"kiṃviṣayo 'yam ahaṃkāraḥ/ skandhaviṣayaḥ/"*.

741 (Ejima:) Pra: sāmānādhikaraṇyāt tu.

Read *"sāmānādhikaraṇyāc ca"* just as in Ms, the reading of which is supported by T(107a1), Zhēn(309c9) and Xuán(158b9) as well.

742 (Lee:) Pra: sāmānādhikaraṇo. Read *"samānādhikaraṇo"* as in Ms.

743 (Ejima:) Pra: na... dṛśyante. Ms: *sic.*

T(107a3): ...mi ḥdod de. Zhēn(309c11): 汝不許(or 計)... . Xuán(158b12): 非所計... .

Read *"na...iṣyante"*.

744 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

{%Tib 9-36}[C.95a6-95b7, D.93b1-7, N.107a3-107b4, P.106b7-107b1]

bdag med na ciḥi phyir las rtsom/

bdag bde bar gyur cig/ bdag sdug[745] bsñal bar ma gyur[746] cig ces bya ba deḥi phyir ro//

yaṅ bdag ces bya ba yaṅ gaṅ ṣig yin/

bdag tu ḥdsin pa ḥdiḥi yul gaṅ yin paḥo//

bdag tu ḥdsin pa ḥdiḥi yul gaṅ ṣig yin/

yul ni phuṅ po yin no//

ji ltar śes/[747]

de dag la chags paḥi phyir daṅ/ dkar śam la sogs paḥi blos gṣi mthun par byed paḥi phyir te/ bdag dkar śam mo// bdag sño bsaṅs so// bdag sbom mo// bdag ske ma mo// bdag rgas so// bdag dar la bab po ṣes dkar śam la sogs paḥi blos bdag tu ḥdsin pa ḥdi gṣi mthun par byed par snaṅ ño// rnam pa de dag bdag gi yin par ni mi ḥdod de/ de lta bas na ḥdi ni phuṅ po rnams la ḥdsin par śes so//

bdag la phan ḥdogs paḥi lus la yaṅ bdag ñe bar ḥdogs te/ dper na bdag gaṅ yin pa de ñid bdag gi bran ḥdi yin no ṣes bya ba bṣin no//[748]

---

745 C.sdug=stug

746 C.gyur=ḥgyur

747 C.omits /

748 CDNP.omit //, but inserted according to my opinion.

- bhavaty upakārake 'pi ātmopacāro na tv ahaṃkāraḥ / sati śarīrālambanatve paraśarīrālambano 'pi kasmān na bhavati /
- asaṃbandhāt / yenaiva hi sahāsya saṃbandhaḥ kāyena cittena vā tatraivāyam ahaṃkāra utpadyate nānyatra / anādau saṃsāra evam abhyāsāt /
- kaś ca saṃbandhaḥ /
- kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ[749] /

- yady ātmā nāsti kasyāyam ahaṃkāraḥ /
- idaṃ punas tad evāyātam / kimarthaiṣā ṣaṣṭhīti / yāvad ya evāsya hetus tasyaivāyam iti /
- kaś cāsya hetuḥ /[750]
- pūrvāhaṃkāraparibhāvitaṃ svasaṃtativiṣayaṃ sāvadyacittaṃ[751] /

- asaty ātmani ka eṣa sukhito duḥkhito vā /
- yasminn āśraye sukham utpannaṃ duḥkhaṃ vā / yathā puṣpito vṛkṣaḥ phalitaṃ vanam iti /
- kaḥ punar anayor āśrayaḥ /
- ṣaḍāyatanam / yathā kṛtvā tathoktam /[752]

---

749 (Ejima:) kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ. T(107a6): rgyu daṅ ḥbras buḥi dṅos poḥi ḥbras bu yin no(D: *sic*)? Zhēn(309c19): 謂因果道理. Xuán(158b19): 謂因起(or 果)性(*Lee: 謂因果性 in Koryo 677c21).

750 (Ejima:) Pra: kaś cānyo hetuḥ/. Ms: *sic*. T(107a7): ḥdiḥi rgyu gaṅ ṣig yin ṣe na/. Zhēn(309c22): 若爾何法爲計執因. Xuán(158b21): 若爾我執以何爲因.

Read *"kaś cāsya hetuḥ/"*.

751 (Ejima:) Pra: sāvadyaṃ cittam. Ms: savidyacittaṃ.

T(107a7): ma rig pa daṅ bcas paḥi sems(=sāvidyacittam). Zhēn(309c23): 有垢穢心. Xuán(156b23): 有垢染心. The Chinese read "sa-avadya-cittam", but surely not "sa-avidya-cittam", for "avidyā", a member of the latter compound, is usually rendered with "無明" by them.

Read *"sāvadyacittam"*.

752 (Lee:) Cf. Yaś(718, 18) cites "tadvikāravikāritvād āśrayaś cakṣurādayaḥ" (AK 1-45ab).

phan ḥdogs pa la bdag ñe bar ḥdogs pa yin yaṅ bdag tu ḥdsin pa ni ma yin no// lus la dmigs pa yin na ciḥi phyir pha rol gyi lus la dmigs pa yaṅ ma yin/

ḥbrel pa med paḥi phyir te/ ḥdi ni lus sam sems gaṅ daṅ lhan cig ḥbrel pa de kho na la bdag tu ḥdsin pa ḥdi ḥbyuṅ gi gṣan la ni ma yin te/ ḥkhor ba thog ma med pa nas de ltar goms paḥi phyir ro//

ḥbrel pa yaṅ gaṅ ṣig yin/

rgyu daṅ ḥbras buḥi dṅos poḥi ḥbras bu yin no//

gal te bdag med[753] na bdag tu ḥdsin pa ni suḥi yin/

ḥdi ni drug pa ḥdiḥi don ji lta bu yin ṣes bya ba nas de[754] ni dran paḥi rgyu gaṅ yin pa de kho naḥi[755] yin no[756] ṣes bya baḥi bar de ñid ḥoṅs pa yin no//

ḥdiḥi rgyu gaṅ ṣig yin ṣe na/

sṅon bdag tu ḥdsin pas yoṅs su bsgos pa[757] raṅ gi rgyud kyi yul can ma rig pa daṅ bcas paḥi sems yin no//

bdag med na bde baḥam sdug bsṅal ba su ṣig yin/

rten gaṅ la[758] bde baḥam sdug bsṅal ba ḥbyuṅ ba ste/ dper na śiṅ ljon pa me tog chags so// nags tshal ḥbras bu chags so[759] ṣes bya ba lta buḥo//

ḥdi gñis kyi rten gaṅ ṣe na/

skye mched drug yin te/ ji ltar yin pa de ltar[760] ni bśad zin to//

---

753 CD.med=med pa
754 C.de=da
755 CD.naḥi=na
756 NP.insert // after *yin no*
757 DP.pa=ba
758 CD.omit *la*
759 N.inserts // after *so*
760 NP.omit *yin pa de ltar*

{%Skt 9-37}[Pra. 47619-47706]{%Chn}[Z. 309c26-310a20; X. 158b26-158c20]

- asaty ātmani ka eṣāṃ karmaṇāṃ kartā kaś ca phalānāṃ bhoktā bhavati /
- karteti bhokteti vā ka eṣa vākyārthaḥ[761] /
- karotīti kartā / bhuṅkta iti bhoktā /
- paryāya ucyate nārthaḥ /
- svatantraḥ karteti[762] kartṛlakṣaṇam ācakṣate lākṣaṇikāḥ / asti punaḥ kva cid eva kārye kasya cit svātantryaṃ loke dṛṣṭaṃ yathā devadattasya snānādana-gamanādau[763] /
- kaṃ[764] punar bhavān devadattam udāharati / yady ātmānaṃ sa eva sādhyaḥ / atha pañcaskandhakaṃ sa eva kartā /

---

761 (Ejima:) Pra: karteti ka eṣa vāhyarthaḥ/.

Ms: kartteti ka e.a vākyārthaḥ/.(*Lee: kartteti ka e.. vāhyārthaḥ /)

T(107b1): byed pa po ṣes bya baḥam/ za ba po ṣes bya baḥi tshig gi don ji lta bu(/). Zhēn(309c27): 造作及受用, 此言有何義. Xuán(158b27): 作受何義.

Read *"karteti bhokteti vā ka eṣa vākyārthaḥ/"*.

762 (Ejima:) "svatantraḥ karte"ti. Cf. Pāṇini 1, 4, 54.

763 (Lee:) svātantryam / loke dṛṣṭaṃ devadattasya snānāsanagamanādau.

Ms: svātantryaṃ loke dṛṣṭaṃ devadattasya snānāsanagamanādau.

T(107b2-3): ḥjig rten na ḥbras bu(P.bu=bu bu) ḥgaḥ la yaṅ la la ṣig raṅ dbaṅ yod pa lta bu mthoṅ ṅam mthoṅ ste khrus daṅ za ba daṅ ḥgro ba la sogs pa la lhas byin lta buḥo/. Zhēn(310a1-2): 見世間有人於餘事中有自在能, 譬如天與於住食行等事中. Xuán(158b29-158c2): 現見世間, 於此事業若得自在名爲能作, 如見天授於浴食行得自在故名浴等者.

Read *"svātantryaṃ loke dṛṣṭaṃ yathā devadattasya snānādanagamanādau"*.

764 (Ejima:) Pra: kaḥ. Ms: *sic*. Read *"kaṃ"* for here is needed an accusative.

{%Tib 9-37}[C.95b7-96a7, D.93b7-94a6, N.107b4-108a5, P.107b1-108a2]

bdag med na las rnams[765] kyi byed pa po ni gaṅ yin/ ḥbras bu rnams kyi[766] za ba po gaṅ yin/

byed pa po ṣes bya baḥam/ za ba po ṣes bya baḥi tshig gi don ji lta bu/[767]

byed pas na[768] byed pa po yin la/ za bas na za ba po yin no//

rnam graṅs smras su zin[769] gyi[770] don ni ma yin no//

mtshan ñid pa[771] rnams ni byed pa poḥi mtshan ñid raṅ dbaṅ can ni byed pa po yin[772] no ṣes zer na/ ḥjig rten na ḥbras bu[773] ḥgaḥ la yaṅ la la ṣig raṅ dbaṅ yod pa lta bu mthoṅ ṅam[774] mthoṅ ste khrus daṅ za ba daṅ ḥgro ba la sogs pa la lhas byin lta buḥo//

khyod lhas byin gaṅ ṣig dper brjod/ gal te bdag yin no ṣe na ni de ñid bsgrub par bya ba yin no// ḥon te phuṅ po lṅa[775] yin no ṣe na ni de ñid byed pa po yin te/

---

765 NP.omit *rnams*
766 P.kyi=kya
767 CDNP.omit /, but inserted according to my opinion.
768 NP.omit *byed pas na*
769 NP.zin=zad
770 NP.gyi=kyi
771 CD.omit *pa*
772 C.yin=min
773 P.bu=bu bu
774 CD.insert / after *ṅam*
775 NP.omit *lṅa*

trividhaṃ cedaṃ karma kāyavāṅmanaskarma / tatra kāyakarmaṇi tāvat kāyasya cittaparatantrā vṛttiḥ / cittasyāpi kāye svakāraṇaparatantrā vṛttis tasyāpy evam iti[776] nāsti kasya cit api svātantryaṃ[777] / pratyayaparatantrā hi sarve bhāvāḥ pravartante /

ātmano 'pi ca nirapekṣasyākāraṇatvābhyupagamān na svātantryaṃ sidhyati / tasmān naivaṃlakṣaṇa upalabhyate kaś cit kartā /

yat tu yasya pradhānaṃ kāraṇaṃ tat tasya kartety ucyate / na ca ātmanaḥ kva cid api kāraṇatvaṃ dṛśyate / tasmāt sa evam api na kartā yujyate / smṛtijo hi cchandaś chandajo[778] vitarko vitarkāt prayatnaḥ prayatnād vāyus tataḥ karmeti kim atrātmā kurute /

phalasyāpi ca ka upabhogo yam ayam ātmā kurvann upabhoktā kalpyate / upalabdhir iti cet / nātmana[779] upalabdhau sāmarthyaṃ vijñāne pratiṣedhāt /
- asaty ātmani kasmād asattvādhiṣṭhānaḥ pāpapuṇyopacayo na bhavati /
- vedanādyanāśrayatvāt / tadāśrayaś ca ṣaḍāyatanaṃ nātmā /[780] yathā tathoktam /[781]

---

776 (Ejima:) tatra kāyakarmaṇi tāvat kāyasya cittaparatantrā vṛttiḥ/ cittasyāpi kāye svakāraṇaparatantrā vṛttis tasyāpy evam iti.

The most similar translation is the one by Zhēn(310a5) as follows: 此中於身業者, 是身爲作事必繫屬心, 是心事於身亦繫屬自因緣, 心於自事亦爾(=cittasyāpi svasmin evaṃ vṛttiḥ). 是故... . Xuán(158c4): 且起身業必依身心. 身心各依自因緣轉. 因緣展轉依自因緣. Though not always verbatim traslated, it would be reconstructed as follows: tatra kāyakarmaṇi tāvat kāyacittaparatantrā vṛttiḥ/ kāyacittasyāpi svakāraṇaparatantrā vṛttiḥ/ svakāraṇasyāpi svakāraṇaparatantrā vṛttiḥ/ iti.

In the manuscript utilized by the Tibetan translators the "vāk-karman" had been anew incorporated in the context. T(107b4): de la re şig lus dań ṅag ni("lus dań ṅag dag ni" left out in D) lus dań ṅag gi las la sems kyi gşan gyi dbań gis ḥjug go/ sems kyań lus dań ṅag la rań gi rgyuḥi gşan gyi dbań gis ḥjug go/ de yań de dań ḥdra bas(=tatra kāyavākkarmaṇi tāvat kāyavācoḥ cittaparatantrā vṛttiḥ/ cittasyāpi kāyavācoḥ svakāraṇaparatantrā vṛtti/ tasyāpy evam iti). The incorporation of the "vāk-karman" reflects itself in Pūr(387a3), but possibly not in Yaś(718, 22).

777 (Lee:) Pra: nāsti kasya cit svātantryaṃ. Ms: *sic.*

T(107b5): ... gań la yań rań dbań med de/. Yaś(718, 25): nāsti kasya cit api svātantryaṃ. Read *"nāsti kasya cit api svātantryaṃ"*.

778 (Lee:) Pra: cchandaḥ cchandajo. Ms: *sic.* Read *"cchandaś chandajo"*.

779 (Ejima:) Pra: nātmanaḥ. Read *"nātmana"* as in Ms.

780 (Lee:) Insert daṇḍa as in Ms.

781 (Lee:) Cf. Yaś(719, 14-15) cites "tadvikāravikāritvād āśrayaś cakşurādayaḥ"(AK 1-45ab).

las ḥdi ni rnam pa gsum ste/ lus daṅ ṅag daṅ yid kyi las so// de la re ṣig[782] lus daṅ ṅag gi las la sems kyi gṣan gyi dbaṅ gis ḥjug go// sems kyaṅ lus daṅ ṅag la raṅ gi rgyuḥi gṣan gyi dbaṅ gis ḥjug go// de yaṅ de daṅ ḥdra bas gaṅ la yaṅ raṅ dbaṅ med de/ dṅos po thams cad ni rkyen gyi gṣan gyi dbaṅ gis ḥjug go//

bdag kyaṅ ltos pa med par rgyu ñid du khas mi len paḥi phyir ro// raṅ dbaṅ can du mi ḥgrub po// de lta bas na de lta buḥi mtshan ñid kyi byed pa po ni ḥgaḥ yaṅ mi dmigs so//

gaṅ ṣig gaṅ gi rgyuḥi gtso bo yin pa de ni deḥi byed pa po ṣes bya na bdag ni gaṅ la yaṅ rgyu yin par mi snaṅ ste/ de lta bas na de ni de lta bur yaṅ byed pa por mi ruṅ ṅo// dran pa las ni ḥdun pa skyeḥo// ḥdun pa las ni rtog pa skyeḥo// rnam par rtog pa las ni rab tu ḥbad paḥo// rab tu ḥbad pa[783] las ni rluṅ ṅo// de las ni las ḥbyuṅ na ḥdi la bdag ci ṣig byed/[784]

ḥbras bu la yaṅ gaṅ la bdag med na za[785] ba por brtags[786] paḥi ñe bar spyod pa de gaṅ ṣig yin/ gal te dmigs pa yin no ṣe na/ dmigs pa la bdag gi nus pa med de/ rnam par śes pa la nus pa bkag paḥi phyir ro//

bdag med na ciḥi phyir sems can gyi rten ma yin pa la yaṅ sdig pa daṅ bsod nams ñe bar stsogs[787] par mi ḥgyur/

tshor baḥi rten ma yin paḥi phyir te/ deḥi rten ni skye mched drug yin gyi bdag ma yin no// ji ltar yin pa de ltar ni bśad zin to//

---

782 NP.insert *'lus daṅ ṅag ni'* after *re śig.*
783 D.pa=ba
784 NP.omit /
785 D.za=ba
786 NP.brtags=rtag
787 NP.stsogs=sogs

{%Skt 9-38}[Pra. 47707-47727]{%Chn}[Z. 310a20-310b19; X. 158c20-159a18]

- katham asaty ātmani vinaṣṭāt karmaṇa āyatyāṃ phalotpattiḥ /
- ātmany api sati kathaṃ vinaṣṭāt karmaṇa āyatyāṃ phalotpattiḥ /
- tadāśritād dharmādharmāt /
- yathā kaḥ kimāśrita ity uktottaraiṣā vācoyuktiḥ[788] / tasmād anāśritād eva dharmādharmāt bhavatu / naiva tu vayaṃ vinaṣṭāt karmaṇa āyatyāṃ phalotpattiṃ brūmaḥ /
- kathaṃ tarhi[789] /
- tatsaṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣād bījaphalavat[790] / yathā bījāt phalam utpadyata ity ucyate / na ca tad vinaṣṭād bījād[791] utpadyate / nāpy anantaram eva /
- kiṃ tarhi /
- tatsaṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣād aṅkurakāṇḍapatrādikramaniṣpannāt puṣpāvasānāt /

---

788 (Ejima:) Pra: vāco yuktiḥ. Read *"vācoyuktiḥ"*.

789 (Ejima:) Pra: kiṃ tarhi. Ms: kirn tarhi.

(Lee:) Pra: kiṃ tarhi. T(108a4): /ḥo na ji(P.ḥo na ji=ḥon te) lta bu ṣe na/. Yaś(719, 18-19): kathaṃ tarhīti vistaraḥ. Zhēn(310a25): 若爾云何. Xuán(158c24): 若爾從何. Read *"kathaṃ tarhi"* according to Tib, Chn1.

790 (Ejima:) Pra: vīja-. Read *"bīja"* hereafter also.

In our Ms, the akṣara "b" is desperately difficult to discriminate from "v", and further the repeated appearances of the ligature "nva" for the authentic "mba" show an inclination of the Ms to regard "b" as "v".

791 (Ejima:) vinaṣṭād bījād.

"bījād" omitted in T(108a4), not in Zhēn(310a27: 從已謝滅種子) and Xuán(158c26: 隨已壞種, *Lee: 從已壞種 in Koryo 678a20).

{%Tib 9-38}[C.96a7-97a3, D.94a6-94b7, N.108a5-109a1, P.108a2-108b5]

bdag med[792] na[793] ji ltar na las ṣig[794] zin pa las tshe phyi ma la[795] ḥbras bu ḥbyuṅ/

bdag[796] yod na yaṅ ji ltar na las ṣig zin pa las tshe phyi ma la ḥbras bu ḥbyuṅ//

de la brten paḥi chos daṅ chos ma yin pa las ḥbyuṅ ṅo//

tshig gi lugs ḥdi ni dper na gaṅ gi rten[797] gaṅ yin pa lta bu ṣes lan btab zin to// de lta bas na chos daṅ chos ma yin pa[798] brten[799] med pa kho na las ḥbyuṅ ṅo//[800] kho bo cag kyaṅ las ṣig[801] zin pa las[802] tshe phyi ma la ḥbras bu ḥbyuṅ bar mi smraḥo//

ḥo na ji[803] lta bu ṣe na//[804]

deḥi rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi khyad par las te/ sa bon daṅ ḥbras bu bṣin no// dper na sa bon las ḥbras bu ḥbyuṅ ba ṣes bya ba de ni ṣig pa las ḥbyuṅ ba yaṅ ma yin la mjug thogs su[805] kho nar ḥbyuṅ ba yaṅ ma yin no//

ḥo na ci ṣe na/

rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi khyad par las te/[806] myu gu daṅ sdoṅ bu daṅ/ ḥdab ma la sogs pa me tog la thug pa rim pa rdsogs pa las ḥbyuṅ ba bṣin no//

---

792 NP.omit *med*
793 N.na=ni
794 NP.ṣig=śig
795 NP.la=las
796 NP.ḥbyuṅ/ bdag=ḥbyuṅ ba dag
797 C.rten=brten
798 CD.omit *pa*
799 NP.brten=rten
800 N.//=/
801 NP.ṣig=śig
802 CD.las=la
803 P.ḥo na ji=ḥon te
804 NP.omit //
805 CDN.omit *su*
806 NP.omit /

- tat punaḥ puṣpān niṣpannaṃ kasmāt tasya bījasya phalam ity ucyate /
- tadāhitaṃ hi tat paraṃparayā puṣpe sāmarthyam /[807] yadi hi tatpūrvakaṃ nābhaviṣyat[808] / tat tādṛśasya phalasyotopattau na samartham abhaviṣyat / evaṃ karmaṇaḥ phalam utpadyata ity ucyate / na ca tadvinaṣṭāt karmaṇa utpadyate nāpy anantaram eva /
- kathaṃ tarhi[809] /
- tatsaṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣāt[810] /
- kā punaḥ saṃtatiḥ kaḥ pariṇāmaḥ ko viśeṣaḥ /
- yaḥ karmapūrva uttarottaracittaprasavaḥ[811] sā saṃtatis tasyā anyathānya-thotpattiḥ[812] pariṇāmaḥ / sa punar yo 'nantaraṃ[813] phalotpādanasamarthaḥ so 'nyapariṇāmaviśiṣṭatvāt[814] pariṇamaviśeṣaḥ / tadyathā sopādānaṃ maraṇa-cittaṃ punarbhavasya /

---

807 (Ejima:) Pra: tadāhitaṃ hi tat parayāpuṣpe sāmarthyam /. Ms: *sic*.

T(108a6): des brgyud pas me tog la deḥi nus pa bskyed pas so/. Zhēn(310b1): 由轉轉於花中生果功能, 是種子所作故. Xuán(158c29): 由種展轉引起花中生果功能故.

Read *"tadāhitaṃ hi tat paraṃparayā puṣpe sāmarthyam /"*.

808 (Ejima:) Pra: yadi hi tatpūrvikān nabhaviṣyat /.

Ms: yadi hi tatpūrvikān nābhaviṣyat /. T(108a6): gal te de sṅon du ḥgro bar ma gyur na(D: gal te sa bon de sṅon du ḥgro bar ma gyur na). Zhēn(310b2): 若不以種子功能爲先 Xuán(159a1): 若此花內生果功能非種爲先所引起者.

Read *"yadi hi tatpūrvakaṃ nābhaviṣyat /"*.

809 (Lee:) Pra: kiṃ tarhi. Ms: kin tarhi.

T(108a7): ḥo na ji lta bu ṣe na/. Zhēn(310b5): 若爾云何.

Read *"kathaṃ tarhi"* according to Tib, Chn1.

810 (Ejima:) tatsaṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣāt. Ms: *sic*.

T(108a7): rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi khyad par las so(=saṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣāt). Zhēn(310b5): 從業相續轉異勝類果生. Xuán(159a4): 但從業相續轉變差別生.

811 (Ejima:) Pra: -pravasaḥ. Read *"-prasavaḥ"* as in Ms and in the first edition.

812 (Ejima:) Pra: anyathotpattiḥ. Ms: *sic*.

T(108a8): gṣan daṅ gṣan du skye ba. Zhēn(310b8): 後後異前. Xuán(159a7): 後後刹那異前前生.

Read *"anyathānyathotpattiḥ"*.

813 (Ejima:) Pra: 'ntaraṃ. Ms: nantaraṃ.

Read *" 'nantaraṃ"* as in the first edition.

814 (Ejima:) Pra: 'ntapariṇāmaviśiṣṭatvāt. Ms: ntya-.

T(108b1): yoṅs su ḥgyur ba gṣan las khyad par du ḥphags paḥi phyir. Zhēn(310b9): 於餘轉異最勝故. Xuán(159a8): 勝餘轉變故.

Read *" 'nyapariṇāmaviśiṣṭatvāt"*.

de ni me tog las grub pa yin na ciḥi phyir sa bon deḥi ḥbras bu ṣes bya ṣe na/

des brgyud pas me tog la deḥi nus pa bskyed pas so// gal te de[815] sṅon du ḥgro bar ma gyur na ḥbras bu de ḥdra ba skyed[816] pa la deḥi nus pa yod par mi ḥgyur ro// de bṣin du las las ḥbras bu ḥbyuṅ ṅo[817] ṣes bya ba de yaṅ las[818] ṣig pa las kyaṅ mi ḥbyuṅ la/[819] mjug thogs su yaṅ ma yin no//

ḥo na ji lta bu ṣe na/

rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi khyad par las so/

rgyud ni ci yin/ yoṅs su ḥgyur ba ni ci yin/ khyad par ni ci yin ṣe na/

las sṅon du ḥgro baḥi sems phyir ṣiṅ ḥbyuṅ ba gaṅ yin pa de ni rgyud yin no// de gṣan daṅ gṣan du skye ba ni yoṅs su ḥgyur ba yin no// deḥi[820] mjug thogs su ḥbras bu skyed nus pa gaṅ yin pa de ni yoṅs su ḥgyur ba gṣan las khyad par du ḥphags paḥi phyir yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi khyad par yin te/ dper na[821] yaṅ srid paḥi ñe bar len pa daṅ[822] bcas paḥi ḥchi baḥi sems lta buḥo//

---

815 CD.de=sa bon de
816 NP.skyed=bskyed
817 NP.omit *ṅo*; CD.insert // after *ṅo*
818 NP.yaṅ las=las yaṅ
819 NP.omit /; C./=//
820 NP.deḥi=de
821 NP.dper na=de dper na
822 NP.insert / after *daṅ*

vividhakarmapūrvakatve 'pi[823] yat karma guru vā bhavaty āsannam abhyastaṃ vā tatkṛtaṃ[824] sāmarthyaṃ dyotyate na tv anyasya / yathoktam[825] /

"yad guru yac cāsannaṃ yac cābhyastaṃ pūrvakṛtaṃ ca tasya /[826]
pūrvaṃ pūrvaṃ pūrvaṃ vipacyate karmasaṃsāre //"[827]

tatra vipākahetvāhitaṃ tu vipākaphaladānasāmarthyaṃ vipākaṃ dattvā vinivartate /

sabhāgahetvāhitaṃ tu niṣyandaphaladānasāmarthyaṃ kliṣṭānāṃ pratipakṣodayād vinivartate / akliṣṭānāṃ cittasaṃtānātyantavinivṛtter yadā parinirvāti /

---

823 (Ejima:) Pra: trividhakarmapūrvakatve 'pi. Ms: *sic.*

T(108b1): las rnam pa sna tshogs pa(=vividha-) sṅon du ḥgro ba ñid yin yaṅ. Zhēn(310b11): 雖以種種業爲先. Xuán(159a9): 雖帶衆多感後有業所引熏習.

Read *"vividhakarmapūrvakatve 'pi"*.

824 (Ejima:) Pra: yatkṛtaṃ. Ms: ta-kṛe-tam (*Lee: tākṛtaṃ).

Read *"tatkṛtaṃ"* as in the first edition.

825 (Lee:) Pra: āha ca. Ms: *sic.*

T(108b2-3): ji skad du/...../ses bśad pa lta buḥo/. Yaś(719, 20): yathoktam iti sthavira-Rāhulena. Zhēn(310b12): 如偈言. Xuán(159a11): 如有頌言.

Read *"yathoktam"*.

826 (Lee:) Pra: yat guru yac vāsannaṃ yac vābhyastaṃ kṛtaṃ ca yat /.

Ms: yat guru yac cāsannaṃ yac cābhyastaṃ kṛtaṃ ca yat /.

T(108b2-3): las kyi ḥkhor ba lci gaṅ daṅ// ñe ba gaṅ(D.gaṅ=gāṅ) daṅ goms pa gaṅ// sṅon byas gaṅ yin de las ni//. Cf. Yaś(719, 21-27): yad guru yac cāsannaṃ iti vistaraḥ. ekasmin saṃtāne catvāri karmāṇi. guru āsannam abhyastaṃ pūrvakṛtaṃ ca. eṣāṃ caturṇāṃ ... . Zhēn(310b11-12): 若重近數習 及昔作諸業 先先先後熟 於輪轉有續. Xuán(159a12-13): 業極重近起 數習先所作 前前前後熟 輪轉於生死.

Read *"yad guru yac cāsannaṃ yac cābhyastaṃ pūrvakṛtaṃ ca tasya /"*.

827 (Ejima:) "yat guru...karmasaṃsāre//".

This verse is attributed by Pŭ-guāng(Taisho 41, 451b23) and Yuán-huĭ(Taisho 41, 981a29) to the Sautrāntikas, and by Pūr(388a2) and Yaś(719, 20) to Rāhula.

las rnam pa sna tshogs pa sṅon du ḥgro ba ñid yin yaṅ las gaṅ lci baḥam/ ñe baḥam/ goms pa yin pa des byas paḥi nus pa[828] bsal[829] bar byed kyi gṣan gyis ni ma yin te/ ji skad du//

las kyi ḥkhor ba lci gaṅ daṅ//
ñe ba gaṅ daṅ goms pa gaṅ[830]//
sṅon byas gaṅ yin de las ni//
sṅa ma sṅa ma rnam smin ḥgyur//[831]

ṣes bśad pa lta buḥo// de la rnam par smin paḥi rgyus bskyed pa rnam par smin paḥi ḥbras bu bskyed paḥi nus pa ni rnam par smin pa bskyed[832] nas ldog go//

skal pa[833] mñam paḥi rgyus bskyed pa rgyu[834] mthun paḥi ḥbras bu bskyed paḥi nus pa ni ñon moṅs pa can rnams kyi ni gñen po skyes nas ldog go// ñon moṅs pa can ma yin pa rnams kyi ni sems kyi rgyun gtan du log pa ste/ gaṅ gi tshe yoṅs su mya ṅan las ḥdas pa naḥo//

---

828 NP.pa=pas
829 CDNP.bsal=*sic.* It is the better reading to read *'gsal'* instead of *bsal.*
830 NP.gaṅ=daṅ
831 NP.omit //
832 P.bskyed=skyed
833 N.skal pa=skal ba
834 NP.omit *bskyed pa rgyu*

{%Skt 9-39}[Pra. 47801-47813]{%Chn}[Z. 310b19-310c9; X. 159a18-159b8]

- atha kasmād vipākād vipākāntaraṃ notpadyate / bījaphalād iva phalāntaram /[835]

- na tāvat dṛṣṭāntena sarvaṃ samānaṃ bhavati / tatrāpi tu na phalād eva punaḥ phalāntaram utpadyate /

- kiṃ tarhi /

- viklittiviśeṣajād vikāraviśeṣāt / yo hi tatra bhūtaprakārāṅkuraṃ nirvartayati[836] / sa tasya bījaṃ nānyaḥ / bhāvinyā tu saṃjñayā sādṛśyād vā pūrvako 'pi saṃtāno bījam ity ākhyāyate /

evam ihāpi tasmād vipākād yadi sadasaddharmaśravaṇādipratyayaviśeṣajaḥ kuśalasāsravo 'kuśalo vā cittavikāra utpadyate / tasmāt punar vipākāntaram[837] utpadyate nānyatheti samānam etat /

---

835 (Ejima:) bījaphalād iva phalāntaram /. Ms: *sic.*

T(108b5): sa bon gyi ḥbras bu bṣin du(=bījaphalavat?). Zhēn(310b19): 譬如從種子果更生種子果. Xuán(159a19): 如從種果有別果生(=bījaphalād iva phalāntaram).

836 (Ejima:) Pra: nirvartayati. Ms: nivarttayati. Read *"nivartayati"*.

(Lee:) Pra: nirvartayati. T(108b6): ḥgrub par byed pa yod pa. Yaś(719, 31): nivartayati=*sic.* Zhēn(310b23): 能生. Xuán(159a22): 能引生.

Read *"nirvartayati"* according to Tib, Chn1 and Chn2 as in Pra.

837 (Ejima:) Pra: vikārāntaram. Ms: vvipākāntaram.

T(108b8): rnam par smin pa gṣan. Read *"vipākāntaram"*.

{%Tib 9-39}[C.97a3-97b1, D.94b7-95a5, N.109a1-7, P.108b5-109a4]

yaṅ ciḥi phyir sa bon gyi ḥbras bu bṣin du rnam par smin pa las[838] rnam par smin pa gṣan mi skye na[839]/

re ṣig thams cad dpe daṅ ḥdra ba ni ma yin no// de la yaṅ ḥbras bu kho na las ḥbras bu gṣan skye ba ma yin no//[840]

ḥo na ci ṣe na/

rnam par ḥdrul baḥi khyad par las skyes pa rnam par ḥgyur baḥi khyad par las skye ste/ de la ḥbyuṅ baḥi rnam pa myu gu ḥgrub par byed pa yod pa gaṅ yin pa de ni deḥi sa bon yin gyi gṣan ni ma yin no// ḥgyur baḥi miṅ gis sam[841] ḥdra baḥi phyir rgyun sṅa ma yaṅ sa bon ṣes byaḥo//

de bṣin du ḥdi la yaṅ rnam par smin pa de las gal te dam pa daṅ dam pa ma yin paḥi chos ñan pa la sogs paḥi rkyen las skyes pa dge ba zag pa daṅ bcas paḥam/ mi dge[842] baḥi sems kyi ḥgyur ba skye na de las ni rnam par smin pa gṣan skyeḥi[843] gṣan du ni ma yin pas ḥdi ni mtshuṅs so/

---

838 CD.omit *rnam par smin pa las*
839 NP.na=ṣe na
840 NP.omit //
841 CD.insert / after *sam*
842 NP.dge=skye
843 NP.insert *skye na* before *skyeḥi*

atha vā punar etad evaṃ vijñātavyam / yathā lākṣārasarañjitāt mātuluṅga-puṣpāt saṃtatipariṇāmaviśeṣajaḥ phale raktaḥ keśara upajāyate / na ca tasmāt punar anyaḥ / evaṃ karmajād vipākāt na punar vipākāntaram iti /

yathāsthūlam idam asmadbuddhigamyaṃ darśitam / nānāvidhaśaktibhinnais tu karmabhir adhivāsitāḥ saṃtataya etām avasthāṃ gatā īdṛśaṃ phalam abhinirvartayantīti[844] buddhānām eva viṣayaḥ[845] / āha khalv api /[846]

"karma tadbhāvanāṃ tasyā vṛttilābhaṃ tataḥ phalam /
niyamena prajānāti buddhād anyio na sarvathā //"[847]

---

844 (Ejima:) Pra: abhinivartayantīti. Ms: *sic.* Read *"abhinirvartayantīti"*.

845 (Ejima:) buddhānām eva viṣayaḥ. Ms: buddhānām eṣa(*Lee: eva) viṣayaḥ T(109a3): saṅs rgyas rnams kho naḥi yul yin no.

846 (Lee:) Pra: āha khalv api. Ms: āha khalv api //.

Read *"āha khalv api /"* inserting daṇḍa.

847 (Ejima:) "karma tadbhāvanāṃ...na sarvathā//".

This śloka is attributed by Yuán-huī(Taiso 41, 981b8) to the Sautrāntikas, and by Pǔ-guāng(Taisho 41, 451c26) and Fǎ-bǎo(Taisho 41, 812b10) to the Śāstrakāra i.e. Vasubandhu. Pūr(388b8) and Yaś(720, 26) say nothing about its composer, which means presumably that they regard it as the author's own. Here should be noticed the fact that Zhēn(310c8) retains one more verse(apparently a śloka).

yaṅ na de ni ḥdi ltar śes par bya ste/ ji ltar ma du luṅ gaḥi me tog rgya skyegs kyi[848] khu bas kha dog bsgyur ba las ḥbras buḥi naṅ du rgyud yoṅs su ḥgyur baḥi khyad par las skyes pa ge sar dmar po skye bar ḥgyur ṣiṅ de las ni gṣan[849] mi skye ba de[850] bṣin du las las skyes paḥi rnam par smin pa las yaṅ rnam par smin pa gṣan mi skyeḥo//

che loṅ tsam ḥdi ni bdag gi blos rtogs par bya ba rab tu bstan pa yin te/ mthu rnam pa sna tshogs pas tha dad paḥi las rnams kyis bsgos paḥi rgyud[851] rnams gnas skabs ḥdir phyin na ḥbras bu ḥdi lta bu mṅon par ḥgrub par ḥgyur ro ṣes bya ba ni[852] saṅs rgyas rnams kho naḥi yul yin no// yaṅ smras pa//[853]

las daṅ deḥi bsgos deḥi ḥjug rñed//[854]
de las ḥbras bu saṅs rgyas las//[855]
gṣan gyi rnam pa thams cad ni//[856]
ṅes par rab tu mi śes so//

---

848 P.kyi=kya
849 NP.gṣan=de gṣan
850 C.de=da
851 CDNP.rgyud=rgyu, but amended according to my opinion.
852 NP.insert / after *ni*
853 DNP.//=/
854 NP.omit //
855 NP.//=/
856 NP.omit //

{%Skt 9-40}[Pra. 47814-47904]{%Chn}[Z. 310c10-17; X. 159b9-14]

ity etāṃ suvihitahetumārgaśuddhāṃ
buddhānāṃ pravacanadharmatāṃ niśāmya[857] /
andhānāṃ vividhakudṛṣṭiceṣṭitānāṃ
tīrthyānāṃ matam apavidhya yānty anandhāḥ //

imāṃ hi nirvāṇapuraikavarttinīn
tathāgatādityavaco 'ṃśubhāsvatīṃ[858] /
nirātmatām āryasahasravāhitān
na mandacakṣur vivṛtām apīkṣate //

iti diṅmātram evedam upadiṣṭaṃ sumedhasām /
vraṇadeśoviṣasyeva[859] svasāmarthyavisarpiṇaḥ[860] //
iti /[861] [862]

---

857 (Ejima:) Pra: niśamya. Ms: *sic*. Read *"niśāmya"* as in Yaś(721, 11).
858 (Ejima:) Pra: -vacoṃ'śu-. Ms: -vacoṃśu-. Read *"-vaco 'ṃśu-"*.
859 (Ejima:) Pra: braṇa-. Read *"vraṇa-"*.
860 (Ejima:) Pra: visarpaṇa-. Read *"visarpiṇa"* as in Yaś(722, 16).
861 (Lee:) Pra: -visarpaṇa iti /. Read *"visarpiṇaḥ // iti /"*..
862 (Ejima:) "ity etāṃ..svasāmarthyavisarpiṇa(read so)" iti

Three verses are metrically a praharṣiṇi, a vaṃśastha and a śloka in turn. These are the concluding verses of the author's own. Zhēn(310c14) records one more verse just before the final one.

{%Tib 9-40}[C.97b1-3, D.95a5-6, N.109a7-109b3, P.109a4-6]

de ltar saṅs rgyas rnams kyi gsuṅ rab rigs paḥi lam//
legs par gsuṅs paḥi dag pa chos ñid ḥdi mthoṅ nas//
mu stegs loṅ ba ltas[863] ṅan sna tshogs g-yo rnams kyi//
gṣuṅ lugs spaṅs te loṅ ba ma yin rnams ḥgroḥo//

de bṣin gśegs pa ñi maḥi gsuṅ ḥod kyis//
snaṅ[864] ldan mya ṅan ḥdas groṅ lam gcig pa//
bdag med[865] ḥphags pa stoṅ gis[866] bgrod[867] pa ḥdi//
phye yaṅ dman paḥi mig gis mi mthoṅ ṅo//

de ltar ḥdi ni phyogs tsam ṣig//
raṅ gi mthu yis[868] rnam ḥphel baḥi//
dug la rma yi phyogs bṣin du//
śin tu mkhas pa rnams la bstan//

---

863 NP.ltas=lta
864 N.snaṅ=snan
865 D.med=mod
866 NP.gis=gi
867 P.bgrod=ḥgrod
868 NP.yis=yi

ABHIDHARMAKOŚABHĀṢYA OF VASUBANDHU
CHAPTER Ⅸ : ĀTMAVĀDAPRATIṢEDHA Editions
梵蔵文（阿毘達磨倶舎論Ⅸ：破我品）　〔インド学仏教学叢書　11〕

2005年8月25日　初版第1刷発行

著　者　李　鍾　徹
Jong Cheol LEE

発行者　インド学仏教学叢書
編　集　委　員　会
代表　斎藤　明
〒113-0033 東京都文京区本郷7-3-1
東京大学文学部インド哲学仏教学研究室内

発売所　山　喜　房　佛　書　林
〒113-0033 東京都文京区本郷5-25-5
電話 03-3811-5361

© The Academy of Korean Studies
ISBN4-7963-1011-8

BIBLIOTHECA INDOLOGICA ET BUDDHOLOGICA (BIB)

インド学仏教学叢書

1. Yasunori EJIMA (ed.) : Abhidharmakośabhāṣya of Vasubandhu, Chapter I : Dhātunirdeśa ¥2,000
2. 谷沢淳三 : Vākyapadīya 3-14 : Vṛttisamuddeśa 訳註研究 (1) (Junzō TANIZAWA : Vākyapadīya 3-14 : Vṛttisamuddeśa, translated into Japanese with explanatory notes (1)) ¥2,000
3. Seishi KARASHIMA : The Textual Study of the Chinese Versions of the Saddharmapuṇḍarīkasūtra in the Iight of the Sanskrit and Tibetan versions ¥6,505
4. 下田正弘 : 蔵文和訳『大乗涅槃経』(1) (Masahiro SHIMODA : An annotated Japanese translation of the Tibetan Version of the *Mahāyāna Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra* (1) ¥6,500
5. 釋　惠敏 :「声聞地」における所縁の研究 (Bhikkhu Hui-Min : A study of Meditative Objects (ālambana) in the *Çrāvakabhūmi* ¥6,500
6. 上田　昇 : チャンドラキールティ著『四百論注』第一～八章和訳 Candrakīrti's *Bodhisattvayogācāracatuḥśatakaṭīkā*, the Chapters 1-8, a Japanese Translation with Notes ¥1,500
7. 種村隆元 : KRIYĀSAṂGRAHA of KULADATTA CHAPTER Ⅶ ¥1,500
8. Jong Cheol LEE (李鐘徹) : The Tibetan Text of the *Vyākhyāyukti* of Vasubanbhu critically edited from the Cone, Derge, Narthang and Peking Editions ¥7,000
9. 李鐘徹 (Lee, Jong Cheol) : 世親思想の研究—『釈軌論』を中心として— A Study of Vasubandhu - With special reference to the *Vyākhyāyukti* - ¥7,000
10. 沈　仁慈 (Sim, In ja) : 慈雲の正法思想 - Jiun's Concept of the *True Dharma*- ¥6,500

Available through
The Sankibo Press
5-28-5 Hongo, Bunkyo-ku, Tokyo 113 Japan
(TEL) 03-3811-5361

発売所 :
113　東京都文京区本郷5-28-5
山喜房佛書林
(TEL) 03-3811-5361